



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

WORK SESSION - 2:00 P.M.

The Columbia City Council held a Work Session on Tuesday, November 25, 2019 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina 29201. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 2:05 p.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Howard E. Duvall, Jr., The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr., and The Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann. The Honorable Moe Baddourah arrived at 3:07 p.m. and The Honorable Mayor Pro-Tempore Tameika Isaac Devine was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the invocation.

DISCUSSION OF COMMERCIAL CORRIDOR REDEVELOPMENT PROGRAM ACTION ITEMS

1. Parking Improvements - Ms. Missy Gentry, P. E., Assistant City Manager and Ms. Elle Matney, Director of Parking Services

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said this is the continuation of a discussion we been having regarding the implementation of a commercial corridor redevelopment program. The staff has been working on several action items in that regard. We want to start with the parking side of things. This program is a pilot to be started in the Five Points corridor. A lot of what we say today can be potentially implemented citywide.

Ms. Elle Matney, Director of Parking Services said let's take a look forward with smart devices for smart cities. Smart meters accept multiple forms of payment with dynamic pricing. They generally come in two sizes: the larger ones can maintain a service box for up to 25 spaces and the smaller ones can maintain up to 12 spaces. Passport Parking was implemented three years ago and we have crossed over one million transactions with Passport Parking. We were recently selected as one of 14 test markets with Google Maps. Vehicle detection sensors is on the horizon. They can be placed in the ground or surface mounted. There are multiple apps that you can pull up on your mobile device or many newer vehicles' navigation systems will tell you where there is available parking based on these sensors. Some existing opportunities include available on-street and facilities parking, parking rates, on-street demand pricing, the infraction citation fee structure, and enforcement.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

We have issues with local staff parking in short-term metered spaces during evenings, nights, and weekends. USC Hub students and hotel guests are parking on Main Street instead of using the parking facilities.

Councilor McDowell sought clarification of the infraction citations.

Ms. Elle Matney, Director of Parking Services said the average expired meter citation is eight dollars versus what other cities are imposing. We are also working on curb management. We have lots of hospitality inquiries and an overall need for taxis, Uber, and Lyft. We hope to continue marketing short-term versus long-term parking on social media. We are finalizing deck facility maps with promotional parking incentives. Parking services along with city management recommend extended parking enforcement hours, Monday through Saturday from 9:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m. citywide. Fee structures can be determined by the space itself or we can maintain the pricing by time of day. We have the availability to control that with this technology.

Mayor Benjamin asked can you help me understand the extended hours of enforcement from 9:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m. Will it help move cars or what is the practical effect of that?

Ms. Elle Matney, Director of Parking Services said yes it does. It turns those spaces in the evening and weekend hours. For example, I can pull up to a meter and feed it at 5:00 p.m. for an hour, because I am working the night shift. They know we are not going to enforce after 6:00 p.m. so that vehicle is there for the rest of the evening. We receive complaints from local businesses that no one has a place to park along Main Street. By extending enforcement until 9:00 p.m., we will turn those spaces.

Councilor McDowell said there have been concerns from some folks that their meters run out when they are in long lines at the County's building and they are ticketed. Has there been any talk about parking around that building?

Ms. Elle Matney, Director of Parking Services said not at this time, but we can certainly visit that. Maybe some of those meters need to be extended for more than two hours. Another one of the initiatives we are talking about is the fee structure, whether by space or a block time of day. In other cities, they have a flat rate in the parking facilities. If you are in after 6 p.m. and out before 6 a.m., it can be six dollars flat to entice those long-term parkers.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

Councilor Rickenmann said if you are in Five Points before 11:00 a.m. there are no parking issues but from 11:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. it creates more need. Looking at time of day and blocks of time can make more sense along with having higher rates to encourage turn over. Especially since we have different parking options that aren't being utilized.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said for the Thanksgiving Holiday we will not have enforcement citywide. Traditionally, that's what we tried to do in the past couple of years to encourage shopping. In Five Points, we are hearing that they want enforcement. We have to make the decision to be consistent citywide.

Ms. Elle Matney, Director of Parking Services said from both ends of that spectrum they were upset that we did and they were upset that we didn't.

Councilor Rickenmann asked if it is possible for us to utilize 2221 Devine Street to encourage the folks who are working that weekend to use those spaces?

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said that is what we would like to do ultimately. We can try it.

Councilor Rickenmann said I don't know if the Convention Center has events that weekend but that parking lot needs to be utilized for shopping in the Vista or during the holiday weekend.

Mayor Benjamin asked if the merchants are asking for enforcement?

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said some are. We asked for a hard line from the merchant's association. We have not gotten a clear response. Everyone else is good with no enforcement.

Mayor Benjamin said I think we should enforce, but I don't want to do that without a consensus.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said my recommendation is that we be consistent citywide. We don't enforce if that is what we have been doing and it has been well received everywhere across the city. We will strongly promote 2221 Devine Street for Five Points parking.

Ms. Elle Matney, Director of Parking Services presented a few examples of what other cities are citing for expired meters. Here in Columbia we are at \$8, Savannah is \$20, Knoxville is \$11, Charleston is up to \$30, and Portland is at \$44. Their enforcement hours vary. They have innovative technology broken down by zones or times of day. In regards to Five Points, we have been talking and partnering with various groups for a few weeks. Some of the recommendations and solutions include an update of construction plans in compliance to prepare for rebidding at



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

the end of the calendar year. We are finalizing the plan for construction in late spring 2020. We recommend that the extension of enforcement hours to generate the need for turnover as presented, is implemented citywide and not only for Five Points. For the Dynamic Pricing Model, we are currently in review of various vendors, equipment, and products that integrate with our current systems for parking. We are continuing to partner with area businesses to promote availability in remote areas in Five Points.

Councilor Davis said we definitely have to, because employers that allow employees to take the special parking impact their businesses also and I don't know if they understand that.

Ms. Elle Matney, Director of Parking Services said you cannot refeed the meter so I think they will get the message and further the discussion of other options like Devine Street. We do offer hospitality parking for our service industry businesses throughout the downtown area. We are also continuing to develop a plan to enhance the walkability between Five Points and 2221 Devine.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said Five Points has asked for the extended enforcement. Do we go citywide as Elle is recommending or pilot it and start only with Five Points?

Mayor Benjamin said let's pilot it and see how it goes. With everything that we do new let's see what merchants think beforehand and afterwards to get more guidance on what they want. Execute in Five Points only, with the intention that if it works well we can go everywhere. It's going to be a paradigm shift in the way we park so let's just see if we can get some type of useful data including opinions about the process, before and after.

Ms. Krista Hampton, Director of Planning and Development Services said currently in the Five Points overlay all uses have a 20% reduction for parking. If you are a use that has a demand of 3.5 spaces per 1,000 square feet of area or less in existing buildings, you don't have to provide parking other than what is there. That includes office uses and retail. It was intended to encourage businesses to locate in existing buildings. We have two considerations for amendments: one is based on the conversations we have heard from Five Points, which was to extend that exception for providing parking in existing buildings to uses with the demand of 5 spaces per 1,000 square feet or less. That would extend it to uses such as yoga studios and doctors' offices and it would not extend that exception to restaurants or bars. The other option is to eliminate parking requirements and bring it down to zero. You can do this for existing buildings or new construction.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

Councilor Rickenmann asked if the Sheraton Hotel on Main Street is not required to have parking.

Ms. Krista Hampton, Director of Planning and Development Services said correct and that is not because of the exemption but because of the C-5. The C-5 zoning district which takes up most of your central business district has no parking requirements. In the new code we are extending the elimination of parking requirements to a greater swath of the central business district. Sometimes, we are concerned about eliminating parking requirements in areas adjacent to residential districts. We aren't here, because all of the districts generally have residential parking permits. Either of these will require a text amendment that is fairly easy to draft and bring to the Planning Commission or City Council, whatever the direction is.

Mayor Benjamin said I am fine with both of them and the amendments. I was being sensitive to any impact we might have on residential neighborhoods.

Ms. Krista Hampton, Director of Planning and Development Services said if we do 4,000 square feet and below that will except all parking requirements. If we decide above 4,000 square feet that will maintain the status quo with the 20% reduction that we currently have in this area.

2. Commercial Retention and Redevelopment (CRR) Program Updates and Recommendations - Ms. Melissa L. Lindler, Office of Business Opportunities Director

– CRR Vacant Building Incentive Program

Ms. Melissa L. Lindler, Office of Business Opportunities Director said in the Five Points plan they reference the request for greater access into the façade program, which we now call the Commercial Retention and Redevelopment (CRR) Program. When we met a couple of months ago, we talked about the recommendation to expand the CRR Program into our current pilot program. Mayor Pro-tem Devine asked about the historical areas and where we have been previously. Since 1997, we have done 118 façade projects throughout the city for a total of \$1.7 million. The money that was allocated for this year has not been spent.

Ms. Gerry Lynn Hall, Office of Business Opportunities Program Compliance Specialist said OBO loans were done between 1997 to 2000. It was not targeted but we saw a focus on Main and North Main, with a small percentage being citywide. For the Neighborhood Business Improvement Zone installed by the SC Development Corporation, we did Five Points and the Rosewood/Owens Field areas. We did the Business Improvement District in 2010. After that, we did two phases to cover Main and North Main, from Elmwood Avenue to I-20. We did two



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

phases for Two Notch Road. We recently did Farrow Road and West Beltline. We are currently doing portions of Harden Street, Gervais Street, Taylor Street, Millwood, and North Millwood.

Ms. Melissa L. Lindler, Office of Business Opportunities Director said we have been in every district so far. The seven projects we have awarded this fiscal year and last fiscal year are Andrews Auto Service, Tripp's Fine Cleaners, Carolyn's Flowers, Montgomery Creative Styles, Star Beauty Supply, Grilled Teriyaki, and 813 Harden Street, LLC. The following pending projects are currently out for bid: Morgan Realty, Free Times, House of Styles, and Mary's Beauty Salon. We did have two other projects that were pending but those owners or tenants no longer want to participate. We have available funding to do two additional projects. There is some correlation between the side streets and where our code violations are. If we were to stay in this area, we can probably address those other commercial code violations. The recommendation for next fiscal year is that we stay where we are because that is where the pilot project is and we can expand it to the side areas that we weren't able to address with our initial funding. The other part is the increase in allocation for CRR funding by \$10,000 as an incentive to encourage the recruitment of new businesses, either locating or relocating to the vacant and abandoned buildings in the targeted area. This will actually increase the per award cap to \$35,000 for abandoned and vacant buildings from \$25,000 and we will request additional funding for our traditional CRR Program and for the vacant and abandoned buildings pilot. The incentive can also be used for the purchase of inventory, furniture, and equipment required to operate the business. In order to be eligible for the Vacant/Abandoned Building Incentive Loan they would have to apply and be approved for both the Facade and Commercial Improvement Loans. Facade is the only one that requires a match unless Council wants to change that. We will interact more with code enforcement when it comes to the commercial code violations. We can utilize those tools to help make sure we are meeting the greatest needs in this area. Another component that will help the CRR Program is the FOG Program.

- *Fats, Oils, and Grease (FOG) Forgivable Loan Program*

Mr. Frank Eskridge, Deputy Director of Utilities said at the September workshop Council expressed the desire to find innovative ways to help restaurant owners and property owners, who might convert their property to restaurants, with ways to meet the city's existing fat, oils, and grease (FOG) requirements. Every restaurant must have a way to pull that out of the wastewater stream so that it doesn't cause problems in our sanitary sewer system. We have been working on the idea of having a FOG forgivable loan program that will be administered through the Office of Business Opportunities Retention and Redevelopment Program. The technical review and construction inspection that normally goes with a grease trap installation or a grease interceptor installation will still be done by the water compliance section of Columbia Water. The idea is to



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

make up to \$5,000 available per applicant with 50/50 matching funds towards the cost of labor, equipment, and materials for the installation of grease traps or interceptors. This will apply inside the city, not system wide. The forgiveness requirement will be such that the applicant has to be in business and compliant with the requirements that we have for two years and at that point the loan is forgiven. This will be funded from Columbia Water revenues. If Council would like for this to proceed, we are ready to begin on January 1st.

Councilor Duvall asked if these are City, DHEC, or EPA requirements.

Mr. Frank Eskridge, Deputy Director of Utilities said we have a city ordinance. The federal government liked our ordinance so much that they incorporated it into our Consent Decree. The state also requires that this be addressed.

Councilor Duvall asked if most utilities in South Carolina have a FOG program.

Mr. Frank Eskridge, Deputy Director of Utilities said absolutely, it is a nationwide situation.

Councilor Rickenmann said not everybody needs to put in a tank. I think that is one of the things we haven't had a clear delineation on in the past. I was curious about the average cost, because \$5,000 is probably 10% of the total cost. The reality of what we are talking about it massive. I think we have to look at this more in-depth. We can look at different ways to create a balance if we want to encourage growth, especially in troubled areas.

Mr. Frank Eskridge, Deputy Director of Utilities said staff is already working with applicants to find creative solutions. There was an interest in combining grease traps. It is not going to go that far before it clogs the line. Grease traps have to be close to what they are serving.

Councilor Rickenmann said we put a lot of strain on a small business person to do that but the biggest abuser of the system is the home owner and we have no requirements on them for anything.

Mr. Frank Eskridge, Deputy Director of Utilities said we encourage them to can it, cool it, and trash it.

Councilor Davis said my experience with small business owners has been those that are looking to occupy an existing building with a system that we approved in the past. The challenge to upgrade to the requirements that we place on them has not been financially practical, especially when we look at the areas where we want to see new business come in. I am hoping that we



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

make some allowances for financial assistance and be flexible in the requirements that we place on them. I have seen some systems that were in place and it makes you wonder how they were approved in the first place. If we approved it for the previous business under our rules, why would we change for a new business coming in to the same facility?

Mr. Frank Eskridge, Deputy Director of Utilities said the FOG program dates back to 2008. I'm not sure how it was handled back then. To your point Councilman Rickenmann, it may cost up to \$2,000 if you are putting devices under kitchen sinks. If you have to go outside the building, you are probably up to \$15,000. The price can vary widely but we felt like this was a good start. If we get started in January, we can come back to you with some experience, successful stories, the level of interest, and the effectiveness of this amount.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said with that overarching premise of looking at each situation and having some flexibility, we would recommend starting with \$5,000 per applicant.

CITY COUNCIL DISCUSSION

3. Economic Development Partners Update - Mr. Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development

Mr. Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development said there is another line item for the Insurance Technology Services Clusters of SC that has been formally a part of EngenuitySC. We added a line item in the amount of \$10,000 for your consideration. These are all consistent with what we have discussed. Our partner agencies assist with business recruitment, trip scheduling, entrepreneurship, small business development initiatives, retention and expansion of existing businesses, marketing, and some assistance with talent retention. The overall special projects funding for 2019/2020 is \$382,000. Of that, \$204,500 is allocated to annual recurring funding of ED partner agencies. The partners are Central SC Alliance, EngenuitySC, Columbia Technology Incubator, IT-oLogy, and the Columbia World Affairs Council. The City Center Partnership receives an allocation in lieu of taxes. As the City does not pay taxes, they determined that \$70,000 was the fair market value of what the City would contribute to the City Center Partnership. There is the Mast General interest and the Greater Columbia Chamber of Commerce is funded for BRAC and military initiatives.

Councilor McDowell said is the \$70,000 part of the Hospitality Tax?



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

Mr. Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development said that part is not. You can see the breakout of the current recommendations for the partner agency funding. We have reduced Central SC, EngenuitySC, and the Columbia World Affairs Council. Greg Hilton and his group GrowCo have started their new concept down in the Vista. They requested \$37,000 for a period of three years. There's \$10,000 for Midlands Technical College. Some of the remaining funding can be used for Economic Development grants.

Councilor Rickenmann said we requested a memo. What have we gotten in the past five years from each one of those agencies? Instead of just looking at reducing the amount, part of it was to legitimize giving them any money. What were the deliverables and did they deliver the deliverables? How should that be tied into funding?

Ms. Kay Hampton, Deputy Director of Economic Development said we came up with some of these line items by looking at the past year and what they said they were going to do with the funding.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we have talked about the benchmarks being a challenge to meet and the deliverables going forward. I was hoping they would take a historical look but be very deliberate and specific with these entities about the things they can do to assist us right now.

Councilor Rickenmann said I am hearing that you have given them a narrow scope that is measurable so when we get to budget time next year, we will know if they can deliver or not.

Mr. Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development said the scopes are very specific and tangible things focused on output and outcomes. We have gotten away from the usage of funding for overhead. We are providing an itemized professional services contract. We say here are the things that feed into our strategic plan and here are specific things you can do to contribute to that.

Mayor Benjamin asked if we are producing a document, video, or some type of marketing materials that we can start putting out by a certain date.

Mr. Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development said we will be working internally on a couple of things this year and we have the opportunity to do some of that in conjunction with these partners. Did you want to do it around something industry specific, talent retention and attraction, or just the city in general?



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

Mayor Benjamin said all of the above, but city focused. There is so much good content out now but we need to be pulling all things together of our purposes. Having a hard target date to have something produced by is important. I am concerned about reducing the Central SC Alliance as well as Engenuity. I support the GrowCo and I have been an advocate of Midlands Tech and hardening that relationship. I have been an advocate in the past of increasing the Central SC Alliance funding, while understanding the role they play in regional economic development and how central our positioning is in there, whether or not that investment lands in the four corners of Columbia. But certainly our folks don't all live, work, and play in Columbia. Now, we have been clear about our expectations and there have been challenges in meeting those expectations. I served on Engenuity's board since the organization was founded. I do believe that the work Engenuity is doing is important. I would encourage more of us to serve in a number of different capacities on these different boards so it's not just me or Ms. Devine bringing back the good news. I do want to make sure the Chamber's funding is held harmless and still the same.

Mr. Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development said the Chamber is funded out of the general fund. We still manage that contract. The standard membership for Central SC is \$72,000 a year. We went back to them and said we were looking for something that is very specific to the city and tailored around deliverables. Mike did indicate that if there was a change, he will have to go back to the Central SC Board and we may not be a standard member with the Alliance anymore. That is something we have to consider and be comfortable with. I think we still want to participate in these partnerships. We have been very clear with everybody that we need these things that are very specific to the city and will produce these outcomes over the next year.

Councilor Davis said I don't have any heartburn about Engenuity or the Enterprise Campus at Midlands Tech. I been talking about the relationship that campus can play in a city. That campus has the ability to recruit businesses that provide jobs in that area.

Mr. Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development said we coordinated with the Enterprise Campus on a \$180,000 rural infrastructure grant that is helping provide some of the wastewater infrastructure at the backside of the campus. I think that is a real tangible thing and they brought value to the table in that aspect. We are looking for things along those lines. Things that are concrete and we can point back to.

Councilor Baddourah said I thought we talked about creating a culinary school at Midlands Tech. I think the city is interested in this because it generates more students and jobs. Is that a discussion we have had with Midlands Tech?



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

Mr. Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development said we have not discussed that lately. If you want to request that, we will be glad to have a discussion about it.

4. Kilbourne Road Traffic Calming Measures - The Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann

Councilor Rickenmann said I think we discussed that we were going to look into Kilbourne Road and add it to the list of streets we were looking to take over and maintain from the state. I wanted to bring it back up to talk about it and speak on traffic calming. It was very interesting to see what they have done to downtown Decatur, Georgia. In some on their high speed corridors they took the four lanes and put into two lanes. They took the parking row and moved out one. They took that parking row and added an extra strip of sidewalk. They added a thin bed with grass to encourage the merchants to utilize the space. They also have separate sidewalks to keep things moving without having to tear everything down. The traffic slows down and the volume is still the same. When we talk about Harden Street, Devine Street, and Millwood areas, we don't have to eliminate parking. Cut it down into two lanes and still handle the volume that is coming but make it more safe for walkability. I thought it was interesting and they said it was not that expensive.

Councilor Baddourah said there has there been discussion with SCDOT about redesigning Harden, Devine, and Millwood.

Mr. Robert Anderson, Director of Public Works said we have not. It is still under consideration and they are still doing the study. I am sure we will get a full report when it comes up. Currently, DOT owns 69% of the streets and the city owns 30%. There is 1% that are private. We have 400 lane miles of city streets, sidewalks, and storm drainage to include signage and signalization. We did an in-house pavement study in 2011. Our current rating was around 78, which is preventive maintenance. Our program has the ability to run itself forward. We currently have a rating of 65-67 and that is because we are not doing a lot of maintenance in our streets. If we add something else to it then we need to make sure, we can maintain it. We have a 67 condition pavement rating, which is fair. We need to look at the 30% of city roads that we currently have and take some kind of action on them.

We talked last time about opportunities. Currently there is no funding in our general fund. We do use that funding as leverage funding. We have a couple of CTC projects that are going on right now. One of them is in the Chestnut Hills Subdivision where we just did a major rebuild and the other one is Germany Street. That road is being deeded over to the city based on its condition. The only reason we are taking that is because we have funding from them. In the past, we have also received funding from CDBG and we try to do public/private partnerships.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

Kilbourne Road according to DOT is a major collector. We've had neighborhood meetings and tried to act on what those concerns were. One of them is speed humps. DOT has said no to speed humps based on the traffic volume that comes down Kilbourne Road. DOT has also not been a proponent of three-ways stop, because they generally don't work. Nobody slows down or stops for a three-way stop. We setup speed radar signs. I believe DOT paid for the signs and we installed them. They flash to show you how fast you are moving. The Police Department sent their speed trailer down there several times and they have done enforcement down there. That is currently what has been done on Kilbourne Road.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to enter into Executive Session at 3:45 p.m. for the discussion of **Items 5** through **9**, subject to removing Taboo from **Item 5**; adding the Save-A-Lot Proposal to **Item 6**; deferring the discussion of 2221 Devine Street as part of **Item 7**; and deferring the discussion of **Item 10**.

5. Receipt of legal advice relating to a pending, threatened or potential claim – S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)

*Allen Benedict Court
Automated Metering Infrastructure - Meter Installations
Taboo*

6. Receipt of legal advice related to matters covered by attorney-client privilege pursuant to §30-4-70(a)(2)

*125 Peyton Road
Sewer Expansion Fee
Columbia Urban League
External Funding Requests
Hospitality Tax Funding
Revenue Options
Legal Update 2019*

7. Discussion of negotiations incident to proposed contractual arrangements pursuant to S. C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)

*Finlay Park
Park Street Improvements
2221 Devine Street*



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
8. Discussion of matters relating to proposed location or expansion of services to encourage location or expansion of industries or other businesses pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)

*Project Blue
Ballpark, LLC
Profitt Dixon
Kline*

9. Discussion of appointment of a person to a public body pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(1)

Parks and Recreation Foundation

10. Discussion of the employment of an employee pursuant to §30-4-70(a)(1)

*Development Corporations
City Manager and City Attorney Evaluations*

Council Recessed at 5:00 p.m.

COUNCIL MEETING - 6:00 P.M.

The Columbia City Council conducted a meeting on Tuesday, November 25, 2019 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina 29201. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 6:08 p.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Mayor Pro-Tempore Tameika Isaac Devine, The Honorable Moe Baddourah, The Honorable Howard E. Duvall, Jr., The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr., and The Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann. Also present were Mr. Jeffery Palen, Assistant City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Boy Scout Troop 10 of East Minister Presbyterian Church will lead the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the invocation.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to approve the adoption of the agenda.

PUBLIC INPUT RELATED TO ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

No one appeared at this time.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

11. Approval of Minutes

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the October 1, 2019, October 15, 2019, November 18, 2019, and November 19, 2019 City Council Meeting Minutes.

CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS 12 THROUGH 35

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to approve the **Consent Agenda Items 12 through 35**.

12. Council is asked to approve a 5-Year (2020-2025) Consolidated Plan and Analysis to Impediments of Fair Housing Choice Contract, as requested by the Community Development Department. Award to Civitas, LLC in the amount of \$58,050. This firm is located in Mount Pleasant, SC. - *Approved*

Funding Source: Split equally between the City's Federal Grants (CDBG/HOME/HOPWA/CDBG-DR), \$14,512.50 per grant. The original budget amount is \$58,050.

13. Council is asked to approve a Contract Extension for the acquisition, implementation, and annual maintenance of EnerGov software used for permitting and land management, as requested by the Planning & Development Services Department. Award to Tyler Technologies, Inc. in the amount of \$55,515.00. This vendor is located in Dallas, TX. - *Approved*

Funding Source: Development Services - Professional Services (1014101-636600). The original budget amount is \$56,000.00.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
14. Council is asked to approve a Hardware, Maintenance and Service Contract, as requested by the Information Technology Services Department. Award to the Hewlett Packard Enterprise Company, using SC State Contract #4400011431 in the amount of \$64,039.25. This vendor is located in Roseville, CA. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Information Technology - Maintenance and Service Contract (1011120-638200). The original budget amount is \$64,039.25.

15. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of Three (3) Rimage 6000N DVD Auto Burners, as requested by the Columbia Police Department. Award to Coban Technologies, Inc., as a Sole Source, in the amount of \$64,200.60. This vendor is located in Houston, TX. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Police Administrative Services-Machinery & Equip. Capital (1012402-658300). The original budget amount is \$65,000.00.

16. Council is asked to approve a Contract for a Column Repair Project at Police Headquarters, as requested by Support Services. Award to Tyler Construction Group, Inc. in an amount not to exceed \$60,217.00. This firm is a certified Local Business Enterprise (LBE) located in Columbia, SC. – *Approved*

Funding Source: General Support Services 1011201-638100. The original budget amount is \$60,217.00.

The following subcontractors/vendors will be supplying additional services/materials:

Goldie Construction, LLC of Columbia, SC will be providing installation and painting of the column at 35.6% (\$21,000.00) of the total contract value.

Worthington Millwork of Panama City, FL will be providing the column at 13.4% (\$7,913.00) of the total contract value.

Florence Concrete Products of Florence, SC will be providing the concrete base at 11.9% (\$7,000.00) of the total contract value.

17. Council is asked to approve a Professional Services Agreement for Pest Control and Termite Services, as requested by Support Services. Award to All Phase Termite & Pest Control Services in the amount of \$104,650.00. This vendor is located in Fort Lawn, SC. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Support Services Public Building - Maintenance and Service Contract (5511219-638200). The original budget amount for year one (1) is \$104,650.00.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
18. Council is asked to approve the replacement of the Gym Floor at Pinehurst Park, as requested by the Parks and Recreation Department. Award to Sport Court Carolina, Inc., using the Sourcewell Cooperative Contract in the amount of \$83,680.29. This vendor is located in Clover, SC. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Parks-Buildings and Grounds/Rec Physical Fitness Equipment- Cap (1015104-658900). The original budget amount is \$90,000.00.

19. Council is asked to approve an Agreement for Owens Field Park Pump Track Project, as requested by the Parks and Recreation Department. Award to American Ramp Company in the amount of \$95,898.00. This firm is located in Joplin, MO. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Owens Field Park Pump Track (4039999-PK006704-658650). The original budget amount is \$95,900.00.

20. Council is asked to approve Contract Amendment #4 for Project WM4374; Engineering Services for the Repair of Columbia Canal Head Gates to extend the term of the Agreement from three (3) years to five (5) years, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Kleinschmidt Associates. This firm is located in Lexington, SC. All other provisions of the Agreement, except as modified herein, remain in full force and effect. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Flood Recovery Project DR4241 Columbia Canal Head Gates Design Repair Services (2532201-WM4374-638400). The original budgeted amount was \$957,112.00 and will not change with this amendment.

Kleinschmidt is the prime contractor and will provide design repair services for the Columbia Canal Head Gates at 78.1% (\$747,981.41) of the total contract value.

The following sub-consultants will provide additional services:

Chao and Associates, a MBE firm located in Columbia, SC will provide structural evaluation and field structure as-built services at 26.3% (\$109,842.59) of the total contract value for Phases 1 and 2.

F&ME, located in Columbia, SC will provide subsurface investigation services at 9.1% (\$37,800.00) of the total contract value for Phases 1 and 2.

D&J Machinery & Rigging, LLC located in Lexington, SC will provide Head Gate clean out and inspection services at 10.1% (\$42,288.00) of the total contract value for Phases 1 and 2.

Standard Diving & Marine Contracting, LLC located in Mt. Pleasant, SC, will provide underwater condition assessment services at 4.6% (\$19,200.00) of the total contract value for Phases 1 and 2.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
21. Council is asked to approve Contract Amendment #3 for Project WM4348; Columbia Canal Embankment Repair Services to extend the term of the agreement for Michael Baker International from three (3) years to five (5) years, as requested by Columbia Water. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. All other provisions of the Agreement, except as modified herein, remain in full force and effect. – *Approved*

Funding Source: DR421 Columbia Canal Embankment Repair Services (WM4348-638400) and 5529999-WM4323-658650. The original budgeted amount was \$4,938,139.00 and will not change with this Amendment.

Michael Baker International is the prime and will provide Columbia canal embankment enterprise services at 53.2% (\$2,626,543.42) of the contract value. The contract value does not change with this amendment.

The following sub-consultants will provide additional services:

Hazen and Sawyer, located in Columbia, SC will provide water supply/H&H modeling; spillway/dike repair design; construction contract administration; environmental science/natural resources at 13.3% (\$655,544.00) of the total contract value.

Kleinschmidt Associates, located in Lexington, SC, will provide FERC coordination locks; gates design; and construction contract administration at 8.5% (\$419,378.00) of the total contract value.

F&ME Consultants, Inc., located in Columbia, SC, will provide geotechnical design services at 21.2% (\$1,046,089.50) of the total contract value.

CASE Consulting, Inc., (DBE) located in West Columbia, SC, will provide construction administration support services at 0.8% (\$37,564.00) of the total contract value.

Construction Support Services, located in Hopkins, SC, will provide land surveying services at 0.6% (\$32,000.00) of the total contract value.

MA Engineering Consultants, located in Carey, NC, will provide geospatial/GIS/photogrammetry services at 1.3% (\$64,817.16) of the total contract value.

ESP Associates, located in Tampa, FL, will provide hydrographic survey services at 0.8% (\$38,500.00) of the total contract value.

New South Engineering, located in Columbia, SC, will provide historic context for National Register research at 0.4% (\$17,702.92) of the total contract value.



We Are Columbia

**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
22. Council is asked to approve Water Quality Consulting Services for the Columbia Canal Water Treatment Plant and the Lake Murray Water Treatment Plant for Fiscal Year 2019-2020, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Black & Veatch Corporation, as a Sole Source, in an amount not to exceed \$75,000.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Utility Columbia Canal Water Treatment Plant (5516206-636700). The original budgeted amount is \$75,000.00.

23. Council is asked to approve a Contract for Project WM4481; 2"/4" PVC/DIP Water Main Upgrades along Eastpine Court and Eastpine Place, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to North American Pipeline Management, Inc. in an amount not to exceed \$110,416.80, which includes contingency. This firm is located in Marietta, GA. – *Approved*

Funding Source: 5529999-WM4481-658650. The original budget amount is \$115,000.00.

This is a Mentor Protégé Program project. North American Pipeline Management, Inc. of Marietta, GA is the mentor and will be performing pipe work, trucking and restoration services at 79% (\$72,692.00) of the total contract value. Southern Roots Landscape Management Inc., a Local Business Enterprise (LBE) of Columbia, SC, is the protégé and will be performing water line construction at 21% (\$19,322.00) of the total contract value.

24. Council is asked to approve Ductile Iron Insertion Valve Equipment and Training for Water Distribution Field Personnel, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Team Industrial Services Inc., as a Sole Source, in an amount not to exceed \$140,100.00. This firm is located in Sugar Land, TX. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Utilities Water Distribution & Maintenance - Machinery & Equipment - Capital (5516203-658300). The original budget amount is \$140,100.00.

25. Council is asked to approve Contract Amendment #2 for Project SS7306; Wastewater Collection Flow Monitoring Services, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Woolpert, Inc. in the amount of \$157,419.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. – *Approved*

Funding Source: 5511706-638305. The original budget amount is \$250,000.00.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

-
26. Council is asked to approve an Agreement for Project SS7382; Design of the Wastewater Compliance and Lift Station Maintenance Facility, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Goodwyn Mills & Cawood, Inc. in the amount of \$330,000.00. This firm has a local office in Columbia, SC. – *Approved*

Funding Source: 5529999-SS738202-658650. The original budget amount is \$330,000.00.

This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project. Goodwyn Mills & Cawood, Inc., is the prime and will provide a narrative, preliminary site plan, boring locations, and specific project needs at 60.3% (\$199,000.00) of the contract value. There was a 10% CDBE goal placed on this project. The goal was met at 22.5%.

The following sub-consultants will provide additional services:

Chao & Associates, a Columbia Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (CDBE) of Columbia, SC will provide floodplain mitigation engineering and structural engineering at 16.7% (\$55,000.00) of the contract value.

Swgert & Associates, of Cayce, SC will provide mechanical engineering at 5.6% (\$18,500.00) of the contract value.

Belka Engineering Associates, of Columbia, SC will provide electrical engineering at 9.1% (\$30,000) of the contract value.

Rebecca M. Looney & Associates, a Columbia Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (CDBE) of Ballentine, SC will provide landscape architecture at 5.8% (\$19,000.00) of the contract value.

Matthiessen Cost Consultants, LLC, of Columbia, SC will provide cost estimating at 2.6% (\$8,500.00) of the contract value.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
27. Council is asked to approve a contract for Project WM3906; Water Main Construction along Sylvan Drive and Satchel Ford Road, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Stutts & Williams, LLC in an amount not to exceed \$1,707,460.43, which includes contingency. This firm is located in Lexington, SC. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Water and Sewer Capital Project Cost (5529999-WM3906-658650). The original budget is \$1,890,618.40.

This is a Mentor Protégé Program project. Stutts & Williams, LLC, a Local Business Enterprise and a Small Business Enterprise, is the Mentor and will be performing water line installation services at 40% (\$603,020.00) of the total contract value. Hammerhead Utilities, LLC is the Protégé and will be performing water line installation services at 20% (\$300,755.00) of the total contract value.

The following subcontractors/suppliers will be providing additional services/supplies on this contract:

Ferguson Waterworks of Elgin, SC will be providing materials for water line construction at 33% (\$500,000.00) of the total contract value.

Knight's Companies of Summerville, SC will be providing flowable fill and concrete at 7% (\$100,000.00) of the total contract value.

28. Council is asked to approve a Contract for Projects WM4403 and WM4404; Water Main Upgrades for Hollywood – Rose Hill Subdivision, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Carolina Tap & Bore, Inc. in an amount not to exceed \$2,589,785.00, which includes contingency. This firm is located in West Columbia, SC. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Water-Sewer Capital Project Cost (5529999-WM4403-WM4404-658650). The original budget amount for WM4403 was \$1,261,597.70 and the original budget amount for WM4404 was \$1,563,000.00. The total original budget amount is \$2,824,597.70.

This is a Mentor Protégé Program project. Carolina Tap & Bore, Inc. is the Mentor and will be performing water line installation services at 58% (\$1,354,350.00) of the total contract value. Carolina Tap & Bore, Inc. is a Local Business Enterprise. LG Utilities is the Protégé and will be performing water line installation services at 21% (\$500,000.00) of the total contract value. LG Utilities is a Local Business Enterprise and a Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (Woman) located in Columbia, SC.

The following subcontractor/supplier will be providing additional services/materials:

Fortiline Waterworks of Lexington, SC will be providing materials at 21% (\$500,000.00) of the total contract value.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
29. Council is asked to approve Change Order One for the Purchase of Polymer for the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Polydyne, Inc. in the amount of \$100,000.00. This firm is located in Riceboro, GA. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Utilities Metro Wastewater Plt - Chemicals; (5516208-624800). The original budget amount is \$219,780.00.

30. Council is asked to approve the purchase of Purate Chemical for the Lake Murray Water Treatment Plant, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Water Solutions, as a Sole Source, in the amount of \$217,282.50. This vendor is located in West Haven, Connecticut. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Utilities Lake Murray Water Plt-Chemicals (5516207-624800). The original budget amount is \$217,282.50.

31. Council is asked to approve the purchase of Magnesium Hydroxide for the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Premier Magnesia, LLC., as a Sole Source, in the amount of \$849,204.00. This vendor is located in Wayne, PA. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Utilities Metro Wastewater Plt - Chemicals (5516208-624800). The original budget amount is \$751,872.00. The remainder of the purchase amount is \$97,332.00 and will come from Utilities Metro Wastewater Plt-Chemicals (5516208-624800).



We Are Columbia

**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

32. Council is asked to approve the purchase of Water and Wastewater Chemicals for the Columbia Canal Water Treatment Plant, Lake Murray Water Treatment Plant, and Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant, as requested by the Columbia Water. Award to various vendors in the amount of \$ 5,190,101.00. – *Approved*

Funding Source: Utilities Columbia Canal WTP-Chemicals (5516206-624800); Utilities Lake Murray WTP-Chemicals (5516207-624800); Utilities Metro Wastewater Plt - Chemicals (5516208-624800). The original budget amount is \$5,699,345.00.

Columbia Canal Water Treatment Plant				
Vendor/Location	Description	Estimated Usage	Unit Price	Amount To Be Awarded
Cabot Purification Marshall, TX	Activated Carbon (Powdered)	200 Tons	\$1,600.00	\$320,000.00
JCI Jones Chemicals Sarasota, FL	Chlorine	341 Tons	\$519.00	\$176,979.00
Univar USA Inc. Downers Grove, IL	Fluoride/Fluorosilicic Acid/Liquid	190 Tons	\$360.00	\$68,400.00
Tanner Industries, Inc. Southampton, PA	Anhydrous Ammonia	60 Tons	\$1,440.00	\$86,400.00
Chemtrade Chemicals US, LLC Parsippany, NJ	Aluminum Sulfate	1,461 Tons	\$299.00	\$436,839.00
Univar USA Inc. Downers Grove, IL	Sodium Hydroxide/Caustic	250 Tons	\$474.00	\$118,500.00
Polytec, Inc. Mooresville, NC	Liquid Lime (Calcium Hydroxide)	530 Tons	\$320.00	\$169,600.00
International Dioxide North Kingstown, RI	Sodium Chlorite	375 Tons	\$1,065.00	\$399,375.00
Carus, LLC Peru, IL	Blended Phosphate/ Corrosion Inhibitor	73 Tons	\$770.00	\$56,210.00
Polydyne, Inc. Riceboro, GA	Liquid Polymer	12 Tons	\$2,240.00	\$26,880.00
Total: \$1,859,183.00				



We Are Columbia

**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

Lake Murray Water Treatment Plant				
Vendor/Location	Description	Estimated Usage	Unit Price	Amount To Be Awarded
Cabot Purification Marshall, TX	Activated Carbon (Powdered)	175 Tons	\$1,600.00	\$280,000.00
JCI Jones Chemicals Sarasota, FL	Chlorine	320 Tons	\$519.00	\$166,080.00
Univar USA Inc. Downers Grove, IL	Fluoride/Fluorosilicic Acid/Liquid	200 Tons	\$360.00	\$72,000.00
Tanner Industries, Inc. Southampton, PA	Anhydrous Ammonia	47 Tons	\$1,440.00	\$67,680.00
Chemtrade Chemicals US, LLC Parsippany, NJ	Aluminum Sulfate	1,802 Tons	\$299.00	\$538,798.00
Univar USA Inc. Downers Grove, IL	Sodium Hydroxide/Caustic	225 Tons	\$474.00	\$106,650.00
Polytec, Inc. Mooresville, NC	Liquid Lime (Calcium Hydroxide)	775 Tons	\$320.00	\$248,000.00
Carus, LLC Peru, IL	Blended Phosphate/Corrosion Inhibitor	156 Tons	\$770.00	\$120,120.00
Polydyne, Inc. Riceboro, GA	Liquid Polymer	13 Tons	\$2,240.00	\$29,120.00
Southern States Chemical, Inc. Savannah, GA	Liquid Sulfuric Acid 78%	321 Tons	\$200.00	\$64,200.00
Total:\$1,692,648.00				



We Are Columbia

**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant				
Vendor/Location	Description	Estimated Usage	Unit Price	Amount To Be Awarded
JCI Jones Chemicals Sarasota, FL	Sodium Hypochlorite, 12%	555,000 Gallons	\$0.6000	\$333,000.00
JCI Jones Chemicals Sarasota, FL	Sodium Hypochlorite, 15%	555,000 Gallons	\$0.6340	\$351,870.00
Southern Ionics, Inc. West Point, MS	Sodium Bisulfite	2,450,000 Gallons	\$0.0920	\$225,400.00
Polydyne, Inc. Riceboro, GA	Liquid Polymer	650,000 Pounds	\$1.12	\$728,000.00
Total: \$1,638,270.00				

33. Ordinance No.: 2019-084 Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 20, Special Fees and Taxes, Article IV, Electronic Payment Fees, Sec. 20-102 Fee(s) imposed – *First reading approval was given on October 15, 2019 - Approved on second reading.*
34. Resolution No.: R-2019-095 Authorizing consumption of beer and wine only within Boyd Plaza adjacent to the Columbia Museum of Art for the CMA Live on Boyd Plaza on Sunday, December 8, 2019 - *Approved*
35. Resolution No.: R-2019-103 Authorizing consumption of beer and wine only at First Thursdays on Main Street - *Approved*

PRESENTATIONS

36. Recognition of Ms. Colleen L. Foster as the November Employee of the Month - Mr. Aubrey Jenkins, Fire Chief.

Mr. Aubrey Jenkins, Fire Chief said Ms. Foster is the type of employee that every employer dreams of having. She is very diligent in everything that she does. She supports the city and the county and she wholly supports our department. She is the type of person who always has encouraging words for everybody that comes in her office. I am blessed to have her as my executive assistant and proud that she is an employee of the City of Columbia.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

Mayor Benjamin said thank you Ms. Foster and Chief for the nomination. He presented Ms. Colleen Foster with a plaque and Mr. Palen presented Ms. Foster with a token of appreciation for being selected as the City of Columbia November 2019 Employee of the month.

Mayor Benjamin welcomed the new Mayor of Irmo, Barry Walker. Mr. Walker has been a long time town councilman and trailblazer in the revitalization of Main Street, owning and running Max on Main for a number of years. It is really good to have you here Mr. Mayor.

Mr. Barry Walker, Town of Irmo Mayor-Elect said I wanted to introduce myself tonight has councilman Barry Walker from Irmo, but as of December 3, 2019 I will be Mayor Barry Walker. Tonight, I am building that relationship and opening the floodgate of cooperation between my little town of Irmo and your great city of Columbia.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Assistant City Manager / Chief Financial Officer said we had two press releases for two appointments. Our Mayor Pro-Tem Devine was elected to the Board of Directors for the National League of Cities and two weeks ago, Mayor Benjamin was elected as Vice President of the Global Parliament of Mayors.

37. Columbia Empowerment Zone's Excellence in Economic Development Awards - Mr. Russell McCoy, Co-Chair of the Columbia Empowerment Zone Board and Ms. Felicia Maloney, Executive Director of the Columbia Empowerment Zone, Inc.

Ms. Felicia Maloney, Executive Director of the Columbia Empowerment Zone, Inc. said the Columbia Empowerment Zone received two Excellence in Economic Development awards this year. We received the bronze for neighborhood and retail development in the North Main corridor and we received silver for creative financing for affordable housing in the North Main corridor development. The International Economic Development Council Excellence in Economic Development Awards recognizes the world's best economic development programs and partnerships in the areas of marketing and the year's most influential leaders. In 2017, we won an award in partnership with our Public Relations Department for our marketing efforts.

Mayor Benjamin said thank you Felicia, Reggie, and Russ. The work CEZ has been doing has been amazing and a game changer for the City of Columbia. We look forward to continuing to partner with you in making the city great. Felicia, great work.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

Councilor Davis said it is appropriate for us to recognize the Columbia Empowerment Zone. There were only dozens around the country and the golden rule was that they would at some point be independent of the federal government. This zone is the last of two that is left in the country. If you drive up the North Main corridor, you will see the brand new historic building that is an investment in the area. That is what they do and they do a good job at it. They continue to add to the economy and the quality of life in the City of Columbia and we appreciate that.

38. Soda City Certified - Ms. Khali Gallman, Soda City Certified App Creator

Ms. Khali Gallman, Soda City Certified App Creator said I created the Soda City Certified app as a one stop shop to connect individuals with businesses and historical sites all over the city. People get paid for frequenting certain businesses and sites. Our major partner is Historic Columbia. The app is available now and the points system starts in January. Once people go to these places, restaurants, and sites they get points towards being Soda City certified. They can redeem these points at the end of the year and they get a Soda City Certified custom medallion. The top three people with the most points get \$500. There are also incentives within the app. We will have some deals with local partners and there is also a who's who component to connect people. City Hall is one of the venues. I checked in and got my 25 points and an extra 25 points because I added a picture of you all.

Councilor Devine said Khali is one of our millennials that worked for the city. She left Columbia as many young people do because they think they will find better things. They soon realize that Columbia is the best ever and they come back. Her idea is to promote local pride and encourage people to explore things within their own backyard. I think it is great and we will definitely help you promote it so people can see all the great things we have going on in Columbia.

ORDINANCES - SECOND READING

39. Ordinance No.: 2019-081 Consenting to the Inclusion of Property in a Multi-County Industrial/Business Park (North Main Senior, LLC, 3700 North Main Street and 3706 North Main Street), Richland County TMS Numbers 09209-20-04 and 09209-20-03 - *First reading approval was given on October 15, 2019 – Approved on second reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to give second reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-081 Consenting to the Inclusion of Property in a Multi-County Industrial/Business Park (North Main Senior, LLC, 3700 North Main Street and 3706 North Main Street), Richland County TMS Numbers 09209-20-04 and 09209-20-03.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

ORDINANCES - FIRST READING

40. Ordinance No.: 2019-085 Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 11, Licenses, Permits and Miscellaneous Business Regulations, Article II, Contractors, Sec. 11-71, Permit, indemnification and insurance requirements for work affecting streets or other public property to add (e) Outdoor dining encroachments - *Commercial Corridor Redevelopment Program action item – Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-085 Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 11, Licenses, Permits and Miscellaneous Business Regulations, Article II, Contractors, Sec. 11-71, Permit, indemnification and insurance requirements for work affecting streets or other public property to add (e) Outdoor dining encroachments.

41. Ordinance No.: 2019-092 Granting an encroachment to Central Midlands Transit Authority – The COMET for the use of the right of way areas of the 1300 block of Bower Parkway adjacent to 350 Harbison Boulevard, 2300 block of Elmwood Avenue adjacent to 2325 Elmwood Avenue, and 5300 Block of Forest Drive adjacent to 5340 Forest Drive for the installation and maintenance of bus Shelters, Lexington County TMS#002898-01-031, and Richland County TMS#11505-05-01 and 16706-04-09 – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-092 Granting an encroachment to Central Midlands Transit Authority – The COMET for the use of the right of way areas of the 1300 block of Bower Parkway adjacent to 350 Harbison Boulevard, 2300 block of Elmwood Avenue adjacent to 2325 Elmwood Avenue, and 5300 Block of Forest Drive adjacent to 5340 Forest Drive for the installation and maintenance of bus Shelters, Lexington County TMS#002898-01-031, and Richland County TMS#11505-05-01 and 16706-04-09.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
42. Ordinance No.: 2019-093 Consenting to the Inclusion of Property in a Multi-County Industrial/Business Park (Ballpark, LLC, 17.5 acres, Richland County TMS#11204-02-02, 11204-02-06, 11204-02-07 and 11204-02-42) - *Commercial Development Incentive Program – Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted [6 to 1] to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-093 Consenting to the Inclusion of Property in a Multi-County Industrial/Business Park (Ballpark, LLC, 17.5 acres, Richland County TMS#11204-02-02, 11204-02-06, 11204-02-07 and 11204-02-42). Voting aye were Mr. McDowell, Mr. Davis, Mr. Duvall, Ms. Devine, Mr. Rickenmann and Mayor Benjamin. Mr. Baddourah voted nay.

43. Ordinance No.: 2019-095 Authorizing the City Manager to sign a lease between the City of Columbia and Columbia Dog Park, a South Carolina Charitable Organization for property located at 127 Humane Lane – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-095 Authorizing the City Manager to sign a lease between the City of Columbia and Columbia Dog Park, a South Carolina Charitable Organization for property located at 127 Humane Lane.

44. Ordinance No.: 2019-096 Authorizing the City Manager to execute an Eighth Amendment to Lease between the City of Columbia and Old Boy Properties, LLC for property consisting of 100± acres in Richland County, South Carolina being a portion of the property formerly owned by Columbia Venture, LLC and Sunday School, LLC – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-096 Authorizing the City Manager to execute an Eighth Amendment to Lease between the City of Columbia and Old Boy Properties, LLC for property consisting of 100± acres in Richland County, South Carolina being a portion of the property formerly owned by Columbia Venture, LLC and Sunday School, LLC.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
45. Ordinance No.: 2019-097 Consenting to the Inclusion of Property in a Multi-County Industrial/Business Park (PDP Bull Street Apartments, LLC, portions of Richland County TMS #R09113-16-03 and TMS R11501-02-01) - *Commercial Development Incentive Program – Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted [6 to 1] to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-097 Consenting to the Inclusion of Property in a Multi-County Industrial/Business Park (PDP Bull Street Apartments, LLC, portions of Richland County TMS #R09113-16-03 and TMS R11501-02-01). Voting aye were Mr. McDowell, Mr. Davis, Mr. Duvall, Ms. Devine, Mr. Rickenmann and Mayor Benjamin. Mr. Baddourah voted nay.

Councilor Rickenmann asked to have the numbers cleaned up and clarified before second reading.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Assistant City Manager / Chief Financial Officer said yes sir we will have that before next Tuesday's meeting.

46. Ordinance No.: 2019-098 amend Sec. 3-352 Definitions, Employer (Conviction-Wage History) – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-098 amend Sec. 3-352 Definitions, Employer (Conviction-Wage History).

47. Ordinance No.: 2019-099 Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 8, Environmental Health and Sanitation, Article II, Nuisances, Sec. 8-31 Nuisance - Definitions (b) Nuisances affecting public health – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-099 Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 8, Environmental Health and Sanitation, Article II, Nuisances, Sec. 8-31 Nuisance - Definitions (b) Nuisances affecting public health.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

-
48. Ordinance No.: 2019-107 Consenting to the Inclusion of Property in a Multi-County Industrial/Business Park (Huger Hospitality, LLC, portion of Richland County TMS #08912-13-02) - *Commercial Development Incentive Program – Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mayor Benjamin, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2019-107 Consenting to the Inclusion of Property in a Multi-County Industrial/Business Park (Huger Hospitality, LLC, portion of Richland County TMS #08912-13-02).

Councilor Rickenmann said I want to make sure for the record that we clean up the document then get the numbers correct on this one as well, prior to second reading.

49. ANNEXATION, INTERIM COMPREHENSIVE PLAN MAP AMENDMENT, AND INTERIM ZONING MAP AMENDMENT for 118 Woodcreek Ridge Drive; TMS# 25716-02-03 – *Approved on first reading.*

Ordinance No.: 2019-090 Annexing 118 Woodcreek Ridge Drive, Richland County TMS# 25716-02-03 into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 – *Approved on first reading.*

Council District: 4

Proposal: Request to annex, assign land use classification of Urban Edge Residential Large Lot (UER-2) and assign zoning of Development District (D-1). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned Rural District (RU) by Richland County

Applicant: Cascata Development, LLC

Staff Recommendation: Annex, Assign Interim Land Use and Interim Zoning
APPROVE

PC Recommendation: 10/07/2019; Assign Interim Land Use and Interim Zoning
Approval (7-0)



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to the *Annexation, Interim Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment, and Interim Zoning Map Amendment* for 118 Woodcreek Ridge Drive; TMS# 25716-02-03. Mayor Benjamin abstained from voting due to a potential conflict of interest.

50. ANNEXATION, INTERIM COMPREHENSIVE PLAN MAP AMENDMENT, AND INTERIM ZONING MAP AMENDMENT for 4.91 acres Woodcreek Farms Road and +/- 0.17 acres W/S Woodcreek Farms Road; TMS# 25800-03-47 and 25800-03-28 – *Approved on first reading.*

Ordinance No.: 2019-088 Annexing 4.91 acres, Woodcreek Farms Road and 0.17 acres W/S Woodcreek Farms Road, Richland County TMS# 25800-03-47 and 25800-03-28 into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 – *Approved on first reading.*

Council District: 4

Proposal: Request recommendation to annex, assign land use classification of Neighborhood Activity Corridor (AC-1) and assign zoning of Planned Unit Development - Residential District (PUD-R). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned PDD by Richland County.

Applicant: PD Limited, LLC and Woodcreek Development, LLC

Staff Recommendation: Annex, Assign Interim Land Use and Interim Zoning APPROVE

PC Recommendation: 10/07/2019; Assign Interim Land Use and Interim Zoning Approval (7-0)



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to the *Annexation, Interim Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment, and Interim Zoning Map Amendment* for 4.91 acres Woodcreek Farms Road and +/- 0.17 acres W/S Woodcreek Farms Road; TMS# 25800-03-47 and 25800-03-28. Mayor Benjamin abstained from voting due to a potential conflict of interest.

RESOLUTIONS

51. Resolution No.: R-2019-094 Adopting City of Columbia Outdoor Dining Encroachment Policy - *Commercial Corridor Redevelopment Program action item – Approved.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2019-094 Adopting City of Columbia Outdoor Dining Encroachment Policy.

52. Resolution No.: R-2019-096 Authorizing the City Manager to execute an Agreement Concerning Electrical Service Rights between Fairfield Electric Cooperative, Tri-County Electric Co-operative and Midland Carolina Electric Cooperative, Inc. and Dominion Energy South Carolina, Inc. – *Approved*

Councilor Rickenmann asked if this calls for the City to begin negotiations of a franchise agreement with the providers. Do we know where we are on that before we begin voting?

Ms. Missy Gentry, Assistant City Manager for Development said we have not started those negotiations. Staff is looking at a list of what items we will talk about during negotiations.

Councilor Rickenmann said my concern is that we are authorizing the City Manager to agree to something we have not seen. I am not sure we should be voting on this at this time.

Ms. Missy Gentry, Assistant City Manager for Development said we are not agreeing to the negotiated franchise, we are agreeing to start negotiations. We are agreeing to the service map that Dominion and the electric co-ops have agreed upon.

Councilor Rickenmann said the resolution calls for the City Manager to execute the agreement concerning Electrical Service Rights between these agencies.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

Ms. Missy Gentry, Assistant City Manager for Development said which is the attached service map. They have gone through the service area and divided the territories. Not only what already has power but the map of the entire area. As development occurs they already know which service provider will provide the power. We just need to consent to that. This is part of the requirement of Public Service Commission. We have until 2032, but Dominion and all the electric providers are being required to get their franchise agreements on the same cycle so they asked us to start negotiating the franchise.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted [6 to 1] to approve Resolution No.: R-2019-096 Authorizing the City Manager to execute an Agreement Concerning Electrical Service Rights between Fairfield Electric Cooperative, Tri-County Electric Co-operative and Midland Carolina Electric Cooperative, Inc. and Dominion Energy South Carolina, Inc.

53. Resolution No.: R-2019-097 Authorizing Condemnation for Easement Acquisition for Sanitary Sewer at 4112 West Beltline Boulevard and Brookland Circle to eliminate the Old Food Lion Pump Station; Richland County TMS #11613-13-03, n/f Landers Commercial, LLC; CIP Project #SS7323; CF#250-429 (Easement 5 of 11) – *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2019-097 Authorizing Condemnation for Easement Acquisition for Sanitary Sewer at 4112 West Beltline Boulevard and Brookland Circle to eliminate the Old Food Lion Pump Station; Richland County TMS #11613-13-03, n/f Landers Commercial, LLC; CIP Project #SS7323; CF#250-429 (Easement 5 of 11).

Councilor Rickenmann asked if we have the other easements or are more coming?

Mr. Client Shealy, Assistant City Manager for Columbia Water said yes sir, this is the last outstanding easement for that particular project.

54. Resolution No.: R-2019-098 Authorizing Condemnation for Easement Acquisition for Harlem Heights Storm Drainage Improvements; CIP Project #SD8386; Richland County TMS#14203-14-41, n/f Thomas S. Odom; 1700 Broadland Avenue; Richland County TMS#11714-01-68, n/f Frank C. & Gloria L. Graham; 1700 Carousel Circle; and Richland County TMS#14203-14-38, Catherine Nesbitt; 1712 Broadland Avenue; CF#250-254 – *Approved*



We Are Columbia

**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2019-098 Authorizing Condemnation for Easement Acquisition for Harlem Heights Storm Drainage Improvements; CIP Project #SD8386; Richland County TMS#14203-14-41, n/f Thomas S. Odom; 1700 Broadland Avenue; Richland County TMS#11714-01-68, n/f Frank C. & Gloria L. Graham; 1700 Carousel Circle; and Richland County TMS#14203-14-38, Catherine Nesbitt; 1712 Broadland Avenue; CF#250-254.

55. Resolution No.: R-2019-099 Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Right of Entry between the City of Columbia and The River Alliance for access during surveying and design of Phase II of the Saluda Riverwalk – *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2019-099 Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Right of Entry between the City of Columbia and The River Alliance for access during surveying and design of Phase II of the Saluda Riverwalk.

56. Resolution No.: R-2019-102 Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Sublease Agreement with Celia Saxon Shopping Center, LLC for the lease of Suite 110 and 112 at 2012 Harden Street for the Employee Health Center – *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2019-102 Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Sublease Agreement with Celia Saxon Shopping Center, LLC for the lease of Suite 110 and 112 at 2012 Harden Street for the Employee Health Center.

57. Resolution No.: R-2019-105 Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Maintenance and Security Agreement between Richland County and the City of Columbia for Gills Creek Section A Greenway – *Deferred*

Councilor Rickenmann asked to hold this item. We don't have any maintenance numbers and I feel like we shouldn't be signing anything until we know exactly what our cost is. The numbers aren't part of these documents and they haven't been sent out to the public. We must have some type of estimate to understand what we are signing up for. Once again, we have a maintenance issue that affects our budget in the future ongoing. I think we need to make sure the public knows what we are committed to.

Mayor Benjamin recognized Councilman-Elect Will Brennan. Will, we are glad to have you here as well.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

APPOINTMENTS

58. Bicycle Pedestrian Advisory Committee

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the reappointment of Christina Galardi and the appointment of Emily Beasley, Susan Forrest, Zachary Pippin, and Barton Walrath to the Bicycle and Pedestrian Advisory Committee for a three-year term.

59. Central Midlands Council of Governments

Upon a motion made by Mr. Rickenmann and seconded by Mayor Benjamin, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Councilman-Elect Will Brennan to the Central Midlands Council of Governments for a three-year term.

60. Climate Protection Action Committee – *Deferred*

61. Design Development Review Commission – *Deferred*

62. Municipal Election Commission

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the reappointment of Professor Susan Kuo to the Municipal Election Commission for a six-year term.

63. Parks and Recreation Foundation – *Deferred*

64. Property Maintenance Board of Appeals

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Michael Magill and Joseph Terry to the Property Maintenance Board of Appeals for a three-year term.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS DISCUSSED DURING THE WORK SESSION

65. Economic Development Partners Update - Mr. Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted [5 to 2] to approve the Partner Agency Funding Proposal presented during the Work Session by Ryan Coleman, Director of Economic Development, without the Engenuity Budget and the incentive fund. Voting aye were Mr. McDowell, Mr. Duvall, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis, and Mayor Benjamin. Voting nay were Mr. Rickenmann and Mr. Baddourah.

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mayor Benjamin, Council voted [5 to 2] to increase EngenuitySC's budget to \$32,500, which is half of the previously appropriated amount; to seek an amended agreement between the City's Economic Development Office and EngenuitySC with amended deliverables for the year; and to shift \$15,000 from the Economic Development Incentive Fund. Voting aye were Mr. McDowell, Mr. Duvall, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis, and Mayor Benjamin. Voting nay were Mr. Rickenmann and Mr. Baddourah.

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS/REFERRALS

66. Council is asked to refer a presentation on the history of Sherwood Forest and the Original Frog Town Community by Mrs. Sonya Hodges to the Arts and Historic Preservation Committee, as requested by The Honorable Moe Baddourah.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mayor Benjamin, Council voted unanimously to approve a presentation on the history of Sherwood Forest and the Original Frog Town Community by Mrs. Sonya Hodges to the Arts and Historic Preservation Committee, as requested by The Honorable Moe Baddourah.

OTHER MATTERS

67. Council is asked to approve the Proposed Meeting Schedule for 2020. – *Deferred*

APPEARANCE OF THE PUBLIC

No one appeared at this time.

Upon a motion by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mayor Benjamin, Council voted unanimously to resume executive session to discuss the remaining items on the agenda.



We Are Columbia

**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019**

Council entered into Executive Session at 7:09 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT

Council adjourned the meeting at 9:13 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by:

Erika D. Moore, CMC
City Clerk