COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 5, 2017

The Columbia City Council met for a Work Session on Tuesday, September 5, 2017 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina 29201. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 2:20 p.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine, The Honorable Howard E. Duvall, Jr., The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr., and The Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann. The Honorable Moe Baddourah was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act. *The minutes are numbered to coincide with the order of the meeting.*

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell offered the Invocation.

CITY COUNCIL DISCUSSION

1. One Columbia for Arts and History Update - Mr. Lee Snelgrove, Executive Director of One Columbia

Mr. Lee Snelgrove, Executive Director of One Columbia presented an annual update to the members of Council. He described how their projects relate to the City's goals. He reported that a tremendous amount of public art has been completed and sixteen new pieces were installed in 2017. One Columbia has created 26 pieces of public art since the inception of the program. He reported that yarnbombing and painted crosswalks have drawn attention at weekend events. One Columbia helped to create the Office of Poet Laureate and he continues to create unique poetry for the State of the City along with ways to share poetry publicly. We facilitate First Thursdays along with partners along Main Street. We facilitate a lot of different projects to include Poetry Out Loud; the creation of *Fall Lines*; the Jasper Project in collaboration with Richland Library; and we had a leadership role in coordinating Girls Rock. In 2010, the Cultural Council of Richland/Lexington County worked with the Americans for the Arts and One Columbia worked with them in 2016. He announced that the 2017 Arts and Economic Prosperity Report provided evidence that the non-profit arts and cultural sector represent a significant industry in the Greater Columbia Area–one that generates $64.7 million in total economic activity. The arts and cultural sector also supports 2,630 full-time equivalent jobs, generates $55.1 million in household income to local residents, and delivers $7.3 million in local and government revenue. In 2018, One Columbia will work to create a cultural plan to help connect the arts community and to make sure the citizens of Columbia and surrounding areas have access to share in Columbia's culture.

2. Health Care Discussion - Mr. Kevin Bryant, Resident Manager Director of the South Carolina operations for AON Risk Services South, Inc.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON Risk Services South, Inc. said there is a need to cover increased costs. She said bringing these changes all at once will bring significant disruption to your employee group. If we implemented this in one year, the total value of these changes would be $488,000, which is 1.4% of your total claim costs. You should make small adjustments to make sure the cost sharing with employees is appropriate and to protect the City from experiencing significant increases in the cost of the plan. We will put a strategy together to help prevent having to make changes all at once in the future. She reviewed the current plan design that includes three PPO programs. She concentrated on the changes to the network side of the plan. You have a platinum plan and two gold plans. We are proposing that you differentiate the plans from each other to make three distinct choices for your employees based on their family needs and their budget. Over a course of three years, we'd like for you to have a mid-level gold plan, a mid-level silver plan, and a bronze-level plan. The goal is to bring the base plan down to a bronze-level plan; this plan should fit into the budget of almost any employee that you hire. It is an affordable plan. Your core plan would then become your mid-level silver program; it will be most attractive to the majority of employees, especially families and those with occasional healthcare needs. Your buy-up plan would become your middle level gold plan. This tends to be for those with significant health concerns and it usually has the poorest experience of all of the offerings that are made available to employees. Of these potential changes, we are touching all of the plans. In year one, we will implement the changes that will have the most significant impact in terms of costs and the least impact for disruption to your employees. This includes increased deductibles and out-of-pocket maximums. This will reduce costs by $373,000 to the claimant. The other change to co-pays is introducing a specialty drug tier to the prescription plan. These specialty medications are currently at your non-preferred benefit level for prescriptions and costs $60 for the base plan. We propose that you add the specialty tier and raise that to $145 for the base plan; $135 on the core plan; and $125 on the buy-up plan. She asked Council to consider these changes for the plan year. In year two, we will impact the pharmacy. We also suggest that you change the office visit co-pays from $35 for primary care physicians and $45 for specialists to $50 and $60 on the base plan; to $40 and $50 on the core plan; and $30 and $40 for the buy up plan. The other change that would move your pharmacy program into something that's more adaptable is to move away from the generic, preferred brand and brand labels and move to tiers 1, 2, and 3. In doing so, you are allowing a pharmacy benefit manager to put the least expensive mediations for a disease treatment category and getting away from generics, because we've found that some generics can be more expensive that a multi-source brand or your preferred brand. The pharmacy benefit manager can put the medications into a tier according to their pricing and consider the outcome of the efficacy of a particular medication. As part of that change would be to raise your copays and create three distinct pharmacy plans. You would raise tiers 2 and 3 on the base plan to $50 and $70; $45 and $65 on the core plan; and $40 and $60 on the buy-up plan. This will create some disruption, but it is an adjustment that the City should make and it will be more reflective of what is going on in pharmaceutical industry. In year three, we are going to establish and recommend that you start to address small changes in your plan periodically and on a systematic basis. You would address your out-of-pocket to better reflect the medical trend and the higher cost of receiving treatment for health concerns and in doing so it gets back to the employees absorbing small budget changes. You would raise it to the Affordable Care Act (ACA) limit, assuming that it is the status quo there will be a new limit maximum. The base plan would then become truly a bronze program in year three. Also, you would make small changes to both the core and the buy-up plans in year three reflecting the medical trend. The major change to the base plan to bring it to a bronze is to remove the copays and treating it more like a consumer driven approach and keeping it inexpensive, affordable, and attractive. The last option is a health savings account eligible program, which opens up the possibility of making that plan a bonus plan. It's a possible transition from the Health Reimbursement Account (HRA) to a Health Savings Account (HSA). Consider moving your programs to being a more consumer driven approach.

Councilor Devine said the employees would not pay copays. She asked if once they reach their deductibles would their costs be a percentage that we'd set.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON said it would and it reflects the current percentage that's on the plan, which is 70% in-network. You may change it at some point, but the percentage stands for the deductible and coinsurance.

Councilor McDowell said we don't know where the ACA will be; propose nothing happens. He asked what the minimum rate would be.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON said if the ACA goes away and we no longer have a maximum cap on out-of-pocket expenses, by year two you will be closer to a strategy and by year three you will be making changes. The plan is currently set very close to the maximum out-of-pocket that the ACA allows and there is an increase every year. She reviewed a chart of the plan changes, while noting that rather than coming up with the $488,000 in savings in one year, we spread it out starting with $373,000 and adding some of the smaller changes as the years go by.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager asked if the savings are listed for each year.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON said yes; except for year three, because we don't know what the medical trend will be. It's difficult to say what the pharmacy savings will be in year two, but there will be some savings. She reiterated that the savings for year one is $373,000. She began reporting on the contribution strategies, while noting that the claim experience is different for each plan. Employees and retirees not pay for 13% of the total cost of the plan. The contribution for the base plan is slightly below 3% and it goes up by plan design, but not significantly. Most employers in the private sector are going to the 80/20 or 75/25. You are at the high end of employers paying on behalf of employees. Your pre-65 retiree costs are 117% higher than active employees and they only make up 14% of your enrollment, but they also represent 27% of your claims. She suggested that Council consider having their contributions tracked separate from active employees. The buy-up plan is 88% higher in costs than the core plan and 242% higher in costs than base plan. While you have a differential between the three plans in contributions, it's not tracking with this particular statistic.

Councilor Devine said it makes sense for the buy-up plan to have higher claims costs since most people with the buy-up plan have more health issues.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON agreed with Ms. Devine's assessment. She continued to report that salary banding is an approach that some employers use when they are struggling with how much to raise contributions for the employees. Salary banding is having the higher paid group of employees pay more in contributions than your lower paid employees. She reported that 83% of the City employees make $50,000 per year or less. This reverse discrimination approach would not have much of a financial impact.

Mayor Benjamin asked about the average amount that employees and retirees pay in contributions.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON said at least 20%. She reported that other options for controlling the cost of the plan include increasing the tobacco surcharge to $100 and having a corresponding tobacco cessation program; adding a $100 spousal surcharge for those that have double coverage or access to coverage. Some even have a spousal exclusion for those who access to another plan.

Councilor Duvall asked if we have coordination of benefits if they do have another plan.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON said you do have coordination of benefits; their plan pays first and then your plan picks up the difference of what they would otherwise pay. It is a complicated calculation and it never ends up at 100% coverage.

It is a waste of money if you are paying two premiums. You would probably have a nice drop off of people who have double coverage now or who choose you because yours is the most attractive.

Councilor Devine inquired about the percentage of claims per salary group. She said the claims are probably higher for employees in a lower band versus the higher band.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON said that information is covered by HIPPA Privacy. We can identify high dollar claims, but we can't tell who it is. She continued to report that there are many different options for contribution strategies. She presented the 2018 funding projections for active employees for each plan. The City would end up with $2.5 in increased costs if the contribution rates remained the same. The employees are paying nearly 3% for the base plan; 6.5% for the core plan; and 12% for the buy-up plan. The employer is paying 97% for the base plan; 93% for the core plan; and 88% for the buy-up plan. She reviewed the 2018 proposed contributions for active employees. We've increased the percentage of the contribution for each plan. We increased employee only to 10% and there were subsequent increases on the other dependents. That protected the employee-child only where you will find most of your single parents. We brought the core plan up to 15% for the employee and 20% for dependents. It's 20% for employees on the buy-up plan and 27% for dependents. We've eliminated $1.5 million in exposure to the City. We recommend that you do make some changes and that they be heavier on the buy-up and core plans and lighter on the base plan.

Councilor Duvall said if we do nothing it will be a $2.6 million increase and if we accept your proposal it's only $1 million.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON said correct or anywhere in between. This is a snapshot based on current enrollment broken out between active employees and pre-65 retirees. If we make the plan changes, there will be less of a deficit for you to make up. It gives you an idea of how the contributions can offset increases for the City.

Councilor Duvall asked how much impact the spousal surcharge would have.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON estimated that 10% of spouses would fall off and another 5% would pay the $100 surcharge. She presented the 2018 funding proposed contributions for pre-65 retirees, noting that there should be more of an increase and a higher contribution for this group of retirees that are flowing through the active employee program as well. By moving the contributions up for you could virtually eliminate the increase that comes along with the 2018 funding requirement.

Mayor Benjamin inquired about the preliminary, non-committal long-term liability.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON said in combination with maintenance plan design changes, appropriate disease management programs, increased engagement on your wellness programs, you would want to set your rates of trend between 5% to 7%. You should be able to see a trend line start to establish itself for your group. We propose that you should be able to see that stabilize below where that is now. In closing, she noted that open enrollment is scheduled for October 1, 2017. She urged Council to vote on contributions and plan design changes by the next meeting.

Councilor Duvall said he likes the proposed contribution and plan design changes. He suggests the $100 surcharge for spouses.

Councilor Davis inquired about the financial impact of the $100 surcharge.

Councilor Devine said she doesn't support the banded differential, because there is no real rationale to doing that.

Councilor Rickenmann said the numbers are skewed in the banded differential. He is interested in creating a plan that's sustainable for the long-haul.

Councilor McDowell asked why the pre-65 retirees' claims are higher.

Ms. Cindy McCartney, Health and Benefits Senior Leader for AON said it is a consolidated group of people and it is typically people ages 50 to 65. The older we become, the more costly it is to take care of our health. She clarified that the contributions are the same for pre-65 retirees and active employees. It is an increase across the board, but the retirees are getting a larger increase.

Mr. Eric Atwater, FSA, EA, MAAA, Partner at AON Hewitt said we are actuaries and not lawyers; we do not practice law and we do not give legal advice. We spent the last six weeks collecting data and replicating the results of your previous actuary. We were able to replicate their results to within 3%. Currently, 3% to 4% of your workforce is eligible for retirement and 25% of your workforce will retire in ten years. The City's pay-as-you-go cost is expected to remain level around $10 to $12 million, because of the changes you've made with the defined dollar benefit. He clarified that he isn't recommending the options being presented here today. We want to show you the impact of the numbers and walk you through the pros and cons. The changes are being grouped into these categories: plan design strategies, buy-out option strategy;

and funding strategies. The plan design options have the biggest savings. He presented the plan design levers for future hires, active employees hired after 2009 and all active employees over a 30-year period.

Councilor Duvall asked if the defined benefit sets a limit on how much we pay for retirees post-employment.

Mr. Eric Atwater, FSA, EA, MAAA, Partner at AON Hewitt said yes. The changes presented by Cindy directly impact the retiree and reduce their costs. From an OPEB standpoint, you are fixed at what you will pay and the City's commitment to pay $300 does not change. He continued to report that the City has $40 million for buy-outs, but the only way to save money is to offer them less than the present value of the liability. He presented a chart outlining the financial impact of offering buy-outs.

Mayor Benjamin inquired about the present value of a future retiree.

Mr. Eric Atwater, FSA, EA, MAAA, Partner at AON Hewitt estimated that it is $30,000 per individual. He continued to report on the funding options, while noting that the Governmental Accounting Standards Board is opposed to entities issuing debt to fund the OPEB liability. He said state law also sets the City's debt limit. He presented a scenario to fund the liability over 30-years using the $40 million. This scenario would save the City $15 to $20 million through an irrevocable trust. He presented a chart comparing the City's OPEB contributions over the next 30-years using pay-as-you-go, the scenario to fund over 30 years, or borrowing additional funds. He suggested that the City consider funding the liability, because it would have less impact. If you offer the buy-out you should also consider if you want to continue offering retiree medical.

There was an in-depth discussion about the impact of funding the liability.

Mr. Eric Atwater, FSA, EA, MAAA, Partner at AON Hewitt reviewed the pros and cons of the plan design strategies, the buy-out and the funding strategies.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to enter into Executive Session at 4:21 p.m. as amended to include the discussion of the Adams Reese Conflict Waiver with **Item 3** and the removal of parking agreement from **Item 5**.

3. Receipt of legal advice related to matters covered by attorney-client privilege pursuant to §30-4-70(a)(2)
   - *Carolina Water Service*
   - *Penn Branch*
   - *Bond Hearings and Criminal Procedure*

4. Discussion of negotiations incident to proposed contractual arrangements pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)
   - *Homeless Services*
   - *Convention Center*
   - *Healthcare*

5. Discussion of matters relating to proposed location or expansion of services to encourage location or expansion of industries or other businesses pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)
   - *Vista*
   - *Parking Agreement*
   - *Incentive Criteria*

6. Receipt of legal advice which relates to pending, threatened or potential claim pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)
   - *Bennett v. Allman*

Council adjourned the Executive Session at 6:05 p.m. to convene the regular meeting.

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 5, 2017

COUNCIL MEETING

The Columbia City Council conducted a meeting on Tuesday, September 5, 2017 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina 29201. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 6:10 p.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine, The Honorable Howard E. Duvall, Jr., The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr., and The Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann. The Honorable Moe Baddourah was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act. *The minutes are numbered to coincide with the order of the meeting.*

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the Invocation.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to adopt the agenda as amended to add **Item 33** *(Resolution No.: 2017-089 - Authorizing Eau Claire Unity Festival and consumption of beer and wine only at Hyatt Park and Eau Claire Town Hall on Saturday, September 9, 2017)* to the Consent Agenda.

PUBLIC INPUT RELATED TO AGENDA ITEMS

No one appeared at this time.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

7. Council is asked to approve the May 9, 2017 and June 20, 2017 City Council Minutes

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the May 9, 2017 and June 20, 2017 City Council Minutes.

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 5, 2017

CONSENT AGENDA

Mr. Joey Jaco, Utility Operations Director explained that Item 26 (Project SS723618) is the renewal of a 10-year contract with CDM Smith to shepherd us through the Consent Decree. We are above the 25% participation goal for sub consultants for the project. We are also improving how we do business. The Consent Decree begins with programs that make sure we are doing business as we should and the majority of the programs have been setup. We will begin negotiations for ending the Consent Decree in 2027 if we stay on track. It is also referred to as the Clean Water 2020 Program.

Upon a single motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the **Consent Agenda Items 8** through **33**.

8. Council is asked to approve an Agreement for Professional Services to Advise, Amplify and Advocate for Strengthening and Unifying the Arts and History Community. Award to One Columbia for Arts and History in the amount of $83,800.00. *Funding Source: The original budgeted amount is $83,800.00. - Approved*

9. Council is asked to approve a Contract Renewal for Morning Pride Bunker Gear by Honeywell, as requested by the Fire Department. Award to Newton's Fire and Safety Equipment, Inc., in an amount not to exceed $316,764.00. This vendor is located in Graham, NC. *Funding Source: Fire Suppression-Safety Clothing and Supplies; 1012303–625900. The original budgeted amount is $316,764.00. - Approved*

10. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of Palmetto 800 MHz Radio Airtime for Fiscal Year 2017/2018, as requested by the Fire Department. Award to Motorola, Inc., using the SC State Contract in the amount of $129,600.00. This vendor is located in Blythewood, SC. *Funding Source: Fire Department - Maintenance & Service Contract; 1012303-638200. The original budgeted amount is $129,600.00. - Approved*

11. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of Palmetto 800 MHz Radio Airtime for Fiscal Year 2017/2018, as requested by the Police Department. Award to Motorola, Inc., using the SC State Contract in the amount of $295,350.00. This vendor is located in Blythewood, SC. *Funding Source: Police Department - Other Lease/Rental; 1012402 - 636500. The original budgeted amount is $295,350.00. - Approved*

12. Council is asked to ratify the approval of a Contract Renewal for Records Management Software Maintenance and Services for Fiscal Year 2017/2018, as requested by the Police Department. Award to Tritech Software Systems in an amount not to exceed $178,150.58. This firm is located in San Diego, CA. *Funding Source: Police Administrative Services- Maintenance and Service Contract; 1012402 - 638200.The original budgeted amount is $178,150.58. – Approved*

13. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of seventy-five (75) Body Armor Jackets, as requested by the Police Department. Award to Lawmen's using the SC State Contract in the amount of $59,535.00. This vendor is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Police Department – Uniforms and Clothing; 1012402 –624100. The original budgeted amount is $59,535.00. - Approved*

14. Council is asked to approve the Kronos Support Services Renewal, as requested by the Information Technology Department. Award to Kronos Incorporated, in the amount of $80,510.49. This vendor is located in Chelmsford, MA. *Funding Source: General Admin Information Tech- Maintenance and Service Contract 6218950-638200. The original budgeted amount is $80,510.49. - Approved*

15. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of the Annual Licenses for Banner CIS Utility Billing Software, as requested by the Budget and Program Management Office. Award to Hansen Technologies in the amount of $116,723.20. This vendor is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: General Admin Information Tech- Maintenance and Service Contract 6218950-638200. The original budgeted amount is $150,000.00. - Approved*

16. Council is asked to approve a Contract Renewal for Oracle Support Services for Fiscal Year 2017/2018, as requested by the Information Technology Services Department. Award to Mythics, Inc., in the amount of $179,862.92. This firm is located in Virginia Beach, VA. *Funding Source: Information Technology: Maintenance and Service Contract; 1011120- 638200. The original budgeted amount is $179,862.92. - Approved*

17. Council is asked to approve the Annual Drinking Water Fee, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to SC DHEC in the amount of $58,002.00. *These fees were included in the FY 17-18 Budget. Allocation of funds will be split 50/50 between 5516206 and 5516207. The original budgeted amount is $86,000.00. - Approved*

18. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of seven (7) Ford F-250 Vehicles, as requested by Columbia Water. Awarded to Vic Bailey Ford, using the SC State Contract in the amount of $206,626.00. This vendor is located in Spartanburg, SC. *Funding Source: Water Distribution and Maintenance-Auto Trucks, Heavy Equipment Capital; 5516203-658500. The original budgeted amount is $206,626.00. - Approved*

19. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of Morris Pumps, Parts and Services for the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Heyward Services, Inc. as a Sole Source in the amount of $50,000.00. This vendor is located in Charlotte, NC. *Funding Source: Utilities Metro Wastewater Plant: Small Hand Tools and Other Equipment; 5516208- 623100. The original budgeted amount is $50,000.00. - Approved*

20. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of Allen-Bradley Controls, Drives and Rockwell Software, Parts and Services for the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Englewood Electric Supply, as a Sole Source in the amount of $80,000.00. This vendor is located in West Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Utilities Metro Wastewater Plant: Machinery and Equipment; 5516208- 658300. The original budgeted amount is $80,000.00. - Approved*

21. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of Parts and Services for the Separation System at the Metro Wastewater Plant, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to JWC Environmental, as a sole source in an amount not to exceed $93,000.00. This vendor is located in Los Angeles, CA. *Funding Source: Utilities Metro Wastewater Plant: Machinery and Equipment; 5516208-658300. The original budgeted amount is $93,000.00. - Approved*

22. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of Pump Repair Services for the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Charles Underwood, Inc., as a Sole Source in an amount not to exceed $146,000.00. This vendor is located in Sanford, NC. *Funding Source: Utilities Metro Wastewater Plant: Machinery and Equipment; 5516208- 658300. The original budgeted amount is $146,000.00. - Approved*

23. Council is asked to approve Project SR8047; Bank Restoration for Pinner Road as requested by Columbia Water. Award to LAD Corporation, a Woman Owned Business Enterprise and a Local Business Enterprise, using the SC State Contract in an amount not to exceed $79,695.00. LAD Corporation is located in Swansea, SC. *Funding Source Capital Improvement Project Cost 5549999-658650. The original budgeted amount is $81,235.00. - Approved*

24. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of Water Meters, as requested by Columbia Water. Awarded to Mueller Systems, LLC of Cleveland, NC in the amount of $509,407.76 and Badger Meter, Inc. of Milwaukee, WI in the amount of $100,782.00 for a total amount of $659,004.94. *Funding Source: Water Distribution & Maintenance - Meters, Parts, and Supplies 5516203 - 625600. The original budgeted amount is $850,000.00. - Approved*

25. Council is asked to approve a Contract Extension for Water and Wastewater Chemicals, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to the lowest bidders of each lot in an amount not to exceed $861,385.00. *Funding Sources: Utilities Columbia Canal WTP-Chemicals 5516206-624800, Utilities Lake Murray WTP- Chemicals 5516207-624800 and Utilities Metro Wastewater Plant - Chemicals 5516208-624800. The original budgeted amount is $861,385.00. - Approved*

26. Council is asked to approve Contract Amendment #5 for Project SS723618; Consent Decree Program Management Services for Fiscal Year 2017/2018, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to CDM Smith in the amount of $5,300,000.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: 5529999-SS723601-658650 and 5529999-SS728601-658650. The original budgeted amount is $5,300,000.00. - Approved*

    The following sub-consultants will provide additional services:

    Grice Consulting, Group, LLC, a Minority Business Enterprise of Columbia, SC will provide document control support services at $341,684.00 (6.5%) of the contract value.

    DESA, Incorporated a Small, Minority, Woman Owned Business Enterprise of Columbia, SC will provide public outreach, construction inspection and document control support services at $251,520.00 (4.7%) of the contract value.

    Atlantic South Consulting Services, LLC, a Minority Business Enterprise of Charleston, SC will provide CMMS Implementation and support services at $207,900.00 (3.9%) of the contract value.

Comprehensive Business Consultants, a Minority Business Enterprise (Woman Owned) of Columbia, SC will provide program control analyst services at $167,800.00 (3.2%) of the contract value.

Civil Engineering Consulting Services, Incorporated, a Minority Business Enterprise (Woman Owned) of Columbia, SC will provide utility coordination, subsurface utility engineering, construction inspection and project management services at $272,096.00 (5.1%) of the contract value.

The LPA Group (Unit of Michael Baker Corporation) of Columbia, SC will provide construction management review and inspection services at $110,500.00 (2.1%) of the contract value.

27. Resolution No.: R-2017-059 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine only at Soda City Antique & Vintage Show on Saturday, November 4, 2017 with a rain contingency of Saturday, November 11, 2017 - *Approved*

28. Resolution No.: R-2017-076 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine only within Boyd Plaza adjacent to the Columbia Museum of Art for the Contemporaries Biergarten on Thursday, September 28, 2017 - *Approved*

29. Resolution No.: R-2017-079 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine only at the Dinner on Main Street on October 8, 2017 - *Approved*

30. Resolution No.: R-2017-080 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine only at the South Carolina Oyster Festival in the 1600 block of Blanding Street on November 19, 2017 with a rain contingency of November 26, 2017 - *Approved*

31. Resolution No.: R-2017-084 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine beverages only within the Amphitheater and adjacent grass field areas of Finlay Park for the New Wine 10K on Saturday, December 16, 2017 - *Approved*

32. Resolution No.: R-2017-088 Amending Resolution No.: R-2017-025 Amending Resolution No.: R-2017-025 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine beverages only at the SC Pride Festival 2017 on Main Street on Friday October 20, 2017 and Saturday, October 21, 2017 to change the closing time of the half block area of the 1200 block of Main Street on Friday, October 20, 2017 for stage set up and sound check for the evening concert - *Approved*

33. Resolution No.: R-2017-089 - Authorizing Eau Claire Unity Festival and consumption of beer and wine only at Hyatt Park and Eau Claire Town Hall on Saturday, September 9, 2017 - *Approved*

PRESENTATIONS

34. August 2017 Employee of the Month - Ms. Pamela Benjamin, Director of Human Resources

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager recognized Ms. Charlene Harvey, Human Resources Specialist as the August 2017 Employee of the Month.

35. Certificate of Achievement for Excellence in Financial Reporting for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2016 - Ms. Jennifer Broughton, Past President of the Government Finance Officers Association of South Carolina

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said she takes great pride in recognizing the Finance Department; this is becoming a regular habit.

Ms. Jennifer Broughton, Past President of the Government Finance Officers Association of South Carolina presented the City of Columbia with the prestigious Certificate of Achievement for Excellence in Financial Reporting for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2016.

Ms. Jan Alonso, Finance Director says she has an amazing staff that makes this all possible.

36. Recognition of Miss Kiara Hayes as the National Bronze Medal Winner of the NAACP ACT-SO Olympics - The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin

Mayor Benjamin said the NAACP is the nation's oldest and largest Civil Rights organization. For decades, it has hosted the Afro-Academic, Cultural, Technological & Scientific Olympics. He recognized Ms. Kiara Hayes for achieving the National Bronze Medal. When we believe and invest in our young people they will step up and make it happen.

Miss Kiara Hayes, Senior at Ridge View High School said this award has given her a greater appreciation for the gift she has been given. She vowed to use her gift for the future and to follow her passion.

37. Laura Spong Day Proclamation - The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin

Mayor Benjamin and the members of City Council proclaimed Tuesday, August 5, 2017 as Laura Spong Day in the City of Columbia.

Mrs. Laura Spong thanked the members of Council for supporting their dream for Vista Storm Water. She also thanked Fred Delk, Executive Director of the Columbia Development Corporation for his support.

Mayor Benjamin noted that Council approved an agreement for professional services to complete a new cultural plan for the City and the region as well.

38. Diaper Need Awareness Week Proclamation - The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin

Mayor Benjamin and the members of Council proclaimed the week of September 25, 2017 through October 1, 2017 as Diaper Need Awareness Week in the City of Columbia.

Ms. Ayanna White, Executive Director of Power In Changing said the organization began in 2015 and helped 500 families during the flood. The diaper need in Columbia is great and there are no social assistance programs to help with this. She reported that one in three families face diaper needs and we are here to meet that basic need. We also offer parenting classes.

39. Kinship Care Month Proclamation - The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin

Mayor Benjamin and the members of Council proclaimed September 2017 as Kinship Care Month in the City of Columbia.

Ms. Erin G. Hall, Chief Executive Officer of the Palmetto Association for Children and Families said quite a number of kids in South Carolina are cared for by grandparents, aunts, uncles, cousins, and other family members. We wanted to recognize their incredibly hard work. She announced that Kinship Care Summits will be held this week in Columbia, Charleston, and Greenville.

40. Supporting the Goals of Solarize South Carolina Day Proclamation - The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin

Mayor Benjamin and the members of Council proclaimed Tuesday, September 5, 2017 as Supporting the Goals of Solarize South Carolina Day in the City of Columbia.

Ms. Sara Rajca, Community Outreach Manager for Solarize South Carolina said the sun shines every day and the campaign is about educating residents about solar energy and empowering residents to make the best decisions for their homes.

41. Annual Cross Cultural Conference - Mr. James Starnes, President of The Action Council for Cross-Cultural Mental Health & Human Services, Inc.

Mr. James Starnes, President of The Action Council for Cross-Cultural Mental Health & Human Services, Inc. announced the 40th Annual Cross-Cultural Conference to be held on February 15-18, 2018 in Myrtle Beach. The organization was founded to provide training for social workers. We have provided thousands of hours of training to social workers, nurses, and counselors. Services are provided in a culturally competent manner. We are hosting a gala at the Columbia Metropolitan Convention Center featuring the renowned Jazz Artist Wycliff Gordon. We will be honoring Palmetto Health for all the work they do in our community.

Ms. Margie Hammond said jazz is her absolute passion and Columbia is growing into a significant jazz community. We would like your support of this endeavor.

Mr. James Starnes, President of The Action Council for Cross-Cultural Mental Health & Human Services, Inc. said we need to fill the Convention Center and we would be grateful for anything you could do to help with that.

Mayor Benjamin and the members of Council wished Mr. Starnes a happy birthday.

SIDEWALK VENDING PUBLIC HEARING - ORDINANCE FIRST READING

42. Ordinance No.: 2017-067 - Granting a Franchise to Mark 8:36 LLC dba Chick-Fil-A at Five Points for operation of a stationary sidewalk vending cart at the northeast corner of Main Street and Lady Street - *Denied*

Council opened the Sidewalk Vending Public Hearing at 6:50 p.m.

Mr. John Thrash, Co-Owner of Pita Pit in Five Points and Main Street appeared before the Council in opposition to the matter. We've invested $500,000 to upgrade the building at 1332 Main Street. I could've chosen to put a cart on Main Street and operate without a big investment. The vendor carts are a great thing for a small entrepreneur. This is an opportunity for the City to consider the definition of a cart. Other chain restaurants could also setup vendor carts and compete with the businesses on Main Street.

Mr. Matthew Bridges, Co-Owner of Drakes Duck In at 1544 Main Street appeared before the Council in opposition to the matter. He said granting a street vendor's license to a national chain subverts the purpose of this license. The license is intended for a small specialty food stand, not to supply backdoor access for a national chain to increase revenue with little or no investment in the district. He said Chick-Fil-A wants to capitalize on the favorable environment that we have all fostered. If Chick-Fil-A truly wants to be a part of the district they should buy or lease a building, build a kitchen, pay employees, and contribute to taxes in that district.

Mr. David LaVigne, Co-owner of Stoners Pizza Joint at 1332 Main Street appeared before the Council in opposition to the matter. We sold our pizza franchise in Pooler, Georgia to move to Columbia. We looked at many locations and decided that Main Street is where we wanted to be. We are not opposed to competition, but we are concerned about them not having to pay for the spot they are leasing. That should not be part of the deal in the Columbia area.

Ms. Beverly Shreve, Co-owner of Stoners Pizza Joint at 1332 Main Street appeared before the Council in opposition to the matter. We researched a lot of areas. My family started Stoners, there are 23 locations, and we plan to open several stores in the Columbia area. We decided on the downtown district, because of the revitalization. I have an issue with someone being able to come in and not having to pay rent or taxes.

Mr. James Bennett, Applicant and Franchise Owner of Chick-Fil-A Five Points said there is a lot of misinformation out there. We are not a corporate plate; we are Chick-Fil-A, Inc. I employ 120 employees and I pay my taxes. I have guests saying that they can't get to the Five Points location during their lunch break. The Main Street location was closed, because it couldn't support a drive-thru, which is 60% of the business. I've lived here for three years and my daughter went to Dreher High School. Some of the concerns are untrue. If you look at my donations, you will see that I've been generous to the community as a franchise owner. This is an opportunity for us to continue to grow. I plan to hire another 120 employees. We just started 401(k) plans and profit sharing for every team member. I am trying to create jobs for people that live in Columbia.

Ms. Rachel Anderson, Sales Director for Chick-Fil-A Five Points appeared before Council in support of the matter. She said Mr. Bennett provides 401(k), health insurance and financial advice for all employees. Mr. Bennett is the only owner doing that and I strongly believe in his vision. This is not a corporation; it is an individual who pays taxes.

Ms. Marian Kelly, Main Street Residents Association appeared before the members of Council in opposition to the matter. She said she hasn't spoken with a resident who supports this. She asked Council to deny the request. The location is a poor choice.

Mr. Jeremy Becraft, General Manager for Mast General Store appeared before the members of Council in opposition to the matter. He urged Council to support the businesses that have made an investment on Main Street. New businesses have made investments to be on Main Street and this isn't fair to them.

Ms. Martha Fowler, Main Street property owner appeared before the members of Council in opposition to the matter. We are making a huge investment in Main Street. The 1600 block looks nothing like it did five years ago. I eat at Chick-Fil-A all the time. Main Street has a lot of locally owned and operated small businesses with character. You need to be a part of the entire community. I don't think Chick-Fil-A is the answer. I would like for us to think about the designated spots we have for carts now.

Mr. Chris Zouras, Main Street resident appeared before the members of Council in opposition to the matter. He said traffic is an issue at the Chick-Fil-A in Five Points and on Bush River Road. This would also skim some of the meals being sold by other vendors who were on Main Street prior to the revitalization. There are six retailers on the block of Main Street at Lady Street. He asked Council to deny this food cart and any other cart until the majority of the vacant locations are occupied.

Mr. Jonathan Bohenberger, Chick-Fil-A Five Points employee appeared before the members of Council in support of this matter. He said Chick-Fil-A is a people company that just happens to sell chicken. We aren't looking to come to Main Street to make profits and leave. We are looking to serve good food at a good price with a reasonable wait.

Council closed the Sidewalk Vending Public Hearing at 7:13 p.m.

Councilor Duvall said the issue of Chick-Fil-A on Main Street has been bubbling up for a couple of months now. Our code under Business Licenses is very specific about carts and vending and how that is accomplished on Main Street. He read the City's definition of cart, vendor, and permitted merchandise. It doesn't say chicken, but prepackaged sandwiches might include a chicken sandwich. The application talks about 5x5 easy-up tables set inside a tent to hold a register. The food is cooked at the store and transported in a temperature management system. Everything is powered by electric generators. That does not meet the definition of a cart. I would move to deny the franchise and if that is successful I'd like to make a second motion.

Mr. McDowell seconded the motion.

Councilor Rickenmann said he is cautioned in this discussion, because this ordinance has been here and those locations have been picked out. It concerns me that we're deciding now that we don't want a national chain to be involved. Where do we draw the line? Mr. Duvall read the ordinance to you, but we don't enforce that equally. I'm struggling, because I hear the plight of the folks who've made investments. I also hear a franchisee who wants to deliver what his customers want. He has filed an application and now we are picking winners and losers in this conversation. I'm concerned about where we are headed with this. We have a great investment from a lot of people. The applicant followed the letter of the law. If we want to deny this application because of what Mr. Duvall described in the application then we need to go see the two other vendors on Main Street who not follow this law. Going forward, I want to make sure that we are giving everybody an opportunity and that we are applying the law equally. He thanked Mr. Bennett for the donations during the flood. If there is a technical problem then that should have been addressed before today. I know that we helped some of the people on Main Street to make the investment; they didn't do it all by themselves.

Mayor Benjamin said we are thankful for the overall spirit of entrepreneurship. We are thankful for the investments made here in Columbia. It is important that we don't allow the perfect to be the enemy of the good. I'm not sure that this application is within the spirit of what we are trying to do. There may be some other aspects of the current ordinance that this application may not be consistent with. I am thankful for Mr. Bennett's investment in Five Points and the investment that so many of you are making every single day to make the central business district a special place to be. We will be loading a truck from Southeastern Freight on tomorrow to go to Houston so we know how important the role of a corporate citizen is. Chick-Fil-A's decision to leave Main Street wasn't just a business plan; there were separate issues that played into that and if they had the choice, they'd still be on Main Street.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted three (3) to three (3) to deny Ordinance No.: 2017-067 - Granting a Franchise to Mark 8:36 LLC dba Chick-Fil-A at Five Points for operation of a stationary sidewalk vending cart at the northeast corner of Main Street and Lady Street. Voting aye were Mr. Duvall, Ms. Devine and Mayor Benjamin. Mr. Rickenmann, Mr. McDowell, and Mr. Davis voted nay.

Councilor Davis said it is unfair to vote to disapprove this. The issues should've been settled prior to him making application.

Mr. Duvall moved to refer a review of Section 11-251 Sidewalk Vending to the Economic and Community Development Committee chaired by Mr. Davis to review the ordinance that was written in 2002 to update it to modern classifications of carts and that while that review is taking place we do not issue any franchises until the ordinance is brought back to Council.

Mr. McDowell seconded the motion.

Councilor Devine agreed that this is an old ordinance. She urged the committee to determine whether or not being a part of a chain, franchise or national company will automatically prohibit you from being a part of sidewalk vending. I would worry about legal ramifications to making that forgone conclusion. We have to balance the needs of a growing community. I hope we can come back with an ordinance that addresses that.

Councilor McDowell said the motion gives the committee a chance to look at this in a clear and concise way to determine what the new ordinance might include as it relates to any business.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to refer a review of Section 11-251 Sidewalk Vending to the Economic and Community Development Committee chaired by Mr. Davis to review the ordinance that was written in 2002 to update it to modern classifications of carts and that while that review is taking place we do not issue any franchises until the ordinance is brought back to Council.

ORDINANCES - FIRST READING

43. Ordinance No.: 2017-075 - Granting a franchise to Trombino d/b/a Slidr, LLC – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2017-075 - Granting a franchise to Trombino d/b/a Slidr, LLC.

44. Ordinance No.: 2017-074 - Granting an encroachment to Woodcreek Development, LLC for installation and maintenance of two brick walls, two brick columns, curbing, guttering, landscaping, an irrigation system, paving, two raised medians and lighting within the right of way area of the 2000 block of Woodcreek Farms Road at Spears Creek Church Road adjacent to Richland County TMS #28800-01-10 – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2017-074 - Granting an encroachment to Woodcreek Development, LLC for installation and maintenance of two brick walls, two brick columns, curbing, guttering, landscaping, an irrigation system, paving, two raised medians and lighting within the right of way area of the 2000 block of Woodcreek Farms Road at Spears Creek Church Road adjacent to Richland County TMS #28800-01-10. Mayor Benjamin abstained from voting due to a potential conflict of interest.

Councilor McDowell recognized Michael Trombino as one of the City's newest business owners. He will use electric cars and I am very impressed with what he brings to our City.

Mr. Michael Trombino, Owner of Slidr, LLC said we look forward to bringing Slidr to Columbia. It's an electric, on-demand service using 100% electric vehicles to transport people downtown via a mobile app.

ORDINANCE - SECOND READING

45. Annexation, Interim Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment, and Interim Zoning Map Amendment - 4.24 acres, 174 Riding Grove Road and 178 Riding Grove Road, TMS # 28900-01-11(p), 28900-01-10(p), and 28900-01-09(p) - *Approved on second reading.*

    Ordinance No.: 2017-068 - Annexing 4.24 acres, 174 Riding Grove Road and 178 Riding Grove Road, Richland County TMS# 28900-01-11(p), 28900-01-10(p) and 28900-01-09(p) – *Approved on second reading.*

    Council District:4

    Proposal: Request to annex, assign interim land use classification of Urban Edge Residential-Large Lot (UER-2), and assign interim zoning of Planned Unit Development-Residential District (PUD-R). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned Planned Development District (PDD) by Richland County.

    Applicant: Woodcreek Development, LLC

    Staff Recommendation: Annex, Assign Interim Land Use and Interim Zoning; Approval

    PC Recommendation:07/18/17: Annex, Assign Interim Land Use and Interim Zoning; Approval (9-0)

    First reading approval was given on August 15, 2017.

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to give second reading approval to the Annexation, Interim Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment, and Interim Zoning Map Amendment for 4.24 acres, 174 Riding Grove Road and 178 Riding Grove Road, TMS # 28900-01-11(p), 28900-01-10(p), and 28900-01-09(p) **and** Ordinance No.: 2017-068 - Annexing 4.24 acres, 174 Riding Grove Road and 178 Riding Grove Road, Richland County TMS# 28900-01-11(p), 28900-01-10(p) and 28900-01-09(p). Mayor Benjamin abstained from voting due to a potential conflict of interest.

STAFF REPORT

46. Homeless Services - Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director said the agreements for homeless services during the period of July 2017 to June 2018 are on your agenda for approval. She introduced Ms. Sarah Fawcett as the new President and CEO for United Way of the Midlands. She recognized the other service providers who were in attendance.

Mayor Benjamin said we look forward to spending more time over this next year refining and taking on the charitable influence of homelessness and the challenges we have to face together. He thanked the service providers for the work they do for some of the most vulnerable citizens of this City.

RESOLUTIONS

Upon a single motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve **Items 47** through **50**.

47. Resolution No.: R-2017-050 - Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Professional Services Agreement for the Housing First Program between the City of Columbia and the University of South Carolina for Fiscal Year 2017-2018 - *Funding Source: Homeless Services; 1018410 - Approved*

48. Resolution No.: R-2017-070 - Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Professional Services Extension Agreement between the City of Columbia and the United Way of the Midlands for the Regional Coordination of Homeless Services in the Midlands - *Funding Source: Homeless Services; 1018410 - Approved*

49. Resolution No.: R-2017-071 - Authorizing the City Manager to execute an Agreement between the City of Columbia and The Midlands Housing Alliance, Inc. for 2025 Main Street for Fiscal Year 2017-2018 - *Funding Source: Homeless Services; 1018410 - Approved*

50. Resolution No.: R-2017-073 - Authorizing the City Manager to execute an Inclement Weather Center Service Agreement between the City of Columbia and the United Way of the Midlands for operation of the Inclement Weather Center - *Funding Source: Homeless Services; 1018410 - Approved*

51. Resolution No.: R-2017-052 - Adopting a City Street and City Facilities Naming Policy *– Consideration of this item was deferred.*

Councilor Devine expressed concerns about the designations being limited to one per councilmember per year. She suggested that at-large members should have more. She also expressed concerns about the designations having an expiration date and requiring the honoree to have lived or worked in the area.

Councilor McDowell accepted Ms. Devine's amendments to the City Street and City Facilities Naming Policy. The updated policy will be scheduled for Council's consideration on September 19, 2017.

52. Resolution No.: R-2017-087 - Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Letter of Intent between the City of Columbia and Jeannie M. Rubin for the purchase of 1231 Blanding Street, Richland County TMS #09014-03-03 - *Funding Source: 5310000-150100. The original budgeted amount is $772,100.00 - Approved*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2017-087 - Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Letter of Intent between the City of Columbia and Jeannie M. Rubin for the purchase of 1231 Blanding Street, Richland County TMS #09014-03-03.

OTHER MATTERS

53. Council is asked to approve the installation of additional street lighting on Eureka Street and the Highland Park Neighborhood, as requested by the Traffic Engineering Division.

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the installation of additional street lighting on Eureka Street and the Highland Park Neighborhood, as requested by the Traffic Engineering Division.

54. Council is asked to approve a Certificate of Convenience and Necessity, as requested by the Business License Division. Award to Mr. Matthew Koleske doing business as SC Pedal Parlor, LLC located 2077 Pavilion Tower Circle, Columbia, SC 29201. - *The applicant is planning to place one (1) pedicab into service and will add additional pedicabs at a later date.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Rickenmann, Council voted unanimously to approve a Certificate of Convenience and Necessity, as requested by the Business License Division. Award to Mr. Matthew Koleske doing business as SC Pedal Parlor, LLC located 2077 Pavilion Tower Circle, Columbia, SC 29201.

55. Council is asked to allocate up to $250,000 from Liquor Rebate funds for eligible capital expenses for the Hyatt Park Improvement Project. - *Funding Source: Liquor Rebate*

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to allocate up to $250,000 from Liquor Rebate funds for eligible capital expenses for the Hyatt Park Improvement Project.

Councilor Devine recalled that Council wanted to have a work session discussion on the improvements in all parks. She asked that the discussion be scheduled as soon as possible.

APPOINTMENTS

56. Council is asked to approve the appointment of two (2) individuals to the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Mayor Benjamin clarified that there are two appointments and one reappointment for the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Rickenmann and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the reappointment of Mr. Charles Salley and the appointment of Mr. Marcellous Primus and Mr. Josh Speed to the Board of Zoning Appeals.

57. Council is asked to approve the appointment of one (1) individual and to consider the re-appointment of one (1) individual to the Columbia Housing Authority Commission.

Mayor Benjamin said there are two applicants on the Columbia Housing Authority and the Planning Commission who serve quite dutifully and he is interested in reappointing both of them.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the reappointment of Ms. Selena Pickens to the Columbia Housing Authority Commission.

Mayor Benjamin moved the reappointment of Ms. Betsy Watson.

Councilor Duvall said we can’t vote in violation of our own ordinance.

Mayor Benjamin withdrew the motion until the issue is resolved.

58. Council is asked to approve the appointment of one (1) individual to the Columbia Tree & Appearance Commission.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mayor Benjamin, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Mr. Randall Roberts to the Columbia Tree & Appearance Commission as a representative of the engineering profession.

59. Council is asked to approve the appointment of one (1) individual to the Parks and Recreation Foundation.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Mr. Fred Monk to the Parks and Recreation Foundation.

60. Council is asked to approve the appointment of one (1) individual to the Richland County Board of Assessment Appeals.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Rickenmann, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Mr. Scott Lindenberg to the Richland County Board of Assessment Appeals.

61. Council is asked to approve the appointment / re-appointment of one (1) individual to the Planning Commission. – *Consideration of this matter was deferred.*

62. Council is asked to approve the appointment of one (1) individual to the Riverbanks Park Commission.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Mr. Mike Velasco to the Riverbanks Park Commission.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS DISCUSSED DURING THE WORK SESSION

No matters were considered at this time.

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS / REFERRALS

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted five (5) to one (1) to refer a review of terms of appointments and term limits for City Boards and Commissions to the Administrative Policy Committee.

63. Council is asked to refer to the Administrative Policy Committee the consideration of limiting the number of races that occur annually within a neighborhood and requiring race organizers to notify neighborhoods of scheduled races, as requested by The Honorable Ms. Devine.

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to refer the consideration of limiting the number of road races that occur annually within a particular neighborhood and requiring road race organizers to notify neighborhoods of scheduled races to the Administrative Policy Committee. Staff was directed to invite representatives from the Columbia Police Department, Strictly Running and neighborhood associations to the committee meeting.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to amend the previously approved motion to set a moratorium on new applications for sidewalk vending carts by allowing for pending applications to be considered. *(Refer to page 21.)*

APPEARANCE OF THE PUBLIC

No one appeared at this time.

ADJOURN

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting at 7:58 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by:

Erika D. Moore, CMC
City Clerk