



We Are Columbia

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

The Columbia City Council conducted a Budget Workshop on Tuesday, May 31, 2022 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, SC 29201. The Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann, Mayor called the meeting to order at 1:15 p.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr., Mayor Pro-Tempore, The Honorable William Brennan, The Honorable Aditi Bussells, The Honorable Tina N. Herbert, and The Honorable Joe E. Taylor, Jr. The Honorable Howard E. Duvall, Jr. participated remotely. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore Hammond, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the invocation.

CITY COUNCIL DISCUSSION

1. Municipal Court - Ms. Pamela Benjamin, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we will start today with a discussion on Municipal Court. We are looking for confirmation of the direction in which we are going. We have examples for the Columbia Police Department's pay plan options in response to your request for modeling on the two options. I hope that we can leave with clear directions on the option we need to pursue. There are additional items that we would like to go into executive session about. As to the fiscal year 2022/2023 proposed budget, Missy, Jeff and I will take you through discussions regarding the general fund. We are holding discussions regarding the hospitality tax, accommodations tax and council projects.

Mayor Rickenmann said yes, we would like to move that into a work session in July when we have the time to ensure that our decisions benefit the community as a whole.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said you all have the proposal that was previously provided for Municipal Court. We looked into that proposal to include posting the positions for three additional full-time judges. We need to discuss the building's needs. I have reached out to Richland County but I need additional time to hear back from their administrator. Their former chief magistrate Judge Edmond would have been more familiar with the Decker facility and the availability of space. In the interim, we provided preliminary costs to up fit courtroom three, which needs new carpet, painting, and basic repairs. If you are adding three additional fulltime



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

judges, additional staff may be necessary for the Municipal Court, the Columbia Police Department, and the City Attorney's Office. The estimate is around \$400,000. We were thinking about a contractual arrangement for the judges next year.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services said the Support Services Division assessed the court. There is room for more discussion and feedback. We want to ask Judge Mangum and the staff about their needs.

Councilor Duvall asked how the contractual arrangement would work.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said there is the possibility to bring the judges in on a contractual basis. Some of the applicants might be more interested in a contractual arrangement versus coming on as a full-time city employee. There would be savings as well.

Councilor Taylor said it is a contract employee versus a full-time employee. There are retirement rules that make contract employees attractive.

Councilor Herbert asked if all of the contracts would be the same. Are they all committing to 40-hours a week?

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said Council's intention is to reduce the backlog and get three more judges working on a full-time basis, which is 40-hours per week.

Councilor Brennan asked if this will allow us to flex into a night court.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services said that can be discussed with Judge Mangum in terms of the availability of the judges and officers.

Mayor Rickenmann said it would be good to understand if that is an option. You would not have to renovate a third courtroom. We would utilize what we have with a different time structure. We need to know if that is not viable.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said it may still be necessary to up-fit courtroom three regardless of the night court scenario.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said we are using courtroom three at least once every two weeks and it is functional. Everything in the court could use updating. When we have a roster meeting, a judge takes care of pleas and motions. We do not have space for a jury trial, but we do have plenty of cases that are not jury trial cases that we use the courtroom for.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager sought clarification on the use of courtroom three.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said it is a much smaller courtroom. We don't have the capacity to use it as much as we could if we had additional judges. It has all the things we need to be able to do the things that come before the court except for jury trials. We do not have a place for the jury to sit in that courtroom.

Mr. William "Skip" Holbrook, Columbia Police Chief said night court is a great concept. One challenge with court is scheduling. Night court would present more convenient options and create greater efficiency. It comes down to capacity for us. In the daytime, officers are called off the street to come into court. Scheduling would need to be scrutinized.

Mayor Rickenmann said a scheduling process that you could work out with law enforcement and the judicial system could give more flexibility that can help with the caseload.

Councilor Taylor said we are talking about where to land with the suggested judge staffing for fiscal year 2022/2023. We have a full-time chief administrative judge. How many full-time judges?

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services said Judge Mangum was thinking of three additional full-time judges with a salary of \$88,476.

Mayor Rickenmann said we currently have one administrative judge, five regular judges and two substitute judges.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said I talked to you about four judges. We have bond court, preliminary hearings, jury trials, and a courtroom for traffic court and criminal court. Our full-time judges would handle that Monday through Friday. We need part-time judges to fill in for bond court on the weekends. If we move to night court, we will need judges for that. We also have other specialty courts like homeless court, domestic violence court, and quality of life court. My thought was to move three part-time judges to a full-time status and move the substitute judges up to part-time and that would leave four part-time judges to fill in where there



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

is a need for other judges. The four full-time judges would also be responsible for continuances, motions, and drafting orders.

Mayor Rickenmann said that would be four full-time, two part-time, and four substitute judges.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said we won't need substitute judges. They get paid for the time they come to court and that has varied.

Councilor Taylor asked if the full-time judges would rotate some weekends and nights.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said sure.

Councilor McDowell sought clarification on the difference between part-time and substitute judges.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said part-time judges receive city benefits. The substitute judges get paid based on the hours worked and they don't get benefits. Currently, we have two substitute and five part-time judges.

Mayor Rickenmann said we need substitutes who will only get paid if they work.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we have all of these part-time and substitute judges but because they work, the time is not being put in. There is this discussion of having full-time people where this is their only job.

Mayor Rickenmann said we want to ensure that we are dealing with backlog and keeping the court moving. Is the goal to have four full-time and two part-time judges? It doesn't cost us to have substitute judges unless they go in.

Councilor Herbert said I thought the purpose of having full-time judges would be to eliminate the part-time and substitute judges. I want to make sure we are having the effect we want to have.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said part-time judges are working 2 to 17 days per month. If we have four full-time judges, we will need a minimum of two part-time judges. I agree with the Mayor, substitute judges will be needed, as well.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Councilor Bussells said currently, only Chief Mangum's role is full-time. These regular judges (part-time) are working half a month and we are going to create four positions to work 30-days per month. I am not sure why we are talking about part-time judges. We should only have substitutes for the four full-time judges. We are only reworking what we have and calling it something different.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said we need six judges because we have six courts. Every day we have four courts except on Fridays. On Wednesdays we have six different courts going on.

Councilor Herbert clarified that if we have three additional full-time judges, the role of part-time and substitute judges would be when folks are out and maybe weekends and night court.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said it would also be on days when we have more than four courts that the full-time judges are handling.

Mayor Rickenmann asked if we have to do bond court at the Alvin S. Glenn Detention Center.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said yes and we do bond court 365 days per year.

Mayor Rickenmann said I am back to having four full-time judges and two part-time or substitute judges.

Councilor Bussells said part-time comes with benefits and substitutes get paid a fee for service.

Councilor Herbert asked if a part-time judge can be considered a substitute judge if an emergency arises.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said we go to our part-time judges first. We use substitute judges as little as possible but we are currently using them more than we ever have. Part-time judges are salaried but there are conflicts with part-time judges in private practice.

Councilor Taylor said some of the problem is with the titles. I wouldn't care if you had as many substitute judges as you want as long as they are kept under 30 hours a week. They are not FTEs and they won't get benefits.



We Are Columbia

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said as long as I have been at the city, there has always been a lot of judges. If you are going to full-time and they will be working everyday then I don't understand why we are having problems if we are maximizing them other than them. If these four are going to work full-time that's great. I think substitute would be better because they are not a FTE.

Mayor Rickenmann said we have seven judges and the regular judges aren't working full-time.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we need to be doing something so that we don't continue to have the same issues going forward. Either you have the capacity or you don't. I don't understand why we are running six courts on one day but we don't have enough people. Why are we having that many courts on a certain day?

Councilor Taylor said it would help us to have a sample schedule. You only have three courtrooms.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said we do preliminary hearings virtually.

Councilor Taylor asked Judge Mangum to build a typical weekly schedule including weekends and taking into account vacation, sick leave and those types of situations. Then the question becomes how many substitute judges are needed to augment the four full-time judges. It is mandated that the substitute judges stay under 30-hours per week.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager added that they need to come when you need them to come.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge clarified that the current judges are working harder than they have ever worked. They are scheduled for more courts and our part-time judges make \$36,000 per year.

Councilor Taylor said we started down this road to address the backlog. This council and staff are committed to doing something. We have to do it in a financial way that works for all of us.

Councilor McDowell said the central theme is that we have a voluminous backlog of cases and we have not handled those things in a fiduciary way. What do we need to reduce the backlog?

Councilor Herbert said it would be helpful to see the plan to reduce the backlog. My concern is bringing on part-time folks and not needing them after the backlog is reduced. I sent an email



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

about the cases we are moving now versus what you anticipate we will be able to move and the need to have part-time judges on an ongoing basis. I recommend that we use substitute judges. We don't know what reducing the backlog is going to look like. We need you all to give us that vision.

Ms. Jessica Mangum, Chief Administrative Judge said judges don't schedule cases. The judges are available and will be in the courtroom whenever needed. I don't schedule cases. That comes through the city manager and court administration.

Mayor Rickenmann said we need some clarity. We can't make a decision on exactly what's needed. On multiple days we have multiple courts. We still have bond court at Alvin S. Glen and somebody has to go out there. We need to understand how this will affect the backlog. There seems to be disconnect on how we are going to schedule that. The administrator and the chief judge need to provide us with a structure. It is crazy to hire four people and think it will be fixed. We need a more strategic plan to address that. It will affect our officers, expenses, and courtroom needs. We need to fix that third courtroom. I suggest that we get a plan that shows how the schedule will work, how the cases will get done, and how it will affect the backlog.

Councilor Taylor said ARPA funds may be the right source for fixing the courtrooms.

Councilor Herbert said the proposal needs to include night court.

Councilor McDowell said I buy into the development of a strategic plan. If we have cases dating back to 2012, we have dropped the ball. The plan needs to be inclusive and intentional.

Councilor Herbert said that would also help the Richland County Public Defender's Office. It will help them plan, as well.

Mayor Rickenmann asked Ms. Wilson to have Ms. Jackson and Judge Mangum provide a courtroom plan with a proposed schedule and a strategy for addressing the backlog while handling the day-to-day cases.

Councilor Taylor said we will need a budget for the estimated costs. We need to consolidate the prosecutorial part, the public defender part, the judge part and the capital part. Ms. Jackson, make a recommendation on how we administrate this and knock the backlog down. How is our call for judges?



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services said on Friday, we had seven applications; three of them were from current judges.

Councilor Duvall said it is my understanding that the majority of the 6,000 cases we have on backlog will never come to trial. We have to go through a labor intensive process to clear the back log. Our goal should be not to further increase the backlog.

2. Columbia Police Department Pay Plan Options - Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said Ms. Benjamin will take you through a couple of examples of the options that we presented at the last meeting. We will have additional discussions of related topics in executive session.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services said there are several different scenarios that we can implement in order to execute a new pay plan for the Columbia Police Department. Last week, we talked about moving officers to new pay grades. I provided an example of what that looks like. The plan is to implement steps and break the Police Department out into its own plan with new pay grades. We discussed two implementation strategies. First you have to take everybody to the new proposed pay grade and the new proposed minimums. Once you take an officer to the new pay grade, then you have to determine how to place them on the new step. One option is to do range penetration. If an officer is at 20% in their old pay range, you move them to 20% in their new pay range. In order to be cost effective, we will cap that at 10%. The second option is to use years to move an officer to the appropriate step. Based on an officers years of service, they will be placed on a step that corresponds with the years of service. Through modeling, we found that the hybrid option gives the officers more money based on their years of service. An officer who came here relatively recently, received pay increases and it moved them further in their ranges. Officers who have been here for a longer period were not given those increases and they are not as far into their ranges. Giving them credit for their years of service removes some of the compression and puts them in a range that's commensurate with their time and experience. Once we establish where people are, we start on the steps. There is a 3.4% increase for every step. Once we get them to where they will be, they will start at step one.

There was an in-depth review of two examples with the members of Council.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Councilor Duvall asked if the hybrid option starts in January and the range penetration option starts in July.

Mayor Rickenmann said we have to discuss that.

Councilor Taylor asked if there is any way to simplify this to make it easier for staff to understand.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services said once we settle on it, we will make it easier to understand. We will hold lots of meetings. Which approach do we want to take? My recommendation is to use the hybrid model.

Councilor Taylor asked Chief Holbrook if this will solve our retention issues.

Mr. William “Skip” Holbrook, Columbia Police Chief said yes, it is the most progressive pay option I have ever seen. You want to know what you make when you get here and in five or ten years. You want to know what your maximum earning opportunities are and it shows you the path to that.

Councilor Taylor said we need to put in levels of expectations for where we want to be with the net increase of force over the next budget year. As we increase the level of the force, we need to bring the overtime down in all departments. We need to make sure our folks are getting the medical assistance they need to reduce the amount of leave we take. I am with you on this one.

Councilor Brennan asked Ms. Benjamin if we will continue with take home cars in this budget if we move forward with this package.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services said yes, I think that has been budgeted as a phase-in.

Councilor Brennan asked if opportunities for officers to have off-duty hourly work is separate.

Mayor Rickenmann answered that is totally separate. Let’s target the beginning of September to allow time to work out the kinks and adjustments.

Councilor Taylor said as part of this, I would love to get a report back on the earning potential; not just the salary. Are we requiring overtime? If so, how does that factor in? How much optional overtime is there?



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said Chief Holbrook drafted a memo that answers some of those questions.

Councilor Taylor asked if USC pays the officers directly or do they pay the city.

Mr. William “Skip” Holbrook, Columbia Police Chief said they are off-duty and USC pays the officers directly.

Councilor McDowell said the model is very doable. The only issue is time parameters. The hybrid model offers potential possibilities. Is September a doable date? We need to do it as expeditious as possible.

Councilor Herbert said the hybrid model will have beneficial effects for current employees. The new folks seem happy because they come in on a good number. It will go a long way if long time employees know and understand that there is value to the years of service.

Mr. William “Skip” Holbrook, Columbia Police Chief said the hybrid model targets that audience that we struggle to retain.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager agreed that the hybrid model is best. I want to be clear about how much it costs. When you start getting into the complexity of pay plans, the hybrid model is the best way to go. We are costing the hybrid model at 50% a year starting in January 2023. We showed you all around \$3 million, which is what we need to stick with.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services explained that it will cost \$866,152 to adjust everybody’s salary to the minimum. This is a one-time cost. That figure adds to the personnel budget for the Police Department going forward.

Councilor Taylor said the Police Department has 36 vacancies.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said whatever we do, you will have to model that out for the positions Chief has to fill.

Councilor Taylor asked if these vacancies are funded in the budget.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said yes, they will be funded and that is why it is important for me to understand which model you want to go with.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Councilor Taylor said you have some offset from those salaries unless you are putting them in there as filled at a schedule over the course of 12 months.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said he is aspiring to net 60 and we are going to budget for that.

Councilor Bussells asked about the recurring costs.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager clarified that \$866,152 is part of the first step to bring them to the minimum. It will be built into the range penetration or hybrid model. That will be your annualized cost.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services said the class year parity gives them credit for being in their current classification. That is \$2 million. They are given 100% year-to-year for their hire year. The \$3 million was half. For the hybrid model, you take half of the difference between their years of service and the years in their class and add it to their years of service. The total is \$3.143 million for 50% of their years of service. If we do 25%, it is \$2.49 million. If you do 100%, it is \$4.8 million. We have flexibility to make adjustments.

Mayor Rickenmann said the hybrid model creates a balance. It levels the playing field and it provides a roadmap for succession planning. This is what we were looking for.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, CPM, Assistant City Manager for Administrative Services said the costing is different based on how much weight you put on the years of service whether it is 100%, 50% or 25%. They are all hybrid and based on the weight you want to give the years of service.

Mr. William "Skip" Holbrook, Columbia Police Chief said my recommendation is the hybrid model. The discussion right now is what value you are putting on a year for service.

There was an in-depth review of the options.

Mr. William "Skip" Holbrook, Columbia Police Chief clarified that we would not have the capacity to hire and train more than 60 people. We will lose people through regular attrition. We want to create better retention with a 5% to 7% attrition rate based on normal retirements. There are certain things that I cannot control.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Councilor Taylor said if you are replacing folks and adding folks and 60 is the maximum number you can get through the academy then 60 is not the number you will hit. What is your goal for the net increase of the sworn officer force at the end of next year?

Councilor Herbert asked what normal retirements look like versus what we are dealing with right now.

Major George Drafts, Columbia Police Department said it is between 7 to 12 resignations per year. The number fluctuates.

Councilor Taylor asked if the net increase is 35 to 40.

Mr. William “Skip” Holbrook, Columbia Police Chief said yes. It is a combination of improving attrition and maintaining our pace of hiring. I will determine the number and report back to you.

Councilor Taylor said we should have a level of expectation if we are going to do this new program. I am uncomfortable with redoing the compensation plan without having a number.

Mr. William “Skip” Holbrook, Columbia Police Chief said in our budget session I talked about the national average departures increasing to 18% and we are no different. We can forecast and plan for retirements. We have a precise number of folks who are retirement eligible. As we read exit interviews we look at the different factors that cause people to leave. We have to quantify the factors that we can control. I would like to see us shorten our recruiting and hiring time because we have lost people to other agencies that hire quicker. We can control that. We have to drill down on that net number that you can hold me accountable for.

Mayor Rickenmann said we want to see an increased number of sworn officers. It is on all of us.

Councilor Taylor said we talked about things that have handicapped us. We need a barometer to determine if it is working. I challenge the Human Resources Department and the Columbia Police Department to add in what you can make as a contract deal at \$35 an hour. That is a good income supplement.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said Chief Holbrook is basing his answer off what was and not what we are about to become for doing this. You will have to think about this and base your answer on becoming a capital city police agency and the Police Department that now has this [plan]. You said we are the only ones doing this and that Myrtle Beach is going to a minimum of



We Are Columbia

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

\$50,000. The difference is that they are not incorporating the steps. We need to base our net on what we are doing beyond bringing it to the minimum. We are forecasting for individuals who want to go into law enforcement. We need to forecast what it will look like for them in the years to come, if they want to get promoted, if they want to stay a master police officer, or if they want to get off-duty pay. When you market those things, take that into account when you give this infamous number to us on what you want to achieve. That is a different story to tell to someone who wants to come and work for the Columbia Police Department.

3. Fiscal Year 2022/2023 Proposed Budget - Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management, and Grants Director

- a. *General Fund Proposed Budget*
- b. *Parking Capital Projects*
- c. *Hospitality Tax*
- d. *Community Promotions*

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we want to wrap up a few loose ends. We have given you all of the departments. There are a few other highlights and back office functions. There are a few slides based off the memo that was sent.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said we are wrapping up a few items in the general fund. We will review all of the operating funds that have come before you. The proposed general fund budget is \$164.8 million. It does not include a property tax or any other rate increases.

Councilor Taylor asked if this includes Municipal Court or the Police Department yet.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said no.

Councilor Taylor asked if it includes the \$3 million carry forward from the previous year.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said it includes \$3 million in surplus as part of the revenues and transfers-in. The public hearing is scheduled for June 7, 2022. There are a number of key investments in line with City Council's strategic priorities. Public Safety makes up 46% of the total general fund budget, Public Works is 13%, general governmental departments are at 14% and Parks and Recreation is 8%.

Councilor Taylor requested a graph to show personnel costs.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said yes, I will do that for each fund. The Public Relations, Marketing and Media Department is consolidating existing resources to focus on citywide marketing communications and social media platforms. The Office of the City Clerk will replace the citizen services application. The Governmental Affairs budget is an increase of \$141,000 for two additional lobbyist contracts.

Mayor Rickenmann said those contracts ended July 1; we are not obligated to any contract at this point. This is a work session item. We need to discuss how to move forward and structuring options.

Councilor Herbert asked if the issue is additional funding or do you want to start from scratch.

Councilor Taylor said start from scratch.

Councilor Bussells said I have a concern with the additional \$141,000. That is a significant investment already and when we look at some of the other needs, I would like for us to revisit the number of lobbyists we have locally.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said the \$141,000 is what we paid for the lobbyists. The new lobbyists were brought on in the last fiscal year.

Councilor Taylor said I want to look at replacing the lobbyists with our own internal lobbyist who can serve as an external affairs person and when the legislature is not in session, they can help you manage relationships with other governmental entities.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager clarified that we are going to move forward with an amount and have an additional discussion at some point even if it is after July.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said you are not approving the contracts today, you are approving a budget that reflects the cost of those contracts. That is true for any item in this case. The allocations could be adjusted as we bring the contracts forward for renewal.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said the budget assumes the amount we paid the previous fiscal year. They may have requested more, but we typically incorporate what we paid previously until you have time to take up those contracts.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Councilor Taylor said I was disappointed with our efforts at the State House this year and we have to find a better way to do that. I am not sure we got what we paid for. There are things the Mayor and staff had to handle that should have been handled by our lobbyists.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said Human Resources will focus on recruitment and streamlining and improving the onboarding of employees.

Mayor Rickenmann said we need goals. We have to build in expectations about the outcomes.

Councilor Taylor asked for the budgeted number of expected new hires. It is supposed to be a zero based budget.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said our target is 400.

Councilor Herbert said I would prefer to know how many you plan to hire and retain.

Councilor Taylor said there is a significant increase from last year to the next year. I want to get a feel for how much of this is additional people.

Councilor Brennan asked if the \$24 million for the Fire Department is our contribution to the contract.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said this is the city's portion of the contract and that reflects operations at city fire stations.

Councilor Brennan asked for the total budget with the county's funding.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said \$21.5 million has been requested from the county for approval.

Councilor Taylor asked about the One City: Future Ready Program.

Ms. Tiniece P. Jarvis, Ed.D., Human Resources Director said it is a program we started with Richland School District One where we have gone into the schools to create a pathway for kids who don't want to go the four-year college track. We currently have eight kids.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said the Office of Business Opportunities' proposed budget does not include specific allocations for the commercial retention and redevelopment program. It will be considered for a one-time allocation if the program is to go forward.

Councilor Herbert asked what is available now.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said they have committed all of the funds that are available to them. There are no available funds for allocation.

Councilor Herbert asked if this is the old Façade Program.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said yes and you all spoke about this at the last Economic and Community Development Committee meeting so we put a note at the end about potentially allocating funds towards it. There was an interest in encouraging certain sectors based on the needs of a corridor versus the way we have done it in the past.

Councilor Herbert said based on the funding from ARPA, is this something we need to decide now.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said no.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said the allocations for external agencies are at the current year's funding levels. There are no changes in funding for the Fifth Circuit Solicitor, the Fifth Circuit Public Defender and the Alvin S. Glenn Detention Center per diem. Last year, we paid over \$400,000 to the Alvin S. Glenn Detention Center.

Mayor Rickenmann said it was \$403,000 in 2021 and we budgeted \$500,000 this year.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said the rate hasn't increased in several years. The current rate is \$71 per inmate/per day.

Councilor Taylor said something is not equitable about us having to accept and carry the social cost of homelessness in the county. We have to arrest them, take them back, and then we have to pay. We need to have a discussion on this. It's not just Richland County; it is all of the municipalities and government entities. Bearing the social and fiscal cost is not equitable. That is something to look at as we enter the new fiscal year.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Mayor Rickenmann said the Public Defender has consistently requested an increase. We have an increase this year.

Councilor Herbert said this number does not contemplate the plan.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said the amount here is not in anticipation of anything changing. They were waiting to submit those amounts once they have an idea about the number of additional public defenders they will need to hire. We have an obligation to fund the Public Defender.

Ms. Teresa Knox, Esq., City Attorney said the Public Defender is requesting the same amount. If changes are made, they will request an additional attorney and our office will need an additional prosecutor.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said Community Promotions is an allocation from the general fund for grants for external groups. We have not funded a community promotions allocation in some time. Our recommendation is to issue a notice of funds available through a grant program based upon direction from City Council in terms of parameters.

Mayor Rickenmann said the reason I asked for community promotions is for grants to enhance neighborhood and corridor cleanups, plantings, and engagement. I am not looking for this to be open to all organizations. I want this to be targeted on building back pride and beautification in our neighborhoods and giving them opportunities. A lot of neighborhood signage is rotting. I want to make sure folks are engaged and that neighborhoods have sweat equity. We have to talk about how to move that forward.

Councilor Herbert asked if this is for neighborhoods or non-profits.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said historically, community promotions has been for non-profits. Mayor Rickenmann has been discussing a separate program with us. I was thinking about using CDBG funds to fund eligible neighborhoods. I am getting other requests from some of you for non-profits. You can do it however you choose. In previous years, Council specified what to use the community promotions for.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said we can propose parameters around the grant structure and get Council's guidance on the type of grants you want to make before we release a notice. It would be similar to how we do the hospitality tax.

Councilor Bussells said I don't want it to be folks who missed the hospitality tax deadline and then apply for this if it is open to all nonprofits.

Councilor Herbert said we used to have action grants for the neighborhoods. We need both. Use CDBG for that. I don't know how far \$140,000 goes.

Councilor Duvall said Tina and I met twice with a group out Broad River Road that is doing an afterschool and summer program. They have 50 youth from two housing complexes in the city. The site is not in the city. They asked us to consider support for that group. I would like to at least give them an opportunity to make a case for a decent amount of funding.

Councilor Herbert said I am tracking four organizations that are trying to do things with youth. It would be good to have an opportunity to let them go through a process that we aren't involved in.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said we can bring parameters back to City Council for future discussion.

Councilor Taylor said we have a robust summer program in our parks system. Do we want to compete with our parks or lead those youth into programs at our parks?

Mr. Henry Simons, MHA, Assistant City Manager for Operations said the program that Mr. Duvall is referring to is for a targeted population that the Mayor of Irmo has been working with. That is different from what we created for our summer programs.

Councilor Bussells requested an update on the availability of CDBG funding.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager noted that there is \$300,000 in fund balance from the Resilient Columbia Non-Profit Stabilization Program. Those were general fund dollars and there are a couple of requests that may be appropriate for that funding as well. Do you want to lump that together for a NOFA or keep it separate?



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Mayor Rickenmann said we should talk about that as we build criteria. This should be to fill some gaps and make sure there is benefit to the community.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said the budget currently includes \$1,060,000 for homeless services. The total requests are \$1,061,000, which would cover operation of the Inclement Weather Center, the Transitions contract, and Supportive Housing. The United Way is the prime contractor for the Inclement Weather Center and the services are subcontracted out. The Inclement Weather Center is ran at the behest of the city.

Mayor Rickenmann asked about the \$50,000 for travel vouchers.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director explained that it is not only for travel vouchers. The Inclement Weather Center has year round operations. We previously had two contacts with United Way: one for the regional coordinator and one for the operations of the Inclement Weather Center. The regional coordinator was being provided through a staff person at Transitions as a subcontract. Part of that contract included travel vouchers for individuals who needed to get back home. The budget for that is \$10,000. The contract for the Inclement Weather Center is approximately \$450,000. The outlier is that they are waiting on cost proposals for security services which increased significantly.

Councilor Taylor said I don't have an issue with the amounts, but I don't want to imply that we are approving these contracts. The details need to be worked out and some of them need to be coordinated through our Task Force to Prevent and End Homelessness. I wonder if the more we spend, the more homeless we have. I trust Dr. Bussells to come up with a solution.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said Dr. Bussells made a valiant effort at the first task force meeting to put on the table that those items would still have to be discussed. I did say that this would be an opportunity to go through the scopes of work, see if the urgent needs are being addressed or if we need to make changes.

Councilor Taylor said I want the record to reflect that we approved this amount of funding for homeless services but not specific amounts to entities.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said historically they have been line items, but we haven't had this effort or this task force. This is the opportunity to revisit that.

Councilor Herbert said the line item is just homeless services.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Councilor Taylor said we have to look at accountability issues for one provider.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we have historically budgeted approximately one million dollars for homeless services. Because these contracts have carried on over a period of time, it has been implied that they are line items, but now you all are going through a different effort.

Councilor Taylor said we have approved amounts for other departments and issues and said we will revisit the allocation within that amount. I would like to make the same reference on homeless services.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager added that any contractual item over \$50,000 is not approved until a contract comes before you.

Councilor Bussells said we need to be clear that we are revisiting how we may be approaching how we fund homeless services. It is important to recognize we are continuing to put over one million dollars towards homelessness. If you count CDBG and ARPA funds, that doubles to three or four million dollars. The committee work will help us get more understanding.

Councilor Herbert asked if the contracts end with the fiscal year.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said these contracts do.

Councilor McDowell said the issue is accountability. I will not call any names, but if it were left up to me based on their track record, I would ask them to put some skin in the game. If skin is not in the game, then I don't think it is worth funding because it is not working. Services are not being provided in a fiduciary way.

Councilor Taylor concurred.

Councilor Bussells asked about the reporting requirement for contracts approved in the general fund. Who reviews that? Is there an end of contract report? Do they receive feedback?

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said there are all kinds of contracts throughout the city and all should have project managers through the department. With the homeless services contracts, historically the providers come before the Council with an annual report on activities from the previous year and in the context of what their request is for the next fiscal year. We schedule



We Are Columbia

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

those after the start of the new fiscal year. With the process you all are going through, some of this could be funneled through the task force. Typically, Missy is charged with receiving the reports, we review them and then they come to Council.

Mayor Rickenmann said we want accountability measures and outcomes with our partners. Unless we spell it out in a contract, we are not going to get that.

Councilor Taylor said the task force should specify the outcomes.

Councilor Bussells said we don't have the capacity to have a project officer or someone dedicated to following the progression of how much change they are making or if they are making any change at all. We can create the measures but is there follow-up. I was trying to open up the discussion of building in accountability and something that is meaningful.

Councilor McDowell said over the years, we have given the money. What is the historical data that will help us define what the providers are giving us. We can't accurately fund anything without knowing what the providers have done and what they are doing.

Councilor Herbert recalled that when the city first began funding these contracts, they went through Community Development and Jeff Rainwater helped to get those contracts started. When he left, we didn't give that assignment to anyone.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said those grants are still managed through Community Development. These contracts are of a different nature.

Councilor Bussells said these contracts are not administered through Community Development.

Councilor Taylor asked how these contracts are paid.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said I administer these contracts. They request an advance for the Inclement Weather Center and they draw from that advance for the first quarter. After that, everything is done by monthly reimbursements. The same is true for Housing First. The Transitions contract is based on quarterly reimbursements.

Councilor Taylor asked to standardize the payment and a formalized review process.

Councilor Herbert said my only concern is dealing with the cash flow of the entities.



We Are Columbia

**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022**

Councilor Taylor said one criteria may be the prevention of criminal activity within a certain place. I wonder if the good of the cause takes precedent over the good of the community. There should be a review of all grants and contracts paid for with city funds. There are things that we should add to the homeless services contracts that will give our law enforcement the ability to create accountability if needed.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said our new grants administrator will help with all of that.

Councilor Bussells said I would like to meet with the grants administrator to discuss mechanisms for accountability specifically in the homelessness grants. Councilman Taylor wants to review the homelessness contracts along with all of the other ways we administer contracts in the general fund with the Administrative Policy Committee. After feedback from the task force on accountability measures, I want to talk with Missy and her new staff member.

Councilor Brennan asked if the contract renewals will come in the next 30-days.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said they would have but the city's contracted homeless service providers are due to present to the task force in August. We have already let them know that there may be delays.

Councilor Brennan said the final report of the task force will set the path to where we want to go as a Council and we can compare that to where the scope.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager asked if we are approving the contracts in July.

Mayor Rickenmann said we haven't received all of the information. The task force needs an opportunity to look at it.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager asked Dr. Bussells if she wants the current service providers to present at the task force.

Councilor Bussells said yes, we always talked about August 30.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said typically when they present it is in the context of them getting direction on their contract for services.

Councilor Taylor said the contract has to be reviewed by the Administrative Policy Committee.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Councilor Herbert said maybe the Economic and Community Development Committee should review the contracts as opposed to the Administrative Policy Committee.

Councilor Taylor said it is to make sure the grant is done in a way that is acceptable, not the outcomes.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said they go to the Legal Department. Are all contracts going to the Administrative Policy Committee?

Councilor Taylor said I don't know if the deliverables on grants and contracts have been what we expected. I don't want to look at all contracts.

Councilor Herbert said it would be helpful if we give the service providers input on what the expectation is so they can see that it is different this time. I want to be efficient in our process.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said this is a different conversation. I don't know what the task force process is going to unveil.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said the contracts were born from a request for proposals in 2014.

Mayor Rickenmann said we want to make sure there are achievable outcomes and accountability. This is taxpayer money and they want to see impact. We are seeing a lot more impact affecting people's quality of life. The homeless are also experiencing things. We want to know that the money we are spending is making a difference. Maybe we should put out a new RFP.

Councilor Bussells said I want to discuss this at our next task force meeting. My goal is to be able to provide feedback to providers by July so that they have a clear understanding of what they are presenting on in August and what direction we are going in. We have put multimillion dollars towards this. We may be approaching it with a new process because it is an evolving problem. Grants and contracts are not synonymous. I want us to think about these service contracts as grants. It is about seeing change over time on outcomes. It is an investment over time and we want to be able to show outcomes over time.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said next is the capital replacement program which is the general fund replacement schedule for rolling stock such as vehicles and heavy equipment. Some years include technology upgrades for hardware.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Mayor Rickenmann asked how many items are in this budget.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said 119 vehicles and heavy equipment.

Councilor Taylor requested a work session to explain how the capital lease program works.

Mayor Rickenmann also requested a work session on capital improvement projects and budgets. We can discuss how improvements can be made, if we want to move forward on some of the items that are listed, or move forward with items that are more critical.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director clarified that we will include a description of how the capital replacement program works and proceed with vehicle purchases. Being able to continue this program is critical.

Mayor Rickenmann said we need to order the vehicles because there is already a waiting period.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director reported on the budgets for the component units which are the city's development corporations. It is a total allocation of \$1.1 million which is the city's portion of their budgets. It reflects the consolidation of the corporations into two entities; one focuses on commercial and the other focuses on residential.

Councilor Brennan asked if we have finalized the consolidation of the real estate inventory.

Councilor Herbert requested a work session to make sure that the development corporations are working with the city to achieve the goals of the city.

Ms. Missy Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Development said we have not tidied up the consolidation. The Columbia Development Corporation decided to become independent. We are down to four corporations that are merging into two. The process is well underway. Part of this effort is to streamline things. Working with two boards instead of five will help us provide our vision and make sure they are adhering to that vision.

Councilor Bussells clarified that we no longer fund the one that went independent.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Ms. Missy Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Development said we do not. The Two Notch Development Corporation (TNDC) and Columbia Housing Development Corporation (CHDC) are merging into our residential corporation. The Columbia Empowerment Zone (CEZ) will be our commercial corporation. The Eau Claire Development Corporation (ECDC) will divide assets into those two remaining corporations. A lot of the ECDC board members have already rolled onto one of the other two boards.

Councilor Brennan asked for a list of the projects the two corporations are working on.

Ms. Missy Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Development said yes along with a list of properties owned and managed. We mainly fund their personnel and equipment costs. They are city employees.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said next is the proposed general fund capital improvement program. We included a list of requests that include General Services for city facilities.

Mayor Rickenmann said we talked about taking this up when we have time to go through all of it.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said the list is provided as information. There are no funds in the current proposed budget for these projects. This will be taken up at another time. They could be funded from fund balance. We are clarifying that these are general fund facilities.

Councilor Bussells asked if we have \$15 million to work with for all of these projects including the capital improvement program.

Ms. Missy Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Development said you have a larger request under the capital improvement program some of which could be funded from fund balance if you choose to. We are considering grants and other funding sources.

Councilor Taylor asked if funding for pending commitments is considered as money that has been spent.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said yes, but we did not want to make assumptions.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022

Councilor Bussells said I would like to push for the gateways.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said this is also a list of pending commitments we would consider taking up at another time.

Councilor Taylor asked if funding for Quiet Zones pays for the whole thing.

Ms. Missy Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Development said based on projections from the railroad we are short for phase one which includes 14 crossings. We have been working with the railroads. Senator Harpootlian's office has been trying to help get that number down. There is still a gap of \$1.2 million to complete the project.

Councilor Taylor said I was told by Senator Harpootlian that \$814,000 was needed from the city.

Ms. Missy Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Development said that was based on the railroad giving recommendations which were not practical. The gap is currently \$1.2 million.

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said the list was previously provided. As indicated by the mayor, we will bring this back up in July. No additional discussion is needed on the hospitality tax or accommodations tax. The committees are set to meet.

Councilor Taylor requested updates on the tourism development fee and the accommodations tax state statute.

Ms. Missy Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Development said the proposed parking capital improvement program is being provided as information.

Mayor Rickenmann asked when the parking rate study will come back.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said probably at the end of June.

Councilor Taylor asked if we can move forward with exterior painting, stucco repairs, and power washing versus deferring this until we have the capital discussion.

Mr. Kelvin Keisler, General Services Director said we will move forward with pressure washing. The painting and stucco are not in the budget. It is estimated at \$400,000.



We Are Columbia

**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 31, 2022**

Ms. Missy Caughman, Budget, Program Management and Grants Director said we would not recommend spending down all of the parking cash available. We are comfortable with \$400,000 and \$600,000 for the elevators. We can incorporate that into the budget. The last item provides background information about the city. The budget public hearing is on Tuesday, June 7, 2022.

Mayor Rickenmann asked the city clerk to coordinate calendars for work sessions in July. We can stretch into August, if we need to. We will not have a work session on June 28, 2022.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 4:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted:

Erika D. Moore Hammond, CMC
City Clerk