



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

The Columbia City Council met for a Work Session on Tuesday, May 16, 2017 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina. The Honorable Mayor Pro Tempore Tameika Isaac Devine called the meeting to order at 12:41 p.m. The following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Howard E. Duvall, Jr., The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. and The Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin arrived at 1:15 p.m. The Honorable Moe Baddourah was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the Invocation.

FINANCIAL REPORT

1. Ms. Jan Alonso, Finance Director was present to answer questions regarding the March 2017 Financial Report. - *There were no questions at this time.*

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to enter into Executive Session at 12:44 p.m. for the discussion of **Items 2** through **4** and adding the discussion of a council funding request to **Item 3**.

2. Discussion of negotiations incident to proposed contractual arrangements pursuant to §30-4-70(a)(2)
 - *Employee Health Center*
3. Receipt of legal advice related to matters covered by attorney-client privilege pursuant to §30-4-70(a)(2)
 - *Candidate Filing Fees*
4. Discussion of matters relating to the proposed location, expansion, or the provision of services encouraging location or expansion of industries or other businesses in the area served by the public body pursuant to §30-4-70(a)(5)
 - *Incentives*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to adjourn the Executive Session at 1:16 p.m. Mayor Benjamin was present at this time.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

FISCAL YEAR 2017/2018 BUDGET WORKSHOP

5. 2017 Summer Work Experience Leadership Program - Mr. J. T. McLawhorn, President & CEO of the Columbia Urban League

Mr. J. T. McLawhorn, President & CEO of the Columbia Urban League explained that the Summer Work Experience Leadership Program is not a social initiative; it is an economic development initiative, because it speaks to a healthy community and a high quality life. This relationship with the City of Columbia began in the 1980s after a highly publicized drive-by shooting incident on Broad River Road. We realized that youth employment was a key component of our intervention and for developing young people. The target for the 2017/2018 budget is to employ 700 youth. He recalled that the water bill inset for the program began 25 years ago and we have an opportunity to effectively promote the program through an ad company.

Councilor McDowell said the youth will gain a wealth of experience. He asked that the budget be scaled down from 700 participants. He suggested that businesses be asked to sponsor a child or to donate funds.

Mr. J. T. McLawhorn, President & CEO of the Columbia Urban League agreed to scale the program back. He noted that several churches currently sponsor youth. He said the program was funded this summer by Wells Fargo at \$100,000, Bank of America at \$25,000 and Richland County at \$75,000. He clarified that funding is needed for the summer of 2018.

Mayor Benjamin said this gives us an opportunity to encourage everyone to participate through the water bill insert over the next two quarters of this year; to promote public sector participation; and for us to ask for private sector participation to support the program as well.

Councilor Devine said we need to enter into a contract for service with clear understanding on where the City's money will go.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager asked Mr. McLawhorn if any funds are needed for this summer.

Mr. J. T. McLawhorn, President & CEO of the Columbia Urban League said no; we will serve 400 kids with the budget for this summer.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

6. Update from Senior Resources - Ms. Pam Dukes, Executive Director of Senior Resources

Ms. Pam Dukes, Executive Director of Senior Resources reported that over 91,000 hot and frozen meals were served last year through the Meals on Wheels Program and as of April 30, 2017, over 101,000 meals have been served. She also reported that assistance is provided to the frailest seniors through the Home Care Program and there are 173 seniors currently on that waiting list. Senior Resources operates four wellness centers in Richland County; a foster grandparents and senior companions program; a new service called Senior Wheels that provides transportation to medical appointments and related services; and a food co-op at Park Street Baptist Church and Greenview Park along with other food services. With help from the City of Columbia, the Meals on Wheels waiting list was reduced from 271 in July 2016 to 84 in May 2017. She reported that South Carolina ranks fourth worst in the nation for seniors facing hunger and food insecurity. More than 2,000 elderly in Columbia will go to bed hungry tonight. Funding is received for Senior Resources through the Lieutenant Governor's Office on Aging and through the Older Americans Act. We are the designated Council on Aging for Richland County. We are the only provider of Meals on Wheels. It costs \$1,920 to serve Meals on Wheels to one senior per year. We need approximately \$170,000 to eliminate the waiting list. Senior Resources received \$135,000 from the City of Columbia last year. She noted that one meal per day is served through Meals on Wheels five days a week. In closing, she presented Mayor Benjamin with thank you cards from Senior Resources participants for helping to secure a \$25,000 donation from the Wal-Mart Foundation for senior food last year; for distributing food boxes to seniors; and for serving at the senior companions and foster grandparents in-service day.

7. All Funds Summary & Wrap-up - Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we are looking forward to some hard discussions and definite feedback to wrap-up the General Fund.

There was a consensus of Council to cancel the June 6, 2017 Work Session and Council Meeting and to conduct an evening meeting on June 13, 2017 only for the Budget Public Hearing and first reading of the budget ordinances.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director reported that the total proposed operating budget for fiscal year 2017/2018 is \$329,857,239 for the General Fund, Parking Fund, Storm Water, Water & Sewer, Hospitality and Accommodations. The largest portion is Water & Sewer at 47% and the General Fund at 44%. The 2036 Vision Statement focus areas and goals were used to guide the City Manager's budget recommendations. She presented a listing of the City's obligations, immediate needs and wants. There are two (2)



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

proposed budgets for the General Fund: the City Manager's proposed budget and an alternative budget, both of which are in balance using different approaches. The City Manager's proposed budget includes mid-year cost of living adjustments and implementation of the step based pay for the Public Safety Retention Program, but the alternative budget does not. The City Manager's proposed budget includes the 2 mills that were lost in 2014. She reviewed the estimated General Fund revenues, transfers in at 3% of the total budget, and other financing sources. The decrease is due to the reduction in the capital replacement program from \$8 million to \$4 million. The total alternative budget includes revenues at \$141 million and does not include the millage increase. Each mill will generate approximately \$560,000. She reviewed the budget highlights, noting that the most widespread increases are for health care and state retirement for both the City and its employees. She reviewed the General Fund expenditures by department with Public Safety making up the largest portion of the budget.

Councilor Duvall proposed the adoption of the City Manager's budget recapturing the 2 mills, because there are 6.5 mills that we can capture this year or we will lose them. All of our employees need to have livable wages and I would like to get the cost of living adjustment back to July 1st for a full year increase. We have to face the reality of our healthcare costs; we can't continue to have a \$30 million hit on our budgets. We need to push our consultants to look at ways to reduce our health plan costs. We are investing \$8.5 million in 47% of our employees that get more than the employee coverage. This is where we can pare down the responsibility of the City of Columbia and free up revenue that can be used for programs and basic salaries for employees. He suggested that Council identify a specific amount of funds to cut in health care costs.

There was an in-depth discussion on issues impacting the cost of health care.

Councilor Davis revisited the impact of the millage increase.

Councilor Duvall insisted that the City of Columbia should have 100 mills.

Councilor Davis agreed that the millage increase is needed for Public Safety.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director explained that a 2 mill increase reflects an additional \$8 per year on an owner occupied home valued at \$100,000.

Councilor Duvall would like to refund the Community Promotions groups.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

Councilor Devine asked to revisit the efficiency study recommendations. She urged Council to consider how their decisions impact the Vision Statement. We must be very thoughtful with how we approach health care. We have to look at mandating or strongly encouraging changes in behaviors.

Councilor Rickenmann suggested other alternatives such as creating a business license flat fee for all non-profits operating within City limits. There are approximately 4,000 parcels that are owned by non-profits. We have to encourage vertical growth and core growth where we already have infrastructure. We should pass something to bring everyone to equal ground.

Councilor Davis suggested that there be a level of stabilization to the cost of doing business in the City of Columbia.

Councilor Duvall recalled that the City Manager has committed to working on new and innovative revenue resources.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director said we will also prioritize and look at programs.

Mayor Benjamin said our commitment needs to be making sure we provide high quality services. He recalled expressing deep opposition to tax increases. He hopes this is a one-time deal. He supports looking at the proposed healthcare expenses, reducing the Annual Required Contribution (ARC) and then making a commitment to back into those costs. He agreed that all suggestions needed to be on the table.

There was a continued discussion on the millage increase and alternatives for meeting the City's financial needs.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director continued to report that the proposed Water & Sewer Operating Fund budget is \$152.8 million. She reviewed the budget highlights. She noted that utility operations make up the largest percentage of the budget along with an approximate \$50 million investment in the CIP. The Storm Water Fund budget has grown to \$12.6 million, which reflects a \$5.3 million increase over the current year's budget. The rate increase of \$5 per ERU will be phased in over five years starting July 2017. The budget includes the \$200,000 grant match to the Gills Creek Watershed. The Parking Fund budget is \$8 million, which is a 3% reduction from the current year. The majority of the budget is for Parking Services and debt service. The proposed Hospitality Tax budget is \$11.4 million, which is an increase of 3% over the current year. The committee allocation is \$2,109,000; funding for line item agencies total \$2,696,000; and the General Fund transfer is \$700,000. The proposed



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

Accommodations Tax budget is \$2.2 million, which is a 4.3% increase over the current year. She explained that State Law allows for the transfer of \$25,000 to the General Fund and 25% for general purposes. Approximately \$2 million will be allocated to the committee for tourism related expenses and advertising and promotion of tourism.

Ms. Libby Gober, Executive Assistant to City Council explained that the committee makes a recommendation on the disbursement of any surplus funds.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director reported that the Capital Improvement Program budget incorporates water and sewer and storm water. The CIP for water is \$40 million, sewer is \$80 million, and the five year CIP for storm water is \$93 million. In closing, she reiterated that the Budget Public Hearing and first reading will be held on June 13, 2017 at 6:00p.m.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Rickenmann and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to reconvene the Executive Session at 3:19 p.m. for the discussion of items as previously outlined.

Council adjourned the Executive Session at 4:50 p.m.

COUNCIL MEETING

The Columbia City Council conducted a Council Meeting and a Zoning Public Hearing on Tuesday, May 16, 2017 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 6:06 p.m. The following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine, The Honorable Howard E. Duvall, Jr., The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. and The Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann. The Honorable Moe Baddourah was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Heathwood Hall Episcopal School Students led the Pledge of Allegiance.

INVOCATION

Bishop James Mack of Bible Way Church of Christ offered the Invocation



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Upon a motion made by Mr. Rickenmann and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to adopt the agenda as presented.

PUBLIC INPUT RELATED TO AGENDA ITEMS

No one appeared at this time.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

8. April 4, 2017 Meeting Minutes – *This item was deferred.*

CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS 9 THROUGH 17

Upon a single motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Rickenmann, Council voted unanimously to approve the **Consent Agenda Items 9 through 17**.

9. Council is asked to approve Operator Training, SOP Preparation and Operation Manual Services, as requested by the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant. Award to Brown and Caldwell as a sole source in an amount not to exceed \$59,500.00. This vendor is located in Columbia, SC. - *Utilities Metro Wastewater Plant: Professional Services; 5516208-636600. The original budgeted amount is \$59,500.00. - Approved*
10. Council is asked to approve an Agreement for Health Care Benefit Plan and Actuarial Services, as requested by the Human Resources Department. Award to AON Risk Services South Inc. in an amount not to exceed \$100,000.00. This firm is located in Greenville, SC. *Health Insurance Benefits- Consultant Fees (Contract) 6048933-636700 - Approved*
11. Council is asked to approve Project SS7324; Bendale Pump Station Improvements, as requested by the Utility Operations Department. Award to LAD Corporation of West Columbia, a Woman Owned Business Enterprise in an amount of \$196,441.00 with a project contingency of \$19,644.10 for a total amount not to exceed \$216,085.10. This firm is located in West Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Water and Sewer Capital Project Cost; 5529999-658650. This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project and the original budgeted amount is \$198,670.00. - Approved*



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

The following sub-consultants will provide additional services.

Ferguson Waterworks, a Local Business Enterprise of Elgin, SC will provide \$5,000 (2%) of contract value.

Tindal Corporation, a Local Business Enterprise of Spartanburg, SC will provide \$11,000 (5%) of contract value.

12. Council is asked to approve a Contract for Finlay Park Fountain Design Build Services, as requested by the Parks and Recreation Department. Award to WP Law in an amount not to exceed fee of \$310,649.99. This firm is located in Lexington, SC. *Funding Source: 403999-658650-PK005606 - The original budgeted amount is \$310,650.00. - Approved*

The following sub-consultants will provide additional services:

*AOS Specialty Contractors, a Woman Owned Business Enterprise of Lexington, SC will provide excavation and concrete services for \$62,000 (20.9%) of the contract value.
Cornerstone Cutting and Coring, LLC of Ridgeway, SC will provide core drilling services for \$5,000 (1.6%) of the contract value.*

13. Council is asked to approve Project WM4341/WM4359; Water Main Construction Services along Pine Cliff Court, Challedon Drive and Brandywine Drive, as requested by the Utility Operations Department. Award to G. H. Smith Construction, LLC, a Local Business Enterprise in an amount not to exceed \$355,118.50. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Water and Sewer Improvements – Pine Cliff Court, Challedon Drive, and Brandywine Drive WM Construction/Capital Project Costs; 5529999-WM434101-658650. The original budgeted amount is \$372,975.00. This is a Mentor Protégé Program Project. Lake Murray Utility Company, Inc. of Columbia, SC is the Protégé and will implement 20% of the contract value. - Approved*
14. Council is asked to approve an Agreement for the Sewer System Evaluation Study and Sewer Rehabilitation Implementation for Smith Branch 02, as requested by the Engineering Department. Award to Stantec Consulting Services, Inc., in the amount of \$433,053.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: 5529999-SS7279-658650 (Unforeseen & Miscellaneous Projects). The original budgeted amount is \$6,000,000. This is a Mentor Protégé Program Project. Chao and Associates, Inc. of Columbia, SC, is the Protégé and will provide GIS, manhole surveying and general construction services in the amount of \$250,646.50 (57.88%) of the contract amount. - Approved*
-



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

15. Council is asked to authorize Contract negotiations for Utility Relocation and Upgrade Services for Water and Wastewater System Improvements, as requested by the Utility Operations Department and the Engineering Department. Award to CDM Smith Inc., Hazen and Sawyer, and Michael Baker International, Inc. in an amount not to exceed \$2,280,000.00. We also request Council's approval for the execution of the final agreements, subsequent task orders, and option to extend services to the extent of Council's approved budget amount, in a form approved by the City's Attorney's Office with final approval by the City Manager. *Funding Sources: See attached memo for multiple funding sources and amounts. - Approved*

CDM Smith Inc. is headquartered in Boston, MA and has a local office in Columbia, SC. CDM Smith, Inc. proposed to utilize 2% SBE, 10% MBE, and 8% WBE for sub-consultant services.

Hazen and Sawyer is headquartered headquarters in New York, NY and has a local office in Columbia, SC. Hazen and Sawyer proposed to utilize 10% MBE and 15% WBE for sub-consultant services.

Michael Baker International, Inc. is headquartered in Pittsburgh, PA and has a local office in Columbia, SC. Michael Baker International, Inc. proposed to utilize 5% SBE, 8% MBE, and 15% WBE for sub-consultant services.

16. Ordinance No.: 2017-022 - Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Sixth Amendment to Lease between the City of Columbia and Old Boy Properties, LLC for property consisting of 100± acres in Richland County, South Carolina being a portion of the property formerly owned by Columbia Venture, LLC and Sunday School, LLC - *First reading approval was given on May 2, 2017. – Approved on second reading.*
17. Resolution No.: R-2017-044 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine beverages only at Jerry Fest at the Five Points Fountain on October 1, 2017 - *Approved*



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

PRESENTATIONS

18. American Public Works Week Proclamation - Mr. Robert Anderson, Director of Public Works

Mr. Robert Anderson, Director of Public Works said the Department is comprised of the Streets, Traffic Engineering, Animal Services, Forestry and Beautification, the Climate Protection Advisory Campaign, Solid Waste and Recycling. He invited everyone to attend the Touch-A-Truck event on Saturday, May 20, 2017 from 9:00 a.m. until 12:00 p.m. at the Public Works Facility.

Mayor Benjamin and the members of Council proclaimed May 21-27, 2017 as Public Works Week in the City of Columbia.

19. Recognition of Local Entrepreneur / Inventor Mrs. Darla Davenport-Powell - The Honorable Mr. Davis

Councilor Davis recognized Mrs. Darla Davenport, a Standish Acres-Burton Heights resident and local entrepreneur who appeared on NBC's *The Toy Box*. He said she represented this state and our community well.

There was a video presentation of the Niya Doll and her multi-cultural friends.

Mayor Benjamin and the members of Council proclaimed Tuesday, May 16, 2017 as Darla Davenport-Powell Day in the City of Columbia.

Ms. Darla Davenport, Children's Author and Creator said Niya and her friends represent our world; they don't look alike. She thanked the Mayor, members of Council and the community for this recognition.

20. Special Presentation - Ms. Susan Carson Lambert, Coordinator for the Midlands Food Alliance

Ms. Carrie Draper, MSW, Midlands Food Alliance and Chair of the SC Food Policy Council thanked City Council for being the first local government in South Carolina to establish a Food Policy Council. She presented Ms. Lauren Harper, Advisor to the Mayor with the Taking Care of Business Award for going above and beyond the call of duty to help develop the Food Policy Council.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

-
21. Sally Salamander: A Proposal for Expansion and Promotion - Ms. Julie Firetag from the Upper School Government & Economics and Heathwood Hall Episcopal School Students

Mr. Roy Matthews said they are looking to expand on the Sally Salamander sites originally selected by the 2009 Leadership Columbia Class. This will make downtown more vibrant. He reviewed a list of groups they met with while considering the new sites.

Mayor Benjamin recalled that Sally Salamander is a way finding project created by Leadership Columbia that recognizes historic sites and sites of interest around the City by marking them with a salamander. Heathwood Hall has been very involved in using the City as a classroom project and volunteered their time to work on a project that might help attract people to the urban core or learn more about their City. These young people put together a high level presentation to show how we can use the spotted salamander, our official state amphibian.

Mr. Roy Matthews presented the initial list of sites, while noting that many were removed due to the distance from downtown.

Miss Kate Nassab said we wanted to maintain walkability on the tour and some proposed sites were removed due to the distance from current sites. The final ten sites were chosen using the following criteria: historical significance, safety and comfort, artistic and architectural value, appeal to different age groups, and the potential for economic development.

Mr. Tanner Senn said the USC Horseshoe was chosen, because it was the original campus of the University of South Carolina when it was founded in 1801. The Hanging Drums is an interactive public piece of art created by local artists. The Lincoln Street Tunnel is a 100 year old railroad tunnel and part of the Seaboard Air Line Railway. It is currently undergoing a beautification project by the 2017 Leadership Columbia Class.

Mr. William McKelvey said the Trinity Cathedral was chosen, because the Trinity Episcopal Church was one of the first churches established during the time of Early Carolina Settlement and it's modeled after the Yorkminster Cathedral in England. It is one of the fewest examples of Ecclesiastical Gothic Revival Architecture.

Mr. Phillip Brewer said the Sheraton Hotel originally known as the Palmetto Building was built in 1913 and added to the National Register of Historic Places in 1980. The economic development is promising. The building that houses the Mast General Store was built in the 1870's and renovated in 2008 to accommodate the store, but the structure remains the same.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

Mr. DQ Joseph presented the Oak Table Restaurant, because they only use locally and seasonally grown ingredients, which also supports the South Carolina farming industry. The Villa Tronco Restaurant is a former fire station that was constructed in 1866 when William Byrd Stanley was President of the fire company. He also served as the Mayor of Columbia for two terms. Villa Tronco is one of the oldest Italian restaurants in Columbia. The Sweet Cream Company was created by a couple from Philadelphia that saw artistic potential on Main Street. They only use locally grown ingredients and they ship ice cream across the United States. The Gong is a public art structure in the Vista. It was created by two local artists and dedicated to Marvin Chernoff, a public relations mastermind who used a small gong in his office to signify when something was over. He reported that Carolina Bronze has been hired to create new salamanders and plaques at a cost of \$2,950. A launch event is needed to promote Sally Salamander. The Soda City Market, elementary school curriculum and State House tours are great ways to introduce Sally Salamander.

Miss Lawson Elizabeth Leidnger said they hope to have local media report on the launch event and use the Sally Salamander. To continue the Heathwood Hall collaboration, the Upper School Computer Programming students can design a walkable tour app to increase the educational aspect of the tour.

Miss Marra Edwards said the Upper School can write a children's book, design t-shirts and a board game to be sold at Mast General Store. She thanked Mayor Benjamin and members of the Columbia City Council for this opportunity.

Mayor Benjamin thanked the fantastic leadership and teachers of Heathwood Hall for yielding the floor to the students. It's always wonderful to see young people stand up and present with such poise and leadership.

STAFF REPORT

22. Flood Recovery / CDBG-DR Program Update - Ms. Gloria Saeed, Director of Community Development

Ms. Gloria Saeed, Community Development Director presented the Recovery Assistance for Impacted Neighborhoods (RAIN) Program. The purpose of the Disaster Recovery Program is to assist single-family, owner-occupied or rental properties that suffered the greatest damage from the October 2015 Flood. The City's priorities are to assist low to moderate income households, seniors age 62 or over, disabled, veterans and female households. This is a six-year program and it has been 18 months since the flood. FEMA registration is required and the approach is to manage expectations through the use of targeted outreach. She reviewed the requirements of the



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

following six (6) programs: Columbia Housing Assistance Program, Small Rental Repair Program, Elevation Reimbursement Program, Small Business Disaster Recovery Program, Columbia Buyout Program and the Minor Rehabilitation Program. The programs will be launched in two phases. She reported that 259 letters will be mailed next week using the most recent data from FEMA and four public information sessions will be held. The application process will remain open for six months.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager reiterated that income verifications are also required. There are also Federal guidelines.

Ms. Gloria Saeed, Community Development Director added that we must verify the household size and income for residents age 18 or older; documentation will be required. In response to Ms. Devine, she noted that each program is funded at a different level.

PUBLIC HEARING

ORDINANCE - FIRST READING

23. Ordinance No.: 2017-008 - Authorizing the Granting of Property Tax Credits to Smoky Properties, LLC for Richland County TMS #08911-05-11 pursuant to the South Carolina Abandoned Buildings Revitalization Act, Title 12, Chapter 67 of the Code of Laws of South Carolina, 1976, as amended – *Approved on first reading.*

Council opened the Public Hearing at 6:52 p.m.

No one appeared in support of or in opposition to this matter.

Council closed the Zoning Public Hearing at 6:52 p.m.

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2017-008 - Authorizing the Granting of Property Tax Credits to Smoky Properties, LLC for Richland County TMS #08911-05-11 pursuant to the South Carolina Abandoned Buildings Revitalization Act, Title 12, Chapter 67 of the Code of Laws of South Carolina, 1976, as amended.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

ORDINANCE - FIRST READING

24. Ordinance No.: 2017-042 - Authorizing the City Manager to execute an Agreement for Sale, deed and any other documents necessary to consummate the transfer of approximately 0.38 acres (16,553 SF) known as 611 Blanding Street and 615 Blanding Street, Richland County TMS #09010-11-17 and TMS #09010-11-16 to Matt Varner – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Rickenmann, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2017-042 - Authorizing the City Manager to execute an Agreement for Sale, deed and any other documents necessary to consummate the transfer of approximately 0.38 acres (16,553 SF) known as 611 Blanding Street and 615 Blanding Street, Richland County TMS #09010-11-17 and TMS #09010-11-16 to Matt Varner.

OTHER MATTERS

25. Council is asked to approve the Installation of four (4) Speed Humps in the Standish Acres Community, as requested by the Traffic Engineering Division. - *The Police Department and the Fire Department have reviewed and approved the proposed location.*
- *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Rickenmann, Council voted unanimously to approve the Installation of four (4) Speed Humps in the Standish Acres Community.

APPOINTMENTS

26. Spirit Communications Board of Advisors

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Mr. William Thrift to the Spirit Communications Park Board of Advisors.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

-
27. Council is asked to approve the appointment of three (3) individuals to the Quiet Zone Advisory Committee.

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Ms. Barbara Smith, Mr. James (Jim) Prater and Mr. Frank Houston to the Quiet Zone Advisory Committee. Council reserved the right to expand the committee later.

ZONING PUBLIC HEARING

Council opened the Zoning Public Hearing at 7:01 p.m.

No one appeared in support of or in opposition to Items 28 through 31.

Upon a single motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to **Items 28** through **31**.

28. Annexation, Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment and Zoning Map Amendment: 1115 Shop Road; TMS# 11210-01-01 – *Approved on first reading.*

Ordinance No.: 2017-034 - Annexing and Incorporating 1115 Shop Road, Richland County TMS #11210-01-01 into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 – *Approved on first reading.*

Council District: 3

Proposal: Request to annex, assign land use classification of Employment Campus (EC) and assign zoning of Light Industrial District (M-1). The property is currently classified as Mixed Residential (High Density) by Richland County and zoned as M-1 by Richland County.

Applicant: 1115 & 1087 Shop Rd, LLC / Reign Living, LLC

Staff Recommendation: Approval

PC Recommendation: 03/06/2017; Cancelled; 03/20/2017; Approval (6-0)

29. Comprehensive Plan Future Land Use Map Amendment: 30 National Guard Road; TMS# 11100-01-04 – *Approved on first reading.*



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Ordinance No.: 2017-036 - Amending the City of Columbia Comprehensive Plan 2018 Future Land Use Map for 30 National Guard Road, Richland County TMS #11100-01-04 – *Approved on first reading.*

City Council District: 3
Proposal: Request to amend Chapter 8.3 of The Columbia Plan 2018 – Future Land Use Map to modify the land use classification from EC to SD-1.
Applicant: City of Columbia Planning & Development Services
Staff Recommendation: Approval
PC Recommendation: 03/06/2017; Cancelled 03/20/2017; Approval (6-0)

30. Comprehensive Plan Future Land Use Map Amendment: 6825 Pennington Road, 843 Pepper Street and 851 Pepper Street; TMS# 16407-07-02, 16407-07-05 and 16407-07-04

Ordinance No.: 2017-035 - Amending the City of Columbia Comprehensive Plan 2018 Future Land Use Map for 6825 Pennington Road, 843 Pepper Street and 851 Pepper Street, Richland County TMS #16407-07-02, 16407-07-05 and 16407-07-04 – *Approved on first reading.*

City Council District: 4
Proposal: Request to amend Chapter 8.3 of The Columbia Plan 2018 – Future Land Use Map to modify the land use classification from AC-2 to IND.
Applicant: City of Columbia Planning & Development Services
Staff Recommendation: Approval
PC Recommendation: 03/06/2017; Cancelled; 03/20/2017; Approval (6-0)

31. Zoning Map Amendment: Willow Street S-40-506 (formerly Pine Street); South of TMS# 11601-25-01– *Approved on first reading.*

Council District: 2
Proposal: Request to rezone the parcel from RG-1A to RG-2
Applicant: Gilbert Walker, Columbia Housing Authority
Staff Recommendation: Approval
PC Recommendation: 04/03/2017; Approval (7-0)



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Upon a single motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Rickenmann, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to **Items 32** through **35**. Mayor Benjamin abstained from voting due to a potential conflict of interest.

32. Annexation, Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment, and Zoning Map Amendment: ±2.49 acres proposed for Woodcreek Farms Road, a/k/a: 10750 Two Notch Road and E/S Old National Highway (p), E/S Old National Highway, and 168 Riding Grove Road(p), TMS# 28900-01-11 (p), 28900-01-14, and 28900-01-10 (p) – *Approved on first reading.*

Ordinance No.: 2017-037 - Annexing and Incorporating 2.49 acres proposed for Woodcreek Farms Road, a/k/a: 10750 Two Notch Road and E/S Old National Highway (p), E/S Old National Highway, and 168 Riding Grove Road(p), Richland County TMS#28900-01-11 (p), 28900-01-14, and 28900-01-10 (p) into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 – *Approved on first reading.*

Council District: 4

Proposal: Request to annex, assign land use classification of Urban Edge Residential-Large Lot (UER-2), and assign zoning of PUD-R (Planned Unit Development-Residential District). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned as PDD by Richland County.

Applicant: Woodcreek Development LLC f/k/a Woodcreek Development Partnership

Staff Recommendation: Approval

PC Recommendation: 04/03/2017; Approval (7-0)

33. Annexation, Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment, and Zoning Map Amendment: 152 Island View Circle; TMS# 28907-01-08 – *Approved on first reading.*

Ordinance No.: 2017-038 - Annexing and Incorporating 152 Island View Circle, Richland County TMS #28907-01-08, into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 – *Approved on first reading.*



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

-
- | | |
|-----------------------|--|
| Council District: | 4 |
| Proposal: | Request to annex, assign land use classification of Urban Edge Residential-Large Lot (UER-2) and assign zoning of Planned Unit Development-Residential District (PUD-R). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) by Richland County and zoned as PDD by Richland County. |
| Applicant: | Executive Construction Homes, LLC |
| Staff Recommendation: | Approval |
| PC Recommendation: | 04/03/2017; Approval (7-0) |
34. Annexation, Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment, and Zoning Map Amendment: ±347.2 acres, a/k/a 10750 Two Notch Road; TMS# 28900-01-11(p) – *Approved on first reading.*
- Ordinance No.: 2017-040 - Annexing and Incorporating 347.2 acres a/k/a 10750 Two Notch Road, Richland County TMS #28900-01-11(p), into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 – *Approved on first reading.*
- | | |
|-----------------------|--|
| Council District: | 4 |
| Proposal: | Request to annex, assign land use classifications of Urban Edge Residential-Small Lot (UER-1), Urban Edge Residential-Large Lot (UER-2), and Community Activity Corridor (AC-2), and assign zoning of Planned Unit Development-Residential District (PUD-R). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned PDD by Richland County. |
| Applicant: | Woodcreek Development, LLC |
| Staff Recommendation: | Approval |
| PC Recommendation: | 04/03/2017; Approval (7-0) |
35. Annexation, Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment, and Zoning Map Amendment: 29.25 acres N/S Riding Grove Road (p); TMS# 28900-01-11(p) and 28900-01-30 – *Approved on first reading.*
-



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Ordinance No.: 2017-039 - Annexing and Incorporating 29.25 acres N/5 Riding Grove Road, Richland County TMS # 28900-01-11 (p) and 28900-01-30 into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 – *Approved on first reading.*

Council District: 4
Proposal: Request to annex, assign land use classification of Urban Edge Residential-Small Lot (UER-1), and assign zoning of PUD-R (Planned Unit Development-Residential District). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) by Richland County for both parcels and zoned PDD by Richland County for TMS# 28900-01-11 (p) and RS-MD by Richland County for TMS# 28900-01-30.
Applicant: ARBO Woodcreek LLC
Staff Recommendation: Approval
PC Recommendation: 04/03/2017; Approval (7-0)

36. Zoning Map Amendment: 3319 Millwood Avenue; TMS# 13804-03-09 - *The Zoning Public Hearing was held on May 16, 2017 and no action was taken. Ms. Devine abstained from discussions due to a potential conflict of interest.*

Council District: 3 & 4
Proposal: Request to rezone the parcel from PUD-C to RS-2
Applicant: Raymond A. Perkins, Jr., Richland School District One
Staff Recommendation: Approval
PC Recommendation: 04/03/2017; Denial (7-0)

Ms. Krista Hampton, Planning and Development Services Director explained that Richland School District One desires to expand the athletic facilities at the Dreher campus. The property is zoned Planned Unit Development (PUD). A rezoning is necessary to facilitate the expansion, because this is a single use PUD. In 2010, the Supreme Court clarified that PUDs are to be mixed-use; commercial and residential. The first request to rezone as C-1 will not allow a school outright and staff recommended against that proposal. That request was withdrawn. They have returned with a request to rezone the property RS-2, which is consistent with our land use plan. The Planning Commission recommended denial of the request. She noted that schools are special exceptions in a single-family residential zoning district and in order for the athletic facilities to be expanded the Board of Zoning Appeals would have to grant a special exception.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Councilor Duvall clarified that the question before Council does not change anything; if we grant RS-2 we are not granting the facility expansion. It would go to the Board of Zoning appeals as a special exception.

Councilor Devine stated for the record that she is conflicted out from voting on this and she has signed and submitted a conflict of interest form. Based on the City Attorney's advice, I will remain in the room and listen to arguments for information purposes.

Mayor Benjamin said the purpose of the public hearing is to obtain public comment or public testimony; that's all we are asking for tonight. This is rare issue. It has been refreshing to hear the good public dialog and debate. He said this is a discussion between friends and neighbors and he encouraged everyone to remember that as we move forward.

Dr. Craig Witherspoon, Superintendent of Richland School District One said in 2014, the Board of Commissioners embarked to look at all athletic fields and stadiums across the district. We embarked upon a multi-year program to upgrade the fields and stadiums and to provide additional opportunities for students. Many projects have already been completed and now we are looking at what can be done at Dreher. He noted that multiple meetings have been held and our goal is to work together in collaboration with the schools, community, students and parents. He hopes to find common ground and move this project forward for the students.

Mr. Raymond Perkins, Jr., Director of Facility Services for Richland School District One explained that in order to make the planned changes, we must request rezoning from the PUD-C to the new RS-2 designation. We are looking to provide adequate athletic facilities that coincide with our academic goals; onsite facilities to reduce the transportation and scheduling efforts; and a synthetic turf that will be safe, durable and environmentally friendly. We desire to live in harmony with our neighbors. We have reduced the number of seats, eliminated the sound system and the press box, and included a fence at the south end to discourage parking on Adger Road. We ask to leave the lights in place. We are willing to do more in order to be more harmonious. He asked Council to review this request in the manner in which it was made so we can move forward in the process.

Mr. Sam Waters, Co-President of the Historic Heathwood Neighborhood Association said Dreher High School was recognized nationally for its academics and we appreciate their influence and effort to improve the facilities. He recalled that a July 2003 study prepared by outside professionals stated that competition sports would be offsite and the green space would be used for physical education. The report concluded that many activities must use the already limited space. In conclusion, he read a letter from Dr. Allen Coles, the Superintendent that was in



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

place in 2003. We support Dreher High School, but this plan is not acceptable to the neighborhood.

Mayor Benjamin asked for a show of hands in support of the District's application. He then asked for a show of hands in opposition.

Mr. Michael Burkett, Esq., President of the Dreher Athletic Booster Club appeared in support of the matter. He said the issue boils down to the value of Dreher to the City, fairness and the compromises that have been offered by the District. A city cannot survive without strong neighborhoods and neighborhoods cannot survive without strong schools. Dreher sits on the edge of a neighborhood, but the neighborhood is not zoned for Dreher. He presented a map of the attendance zone, noting that there has never been buy-in from the neighborhood. He noted that the school has been on the same corner since 1938. Our goal is to share the facts of the project.

Mr. Jeff Brooker, III, Esq., resident at Adger and Cassina Road appeared in opposition to the matter. The purpose of the land use is to carefully and properly manage land resources where we live and work. The City's land use policies and goals stand in opposition with the request to rezone Dreher. City Council should vote no to rezone Dreher, especially in light of the planned infill development. There is a notion being advanced by supporters that the PUD-C is not compliant with South Carolina law based on the 2010 Supreme Court Sinkler case. This case doesn't support the Dreher rezoning, because it dealt with a planned development district. The Dreher site is a PUD-C, which is a local ordinance enacted by City Council. Any change to the zoning is improper and I hope you vote no.

Dr. Jennifer Hucks appeared in support of the matter. She said her children attend Richland One Schools and she is hopeful that her sons and their friends will experience the benefits this change would bring to them. I've been in the healthcare system for fifteen years and I encounter other healthcare professionals that do not consider buying a home in the City limits because of the school system, taxes and the price and age of homes. Young physicians live in Columbia and they move to other communities when they start planning families. The competition is great and if we don't make these changes we may continue to lose productive members of society that can be good neighbors and good tax payers.

Ms. Shelia Myers, President of the Dreher School Improvement Council appeared in support of the matter. She said the students have exams tomorrow, but they have a vested interest in what will happen to their future. You have the opportunity to help our young people be our future of now. We are arguing about an issue, but we have to put our youth first. We have to teach our young people the value of compromise. They deserve to have what the other schools have.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

Mr. Rox Pollard, Jr. appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He said from a professional standpoint, contextually and practically, the proposed field does not fit on the site. We all want facilities that adequately serve our kids, but 70' light poles have no place in a neighborhood. You can see the lights at Spirit Communications Park from a distance. The context of the proposed design simply does not work. He noted that AC Flora High School is a 35-acre site with buffers and was built before the neighborhoods around it. I would ask you not to support the rezoning, but I think we can reach a compromise.

Mr. Charles Appleby, Esq., Shandon Neighborhood Council appeared in support of the rezoning. Over the years public schools like AC Flora and private schools like Hammond have been allowed to expand their on campus athletic facilities with lights, scrimmages, junior varsity and varsity games. These are thriving schools in the middle of neighborhoods. The on campus facilities build a closer community for the schools; they provide safety for the students; and potentially increase the value of homes. The Shandon Neighborhood Council voted unanimously in favor of supporting Dreher. If we are to have any success in breaking the self-fulfilling cycle of despair, we cannot treat Dreher like an island in the middle of our City where equality just doesn't count. He asked Council to vote in favor of the rezoning.

Ms. Kathi Lacy, Shandon Neighborhood resident appeared in support of the rezoning. She became involved with this proposal during the fall and she felt like a compromise could be reached, but we are at an impasse. There is correlation between home values and school expenditures; for every dollar spent on education, home values increase by \$20. Good schools provide stability for a community. Dreher has a 63% minority population and 43% meeting the economically disadvantaged criteria. The historic value of Dreher was to be the center of our community. Instead of viewing these upgrades as a problem, let's celebrate it as a way to provide stability and economic growth for our City.

Ms. Martha Fowler, Melrose Heights resident appeared in opposition to the rezoning. She said members of her family attended Dreher and she is proud of the school and her neighborhood. She said this has been difficult and we have to find a better way to make this work. It was difficult in 2003 when we lost 34 houses and families. We were supposed to have green space. We want these kids to have every advantage possible. The land is locked. I asked if it is possible to have some fields at Dreher, Hand and Crayton. There are lots of blighted areas along Millwood Avenue with lots of land and we could do something creative; we can find a better way with the guidance of Council. For now, we need to vote no and find a better plan.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

Mr. Vance Strickland, 1987 graduate of Dreher High School appeared in support of the rezoning. He has two children at Dreher High School and a third child will be there next year. His children will not benefit from this project, but he is here for the greater good. The 2003 PUD specifically contains a provision that allows for a methodology to create change. He said the City asked Dreher not to change the PUD and to seek a rezoning. The lights are not going to bleed over to these homes. We suggested 70' poles, because it will allow them to shine the lights directly down. The field does fit; it handles all of the setbacks that are required. Traffic is not a problem, the parking is adequate and cars will egress onto the main road and not onto Adger Road.

The Honorable Hamilton Osborne Jr., former City Councilman and 1961 Graduate of Dreher High School appeared in opposition to the proposed rezoning. In 2003, I voted for the current PUD zoning as a member of the Columbia City Council. The School District needed the PUD zoning in order to rebuild Dreher on the existing site. The alternative was to move Dreher to a new site on the edge of town. Moving Dreher would have provided additional room for facilities and future expansion, but the School District decided to keep Dreher where it was. In order to do so, the School District accepted restrictions on the use of the existing campus. The School District agreed that it would not and could not construct any athletic facilities on the open space now existing on the Dreher campus. If the PUD had not contained the restrictions on the use of the open space I would not have voted for the PUD zoning. Dreher is and always has been one of the state's flagship high schools and Dreher does not require a new athletic facility in order to maintain that distinction. The School District should not be allowed to repudiate the promises it made in 2003.

Miss Isabella Cook, Dreher High School Senior and tennis player appeared in support of the rezoning. She said this building project is extremely important to every Dreher student and parent and it should be important to the community as a whole. Dreher is known for its commitment to foster excellence in each and every person that enters its doors. Sports unite people of all backgrounds to rally behind a common cause, but with our current facilities Dreher athletes cannot be united. We drive two miles to tennis practice and fifteen minutes on match days to our home courts. It is a closer drive to AC Flora to play our main rivals, because they have regulation courts on campus. These facilities are for our greater community. Dreher's excellence is a reflection of Columbia's excellence. She said they had to fight for practice time on public courts; they arrived late to home matches; and had to forfeit games.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

Mr. Matthew Campbell, Dreher High School student athlete appeared in support of the rezoning. He said the current field is nothing but dirt and we are losing athletes. If this is approved more people will come to us, we will have stronger teams and we will build better life friendships.

Mr. Christopher Crabtree, Dreher High School student athlete appeared in support of the rezoning. He said athletes have been lost to schools like AC Flora, Lower Richland and Hammond. He said we are here as constituents exercising our rights to get Columbia to focus on the future generation.

Miss Vanez Lyde, Dreher High School Senior and student athlete appeared in support of the rezoning. She said she was a two-time captain of the varsity swim team and a part of the track team and dance company. She attended Dreher because of the opportunities that have led to her current success. Dreher is the only school in the district without on-campus facilities. Having these facilities would give the student body opportunities to support teams that go unnoticed. The facilities will increase safety among students. A compromise has already been reached on lights and sound. She asked that they be allowed to expand the high school experience through the cultivation of the athletic culture by granting current and future Blue Devils with the facilities they deserve.

Mr. Foster Haselden, Esq., appeared in opposition of the rezoning. He said the slides do not show the 24 residences that border Dreher. Had we known that this stadium was a remote possibility, there is a zero chance we would have purchased the home. We made a significant lifetime investment while relying on the PUD. The field is shoehorned in and it barely fits. He expressed support for Dreher High School. One of the lights will only be nine feet from his property line; there will be light illumination and noise pollution; and people will be able to stare directly into my home from the stands. He expressed support of the stadium, but not at this site. He implored Council to reject the proposal as recommended by the Planning Commission.

Mr. Charles Reid, 1986 graduate of Dreher High School appeared in support of the rezoning. He said Columbia needs to grow and growth requires change; change is needed and change is constant. The needs of the high school have changed since Dreher was built in 1938 and athletic facilities are vital to the education experience. Dreher students are not getting the educational experience that's being offered at other high schools. He respects the residents and the perceived fear of the unknown. He asked Council to support Dreher's request to rezone the property, to support the students and to support the future of our City.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Miss Gabby Cruz, Hand Middle School Student appeared in support of the matter. She said the facilities would make a valuable addition to the already valuable school. It would be easier to promote school spirit if the games were played on campus. She said it is quite an ordeal for tennis players and supporters to commute to the courts on Garners Ferry Road. The band would also become more competitive; have safer practice space with lighting; and accessible storage for instruments. There is also a benefit to the surrounding communities. We are willing to compromise, but not to the point of inhibiting achievement and experiences of the people who pass through Dreher. At this stage, voting yes is voting for equality and progress.

Mr. Jay Washington, Dreher High School student athlete appeared in support of the matter. He said he just finished practicing on the field and it is a dust bowl. He said they should have the same rights as their peers in other areas; we shouldn't be at a disadvantage. He recalled not being able to practice before a game due to muddy fields and not having inside batting cages. He said having these facilities will increase participation from students and supporters and lessen the issues with commuting to other sites. He asked Council to give them a chance.

Mr. Don Tudor, 833 Adger Road appeared in opposition to the matter. He said their rear property line is adjoined to the Dreher property. He has lived there since 1983 and many investments have been made since 2003 based upon the promise made to the neighborhood. He feels for the students who feel that they have been slighted. When the PUD was accepted, everybody knew what could be designed and the building was constructed anyway. We support fundraising, we tolerate parking in front of our driveway and mowing on Sundays. The zoning request is being made, because the existing zoning will not allow the stadium. The light poles would be intrusive and I ask Council to vote against this.

Miss Reisy Dillard, Hand Middle School student appeared in support of the rezoning. She has played junior varsity soccer at Dreher for two years and hopes to be on the varsity team in the future. My friends all have practice fields on their campuses. She described how she injured herself and had to lie on the field until their trainer arrived. She experienced a broken hip and was out for seven weeks. She feels that if they had a nice field at Dreher her injury may not have occurred. She wants to be able to walk right out of school to her practices.

Ms. Cope Fralick, Shandon resident appeared in support of the rezoning. She said our schools are diverse in culture, ethnicity and religion and our families consist of various generations, lifestyles and income brackets. Our two boys have been meeting the world right here in Columbia. We are proud that our schools and communities represent the ideal American melting pot; embracing and educating children from every walk of life. Our public school system is the foundation of this growth and tolerance allowing a convergence of people to live and thrive in a southern inner-city neighborhood like mine. Now our city and state are growing and we will feel



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

the growing pains with traffic and construction. To support this continued growth, to encourage new businesses and families to move here, we need to offer sound infrastructure. Maintaining a thriving public school system is that foundation. Let us unite for the future of Dreher and all of our public schools.

Master Landon Harrison, Hand Middle School Student appeared in support of the rezoning. He said he would like to participate in sports at Dreher and in a safe community.

Master Leighton Harrison, Hand Middle School Vice President of Student Council appeared in support of the rezoning. He said his parents work fulltime, he will attend Dreher in two years and he would like to play sports. He asked Council to please support Dreher.

Master Duncan Wilson appeared in support of the rezoning. He wants to play sports that he loves, for a school that he loves.

Master Foster Fralick, Hand Middle School Student appeared in support of the rezoning. He would like to try out for Dreher's junior varsity team. He said the on-campus fields will have a huge impact.

Mr. Christian Boesl appeared in support of the rezoning. As a mediator, he has yet to hear any compromise from the other side. We've heard fears about lights, traffic and the impact on homes. I live within 1,000 feet of the Hammond campus with 4 children. I've heard the occasional crack of a bat and the National Anthem, but each time I am reminded that I live in a community that's greater than myself, my children and my property; it brings me back to a sense of community. My capacity of living has not been diminished; my experience has been enriched. He submitted letters for the record from twenty other homeowners who support the rezoning for the benefit of other children.

Mr. John Bruton, III, 3211 Michigan Street appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He submitted the same message that was submitted to the Planning Commission, which rejected this plan twice. He purchased his home in 2016 and would not have done so if he had known about this plan. If this plan is adopted he will strongly consider selling his house. He said Michigan Street is a quiet street consisting of small affordable homes for young families. The residents' front yards are 50-60' from Dreher and they have tremendous concern about the specter of living next to a sports stadium. His family has supported Dreher athletics over the years, but this plan makes no sense from a land use perspective. He urged Council to pay deference to the Planning Commission's recommendation; to respect the PUD; to respect those who improved their houses in reliance to the PUD; and to vote against this plan.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

Mr. Tony Mizzell appeared in support of the rezoning. He said we are not enemies, we are all neighbors. He recalled spending eight years on the Richland County Council. Whatever you do will be unpopular. All we want is what the other schools have. He noted that Keenan, Columbia High, CA Johnson, and Eau Claire all have facilities like this. He recalled receiving calls from Kings Grant regarding the trumpet being blown at Fort Jackson. That was the sound of freedom. This rezoning is the sound of our future. He urged Council to pass this rezoning.

Mr. Fred Easley, Melrose Neighborhood Association appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He noted that Melrose is registered as a historic neighborhood with the National Park System and the City of Columbia. Melrose is also registered as an Architectural Conservation District. We reached an agreement with the School District in 2003. Everything west of Princeton is what Melrose gave up so that Dreher could be built on the existing site. The compromise was done years ago in order to keep Dreher in its original location. We agreed for the school to remain because of the PUD and the green space. If you don't remember history you are doomed to repeat it. He said the tennis courts and football field will negatively impact the Michigan Street residents. He asked Council not to approve this.

Mr. Billy Cantey appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He is concerned about light, sound and traffic. The stadium would hold 750 people, but they only have 190 parking spots; therefore, the parking is inadequate. They will come back and ask for a sound system. The Planning Commission denied this twice. When you make a promise to someone, you keep it.

Mr. Steve Ostemiller appeared in support of the rezoning. As a new member of the Columbia community, he has never regretted the decision to move here. He said they are impacted by this decision, because his daughters would like to play tennis. USC recruits people from around the country who wonder what the community and schools will be like. The USC community will be watching your vote tonight, because it impacts recruiting; it impacts the perception of Columbia as a community. The community will be watching to see if this Council supports Columbia's core neighborhoods, the education infrastructure and ultimately Columbia's future.

Ms. Mary Baskin Waters, Co-President of the Historic Heathwood Neighborhood Association appeared in opposition to the rezoning. She said the neighborhood is bounded by Adger Road, Devereaux Road, Kilbourne Road and Devine Street and comprised of 112 properties. Our neighborhood was formed in 1911 when Moses Heath purchased 136-acres from the Erskine Academy. We are 106 years old. One of our homes is on the National Register of Historic Places. The City of Columbia annexed the neighborhood in 1925 and Dreher High School was built in 1938. We have coexisted for 79 years and it is our desire to continue this collaborative relationship. Both of our children attended Richland One schools. We are proud supporters of Richland One and part of the Dreher family. In 2003, our neighborhood was incorporated as a



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

non-profit and we were recognized as the 80th neighborhood to join the Columbia Council of Neighborhoods. In 2011, we received a Community Character overlay from City Council. She presented a petition signed by over 250 neighbors. We live close to Dreher High School and we are opposed to the rezoning.

Ms. Elizabeth McCoy, 824 Adger Road appeared in opposition of the rezoning. She said they moved to their home in 1992 from Atlanta. Based on a college admissions officer's recommendation they specifically searched for a home near Dreher despite the fact that they were zoned for AC Flora. Their three children and six exchange students attended Dreher. One house rule was team sport participation, because sports can build community and teach teamwork. She said their shutters took many hits from baseballs. She said baseball and softball are successfully played near Memorial Stadium where damage is not an issue when a homerun is hit. We have supported our neighbor Dreher, but we don't support the additional noise, traffic and trash that will come with the proposed minimum 65 game schedule. Due to recent illnesses, quality of life, family and children are of the utmost importance to them. She said she cannot support Dreher's plan on the small portion of land.

Mr. Shealy McCoy, 824 Adger Road appeared in opposition of the rezoning. He said on June 2, 2017 he will be going to Wake Forest and is facing a third major surgery. He recalled working at USC where he met a young student named Steve Benjamin who spoke eloquently as student body president. He enjoyed living in a neighborhood that was close to where he worked. He said more points are given to graduates of Dreher. He understands the young people's issues. He said you can't control the crowds and the traffic.

Mr. John Boyd appeared in support of the rezoning. He has a daughter who plays tennis and soccer for Dreher. Dreher is the key component to the continued growth and development of our City. He asked how Dreher can continue to provide the best educational experience to students if it can never change. He asked how Dreher can continue to help our City and be this key component to growth if it can never adapt or improve its campus. To be stuck in 2003 is not a long term viable option; it does not work; it's indefensible. This PUD can be amended; there is a process for change. Dreher is not a buffer; it's a high school. He reviewed the compromises that have been made by the School District, noting that it has all been met with a no. The neighborhood hasn't offered one compromise. The District has improved athletic facilities at every high school, but Dreher. He urged Council to embrace the future.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Mr. Joshua Shelton, Melrose Heights resident appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He said there are young people in the neighborhood and the state of the future will impact them. He and his wife grew up in a small rural town in Virginia and that grew up with meager facilities. He said they drove to facilities and games and they drew them closer. He said there is existing noise and light pollution and the proposal will exasperate that. He asked if Dreher has been so successful since its inception why do they feel that these new sports facilities are necessary to continue their success. He insisted that the existing facilities are more than adequate and updated classrooms will be a better use of funds.

Miss Cameron Sonefeld, rising student body president and athlete at Dreher High School appeared in support of the rezoning. She said many students come from low income families that cannot provide transportation to the off campus facilities. She said a teammate misses practices and games because she cannot travel to practices at Hand Middle School. Every student deserves a chance to have the same opportunities to play sports. Having on-campus facilities will eliminate the need for transportation.

Mr. Dan Hamilton, Dreher High School student athlete appeared in support of the rezoning. He said we practice at Memorial Stadium due to conditions at Dreher. We pack our cars to transport athletes, because they don't have a ride. The coach who is also a teacher transports the equipment. If he is running late no one can get into the stadium, because he has the keys. The new facility would increase school spirit and support, even if it is close to Dreher. It would also allow for more practice time.

Mr. James Beck, Dreher High School student appeared in support of the rezoning. He said the field would benefit the students. He said he gained more friends through the athletic programs, but their pride has diminished due to the lack of facilities. If our field can be built, we will have more pride and students gaining life lessons that will carry them through life.

Mr. James Curtis, 3401 Heatherwood Road appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He respectfully begged to differ with everyone who put forward proposals supporting the rezoning. He said Richland School District One is doing a disservice to Dreher and its students, because this proposal is far inadequate to meet the dreams that have been articulated here tonight. This is not a full-blown athletic complex. It has been presented as a mere practice facility that will be used for an occasional soccer game. That's not what I hear the students enthusiastically talking about. He suggested that the School Board examine a true solution to this problem at Dreher and not a half-baked idea that is going to adversely impact the neighborhood.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Mr. Michael Roberts, 1000 Princeton Street appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He said they purchased the home in 2003 before the expansion project. He went to Burns High School, a Big 16 School where they walked down the road to play soccer, run cross country and to practice football. Dreher is unique. This project would be destructive to my family's way of life. The light will be ten times greater and the noise will increase. My property value will not go up. The PUD represented a union between the school and the community. He said the school should live up to their bargain from 2003. I want the students to have what they deserve, but it doesn't have to be right out the back door. He asked Council to vote against this tonight.

Mr. Rob Turner appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He this is no way to move forward. The plan has been rejected twice by the City's Planning Commission. He said equality, diversity and fairness are words he tries to live by. This was apparently long thought out decision in 2003 when 34 houses were demolished. No one really wins in this solution. There won't be a baseball field. He would love to see a new top quality practice field installed. He lives very close to the school and no one has sought his opinion.

The Honorable David Adams, Richland County Treasurer appeared in support of the rezoning. He said when they built the new Blythewood High School, they looked at other facilities around time and District One was 60 years behind. We started a process and now every school will have upgraded facilities including Memorial Stadium. There are six national merit scholars at Dreher and they all play sports. More than 40% of the students are economically disadvantaged and they need the opportunity to participate in extracurricular activities as required by colleges. These children don't have the opportunity to go all around town. I understand the previous agreement and that's why the School District is following protocol. The School Board voted for this unanimously and the Planning Commission should not outweigh their decision; it should go to another body.

Ms. Betsy Kammerlin, Chair of the Columbia Green Grants Committee, Landscape Architect, McKissick Museum Advisory Council Member and past member of the City's Design Development Review Commission and the Richland Roundtable appeared in opposition to the rezoning. At a previous meeting about the project, they asked to see the surroundings of the proposed site plan, but this hasn't been done. She put that plan together using a 900' radius and found that along with the eight properties that abut the school property, at least 70 residential properties will be directly affected by light and noise pollution generated by this facility. These properties were bought with the understanding that the 2003 PUD was to limit additional changes and expansion to the school's facilities, especially the athletic fields. It was negotiated and agreed upon with many compromises made between Richland School District One and the City of Columbia. She asked Council to do the right thing for those who chose to live in this neighborhood; vote no on this proposal.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017

Mr. Robert Crooks appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He said there is a difference between want and need. He said an agreement was made in 2003 for a green space buffer with no future plans for organized sport activities. The intent of this agreement is very clear. We have coexisted for fourteen years and now they want to destroy that. He asked Council to honor this well-intended agreement.

Ms. Pamela Melton, 747 Albion Road appeared in opposition to the rezoning. She said they chose to live in the City. She said they were impressed with Dreher and AC Flora; education was most important. Young families have begun moving back into the neighborhood. We are concerned about our homes. She noted that she has never been invited to an official meeting about Dreher. She said if Council votes no, Dreher may come back with a better plan.

Mr. Jim Reid appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He said there was a compromise in 2003 wherein the School District would tear down houses for the construction of a much larger building. In exchange the School District committed to the residents that the use of this property would never be increased. The proposed facilities are nice to have, but they are not a requirement. There is not one student athlete at Dreher who is unable to participate in sports. In the last six months the Planning Commission overwhelmingly voted twice that there should be no expanded use of this property. Tonight, you have the opportunity to let these residents know that you respect their quality of life. Please do not defer this to the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Ms. Kristy Ellenberg appeared in support of the rezoning as a resident at the corner of Albion and Devereaux. She said Dreher has been a good neighbor. As neighbors, we've had changing needs and we changed our home. Dreher has changing needs, too. The most appropriate zoning classification is RS-2. Dreher manages traffic and parking for 1,100 students each day and they host concerts and basketball games with large attendance. The compromises have been made over light and sound. This decision is all about the kids that will have Dreher as their educational home; this is about our city.

Mr. Shep Headley appeared in support of the rezoning. He said all five of his kids went to either Dreher or AC Flora and they all played sports. This is an opportunity for Dreher to have a semblance of what the other schools have. He noted that AC Flora has a new lighted sports facility and they are 1.5 miles up the road. He said the 2003 agreement was like a sharecropper's agreement. We have a neighborhood surrounding us that isn't zoned for Dreher and their best interest isn't us. Please vote today.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Ms. Tashia Maffet-Young, Esq. appeared in support of the rezoning on behalf of a myriad of active duty families whose children attend Dreher High School. She said her spouse has been deployed nine times over nineteen years of service. Upon being deployed to Columbia, they decided that Dreher was the premiere school for their son. Through optimal sports programs and an athletic facility, a school with Dreher's academic accolades can also be inculcated into even greater sports accomplishments. We are one collective community. She asked City Council to vote yes.

Mr. Jim Gregory, 812 Adger Road appeared in opposition to the rezoning. He said those in opposition to this rezoning have provided their addresses; you know where they live. The Dreher property line is 70' from his property, which is the height of the proposed light pole. The development of the property will drastically affect the quality of life of seventy families. I will be looking at a stadium every time I back out of my driveway. The cheering fans will ruin our neighborhood. They should buy land that would allow for future growth. He asked Council to deny the rezoning.

Ms. Dina Phillips appeared in opposition to the rezoning. She expressed support for Dreher and noted that we disagree on how to do that. Don't just look at the teenagers; look around at the people that are opposed to the zoning change. As a neighbor, I heard about the District's compromises through a flyer. During various meetings, the proposed uses of the facility expanded and lights went out later and later. At one meeting she requested the District's traffic control plan during events and was told that there would be no additional traffic. She asked why the facility would be necessary if there won't be increased traffic. Dreher is an award winning school and the addition of this facility will not change that. She asked Council to deny the rezoning.

Ms. Trezevant Brown appeared in opposition to the rezoning. She believes that Ben Boozer, a renowned downtown development negotiator would say that all parties should look at the big picture. As a homeowner, a Dreher parent and a registered nurse, she asked Council to consider Dreher just as it is, an award winning school. She opposed the zoning change, because it will increase traffic in the neighborhood where her children ride their bikes and play. She asked Council to consider the light and noise that the residents would have to endure. A practice field would disrupt our bed times. These students deserve a state of the art facility; not a shoehorned second rate facility. She asked Council to respect the PUD and the Planning Commission's decision; vote no for the change.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Mr. Dave Shank, Esq., Shandon Neighborhood resident appeared in support of the rezoning. He said Columbia is a thriving, changing City. He said it's not 1938 or 2003 anymore; a lot has changed. Both Melrose Heights and Heathwood are desirable communities and will continue to be desirable once this project is in place. No one has said that this project is bad for students. This project will benefit hundreds of thousands of students over the years. The paramount concern should be the safety of students and it should be a reason to support this project.

Ms. Cheryl Johnson, Chair of the Richland School District One Board of Commissioners appeared in support of the rezoning. She explained that in 2014, members of the Board saw the need to address the condition of stadiums and athletic practice fields at all high schools, because the fields were inadequate, overused, and unsafe; there were scheduling issues and many other factors. The Board tasked the Administration with creating and implementing a plan that would improve three existing stadiums: Memorial, Bolden and Lower Richland and add one additional stadium at Keenan. They were also tasked with repairing the athletic fields in an effort to improve access at all schools and for all students. The District is making a lot of progress in implementing and completing timelines on multiple projects. This is the District's effort to fulfill the commitment for improved access for our students at Dreher. It is this Board's desire to continue to move Richland One forward as we lead this State. Our District is over 500 square miles and there is a lot of compromise on a daily basis. I hear the stories of our children arriving home late on Tuesdays, Wednesdays and Thursdays because everybody uses the same fields, which are in bad shape. We stand ready to work together to make this happen with our neighbors, parents and this body.

Council closed the Zoning Public Hearing at 10:19 p.m.

Mayor Benjamin said we appreciate all of you; this has been the right and proper discourse between our most senior members of the community and our students. We wanted to consume all public comment. It is obvious to us that there is still room for compromise, discussion and deliberation. He commended Councilman Rickenmann and Councilman Duvall for working to help find a compromise on this issue. He noted that three members of Council are hearing this presentation for the first time and we owe this community to make a decision within a defined period time. Wanting your children to have a complete educational experience is something we all share; I want that for my two daughters. I also know that having the quiet, peaceful enjoyment of my home is also a huge priority. We have to figure out how to do this. As a Council, we are willing to roll up our sleeves to find a solution. I've heard two different arguments and no one is wrong. I ask for your continued patience and continue to send us additional thoughts and ideas that will help to improve upon this decision.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, MAY 16, 2017**

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to amend the agenda by adding Resolution No: R-2017-047 for consideration.

RESOLUTION

37. Resolution No.: R-2017-047 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine beverages only at the S.O.S. Adult Social Introduction to Summer in Coble Plaza on June 10, 2017 - *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2017-047 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine beverages only at the S.O.S. Adult Social Introduction to Summer in Coble Plaza on June 10, 2017.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS DISCUSSED DURING THE WORK SESSION

No matters were considered at this time.

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS / REFERRALS

No reports or referrals were made at this time.

APPEARANCE OF THE PUBLIC

No one appeared at this time.

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Rickenmann, Council voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting at 10:21 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by:

Erika D. Moore, CMC
City Clerk