



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

The Columbia City Council met for a Work Session on Tuesday, December 19, 2017 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina 29201. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 2:08 p.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, the Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine, the Honorable Howard E. Duvall, Jr., the Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr., and the Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann. The Honorable Moe Baddourah was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the Invocation.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to adopt the agenda subject to adjusting the contract amount of **Item 9** (*Medicare Supplemental and Prescription Coverage Plan Renewal*) to \$1,360,304.00.

CITY COUNCIL DISCUSSION

1. Sustainability Tools for Assessing and Rating Communities (STAR) Community Update
- Mr. Robert Anderson, Public Works Director

Mr. Robert Anderson, Public Works Director explained that the late Deborah Livingston introduced the Public Works Department to the Sustainability Tools for Assessing and Rating Communities. We started the process two years ago when we hired one of the brightest students from the University of South Carolina. He introduced Morgan Hughes, as a one-day old graduate with a Masters in Earth and Environmental Resources Management.

Ms. Morgan Hughes, Intern for the Public Works Department explained that the Sustainability Tools for Assessing and Rating Communities is a non-profit organization out of Washington, DC with over 100 communities. They provide a comprehensive framework with eight goals and 516 indicators. A sustainable community promotes a healthy environment, a strong economy, and well-being for all residents, now and for future generations. She noted that Envision Columbia is embedded within the STAR framework. There are five certification levels and the City's vision was to become a 3-STAR Community and to be the first community in South Carolina to receive



We Are Columbia

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

certification. Our initial verification was a total score of 265. We worked hard to collect data within 30-days and our final verification came back as a strong 3-STAR. She highlighted the City's Sustainability Report Card. She presented recommendations for the Climate Protection Action Committee (CPAC) along with additional recommendations for the City of Columbia. She explained that STAR gives us increased opportunities for grants; it has the possibility to increase the City's bond rating; and it creates a comprehensive sustainability plan. The next steps include celebrating our success as the first STAR Community in South Carolina and to implement the recommendations to achieve the 4-STAR goal by recertification in 2020.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Rickenmann, Council voted unanimously to enter into Executive Session at 2:32 p.m. for the discussion of **Items 2** through **5** as outlined.

2. Discussion of employment of an employee pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)
 - *Municipal Court*
3. Receipt of legal advice related to matters covered by attorney-client privilege pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)
 - *Columbia-Richland 911 Communications Center*
 - *Stormwater Fees*
 - *Freedom of Information Act*
4. Discussion of negotiations incident to proposed contractual arrangements pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)
 - *Bike Share*
 - *Lockhart*
 - *Lower Richland Sewer Agreement*
 - *Utilities in County Designated Service Area Intergovernmental Agreement*
 - *HUD Agreement*
5. Discussion of matters relating to proposed location or expansion of services to encourage location or expansion of industries or other businesses pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)
 - *Parking*



We Are Columbia

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

The Columbia City Council conducted a meeting on Tuesday, December 19, 2017 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina 29201. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 6:11 p.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, the Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine, the Honorable Howard E. Duvall, Jr., the Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr., and the Honorable Daniel J. Rickenmann. The Honorable Moe Baddourah was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the Invocation.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to adopt the agenda subject to removing Ordinance No.: 2018-109 from the Consent Agenda; amending **Item 9** to reflect the correct amount of \$1,306,304.00; and amending **Item 12** to list the Police Department as the end user.

PUBLIC INPUT RELATED TO AGENDA ITEMS

No one appeared at this time.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

6. Council is asked to approve the October 3, 2017 and October 17, 2017 Meeting Minutes.

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the October 3, 2017 and October 17, 2017 Meeting Minutes.



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017**

CONSENT AGENDA

Councilor Rickenmann explained that the health plan contracts (*Items 7-10*) are only being done for one year because we are in the process of looking at options for restructuring our healthcare for the benefit of our employees and longevity and sustainability.

Upon a single motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the **Consent Agenda Items 7 through 18**.

7. Council is asked to approve the Delta Dental Benefits Plan Renewal effective 01/01/2018 through 12/31/2018, as requested by the Human Resources Department. Award to Delta Dental of Missouri as a third party administrator in the amount of \$60,000.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Dental Insurance Fund, 6028931-636600. The original budgeted amount is \$60,000.00. - Approved*
8. Council is asked to approve the Pharmacy Benefit Plan Renewal effective 01/01/2018 through 12/31/2018, as requested by the Human Resources Department. Award to Medco/Express Scripts as the third party administrator in the amount of \$138,000.00. This firm is located in St. Louis, MO. *Funding Source: Health Insurance Fund; 6048933 - 636600. The original budgeted amount is \$138,000.00. - Approved*
9. Council is asked to approve the Medicare Supplemental and Prescription Coverage Plan Renewal effective January 1, 2018 through December 31, 2018, as requested by the Human Resources Department. Award to United Healthcare as a third party administrator in the amount of \$1,360,304.00. This firm is located in Hot Springs, AR. *Funding Source: Health Insurance Fund; 6048933 - 636600. The original budgeted amount is \$1,360,304.00. - Approved*
10. Council is asked to approve the Health Benefits Plan Renewal effective 01/01/2018 through 12/31/2018, as requested by the Human Resources Department. Award to Blue Cross Blue Shield as the third party administrator in the amount of \$2,611,182.00 for Annual Administration Fees and \$774,850.00 for Employee Health Center Costs for a total amount of \$3,386,032.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC *Funding Source: Health Insurance Fund; 6048933 - 636600. The original budgeted amount is \$3,386,032.00. – Approved*



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017**

-
11. Council is asked to approve the Purchase of five (5) Chevrolet Equinox Vehicles for the Police Department, as requested by the Fleet Services Division. Award to Love Chevrolet, using the SC State Contract in the amount of \$111,694.85. This vendor is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Capital Replacement - Auto, Trucks, Heavy Equipment-Capital 6308972-658500. The original budgeted amount is \$111,694.85. - Approved*
 12. Council is asked to approve Project WM438701; Pay Difference to up-size water main at Blaine Street for Southern Wine and Spirits, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to LAD Corporation in the amount of \$73,880.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Fiscal Year 2017/2018 CIP WM438701-Southern Wine and Spirits. The pay difference reimbursement total is \$73,880.00. - Approved*
 13. Council is asked to approve Construction Services for a Water Main Replacement at Bookman Road, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Northeast Backflow, a certified Minority Business Enterprise and Local Business Enterprise in an amount not to exceed \$105,600.00. This firm is located in Lugoff, SC. *Funding Source: 5529999-WM441401-658650. The original budgeted amount is \$105,600.00. This is a Protégé Led Project. Carolina Tap & Bore, Inc. of Columbia, SC is the Mentor and Northeast Backflow of Lugoff, SC is the protégé. Sub-consultant Fortiline Waterworks of Columbia, SC will provide materials and pipe/valves at 10.41% (\$10,000.00) of the contract value. - Approved*
 14. Council is asked to approve Construction Services for the North Columbia Pump Station Bypass Vault, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Shady Grove Construction, LLC, a certified Minority Business Enterprise and a Local Business Enterprise in an amount not to exceed \$160,540.00, which includes the contingency. The firm is located in Irmo, SC. *Funding Source: 5529999-SS741501-658650 - North Columbia Pump Station Bypass Vault. The original budgeted amount is \$160,540. - Approved*
 15. Council is asked to approve Construction Services for Site Work related to the Busby Street Community Resource Training Facility Project, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to Clayton Construction Company, as a Sole Source in an amount not to exceed \$236,524.64. This firm is located in Spartanburg, SC. *Funding Source: Storm Drain Sewer Capital Projects-Capital Project Costs 5549999-658650-SD845701 - Approved*
-



We Are Columbia

**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017**

-
16. Council is asked to approve Construction Services for the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant Dewatering Slab Replacement, as requested by Columbia Water. Award to the LAD Corporation of West Columbia, a certified Minority Business Enterprise and Local Business Enterprise in an amount not to exceed \$484,734.00. This firm is located in Swansea, SC. *Funding Source: 5529999-SS728501-658650. The original budgeted amount is \$484,734.00. This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project and a Mentor Protégé Program Project. Lexington Earthworks of West Columbia, SC is the protégé and will receive 20% (\$68,143.00) of the contract value. Sub-consultant Newman & Son Concrete, Inc. of Lexington, SC will receive 44% (\$150,000.00) of the contract value. - Approved*
17. Council is asked to approve the Flood Recovery Program Management 2018 Staffing and Services Plan. Award to Landmark Consulting, a Minority Business Enterprise in the amount of \$5,154,234.40. This firm has headquarters in New Orleans, LA and a local office in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Flood Recovery 2531116 and will be charged to each grant according to the services provided. – Approved*
18. Resolution No.: R-2017-123 - Authorizing consumption of beer and wine beverages only within Finlay Park for the Bark to the Park Walk and After Party on April 14, 2018 - *Approved*

ORDINANCE - SECOND READING

19. Ordinance No.: 2017-109 - Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 14, Offenses and Miscellaneous Provisions, Article IV, Offenses against the Public Peace and Order to add Sec. 14-100 Enhanced trigger devices declared illegal; exceptions - *First reading approval was given on December 5, 2017. – Approved on second reading.*

Councilor Rickenmann sought clarification for the general public.

Mayor Benjamin said this makes it illegal to attach bump stocks and trigger cranks to a fire arm in the City of Columbia. It will be a misdemeanor. It does not make possession of them illegal. This was drafted to be constitutionally and statutorily sound. Hopefully and prayerfully, it's a move in the right direction that other cities and state governments can follow. It does not make possession of these a crime in the City; attaching them to a firearm is a crime.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give second reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2017-109 - Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 14, Offenses and Miscellaneous Provisions, Article IV, Offenses Against the Public Peace and Order to add Sec. 14-100 Enhanced trigger devices declared illegal; exceptions.

PRESENTATIONS

20. Recognition of Coach Domino Boulware as a 2017 South Carolina Tennis Hall of Fame Inductee - The Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine

Councilor Devine recognized Coach Domino Boulware as a 2017 South Carolina Tennis Hall of Fame Inductee. Everyone knows that we have a jewel within the City of Columbia parks and recreation system. Coach Domino Boulware has been the tennis pro at Greenview Park for many years. He has taught so many young people including my kids and the Mayor's kids, as well as the young at heart. We want to recognize him for all of his work in the State of South Carolina and for this community. Coach Boulware has made history and we are so proud of him.

Mayor Benjamin and the members of Council proclaimed December 9, 2017 as Domino Boulware Day in the City of Columbia.

Mr. Domino Boulware thanked City Council for the honor. I am a product of Drew Park and Saxon Homes and I am proud of that. He thanked his tennis family for being supportive of his efforts. It's all about the kids and we will make every effort to move this City forward as one city. He told Ms. Devine that he played tennis with her father when no one else would play at Greenview Park.

21. Recognition of the Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin as the Green Elected Official - Ms. Jacqueline Buck, Executive Director of Keep the Midlands Beautiful

Ms. Jacqueline Buck, Executive Director of Keep the Midlands Beautiful said Keep the Midlands Beautiful has existed since 1989, but the Midlands Green Awards has existed for six years. The honorees are nominated by the community and we had several nominees for Green Elected Official. The nomination for Mayor Benjamin said he has led the charge on climate initiatives in South Carolina. As the vice president of the US Conference of Mayors, he wants this City to be the leader in the effort to ward off climate change. She presented Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin with the Keep the Midlands Beautiful Green Elected Official Award.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

-
22. STAR Community Certification - Ms. Mary Pat Baldauf, Sustainability Facilitator / Public Works Department

Ms. Mary Pat Baldauf, Sustainability Facilitator / Public Works Department reported that they've been working on the STAR Community certification for two years. The Sustainability Tools for Assessing and Rating Communities was created for local governments by local governments. A sustainable community is one that promotes a healthy environment, a strong economy, and well-being for all residents, now and for future generations. She reviewed the rating system which is based on seven goal areas and an extra credit category of innovation and process. She reported that the City had many achievements. She reported that 133 new businesses were opened in the past three years; 90% of residents live within one mile of a community center that offers free events; our recycling diversion rate is 60%; and Richland School District One was ranked #1 in the State by the Alliance for a Healthier Generation. We are in an elite network of seventy certified communities throughout the Country. She announced that the City is the first certified 3-STAR Community in South Carolina. She credited the late Deborah Livingston with introducing the Public Works Department to this process. STAR touches on all of the Envision Columbia goals. We want to be recertified as a 4-STAR Community in 2020. If we complete the recommendations and improve our documentation, we will earn 4-STAR certification.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager recognized Mr. David Knoche, General Services Director for forty years of service to the City of Columbia. He started with the City at the age of 18. She announced that Mr. Knoche will be retiring next week. So many of the good things about our City are because of David; particularly our physical spaces. She thanked his wife, Karel Ann Knoche for sharing him with us for so long. He deserves to go and enjoy his beautiful family. She presented David with a framed picture of Council Chambers and his 40-year service pin.

Mr. David Knoche, General Services Director thanked all of the City of Columbia employees, especially Edgar Heustess, Kelvin Keisler, and Elle Matney. They will all step up to do whatever. I have a lifetime of friends.

ORDINANCES - FIRST READING

23. Ordinance No.: 2017-110 - Granting an encroachment to Steve Wyatt for installation and maintenance of brick pavers, brick knee wall with columns, sidewalk and driveway within the right of way area of the 900 block of West Confederate Avenue adjacent to 903 West Confederate Avenue, Richland County TMS #09012-01-06 – *Approved on first reading.*
-



**COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017**

Upon a motion made by Mr. Rickenmann and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2017-110 - Granting an encroachment to Steve Wyatt for installation and maintenance of brick pavers, brick knee wall with columns, sidewalk and driveway within the right of way area of the 900 block of West Confederate Avenue adjacent to 903 West Confederate Avenue, Richland County TMS #09012-01-06.

24. Ordinance No.: 2017-111 - Granting an encroachment to Olive Holdings, LLC for the use of the right of way areas of the 3000 block of Duncan Street for installation and maintenance of corrugated pipe adjacent to 3010 Duncan Street, Richland County TMS#13802-01-03 – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2017-111 - Granting an encroachment to Olive Holdings, LLC for the use of the right of way areas of the 3000 block of Duncan Street for installation and maintenance of corrugated pipe adjacent to 3010 Duncan Street, Richland County TMS#13802-01-03.

25. Ordinance No.: 2017-112 - Granting an encroachment to the Shandon Neighborhood Council, LLC for installation and maintenance of landscaping within the triangular right of way area of the 100 block of Harden Street adjacent to 110 Harden Street, Richland County TMS #11310-05-18 – *Approved on first reading.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2017-112 - Granting an encroachment to the Shandon Neighborhood Council, LLC for installation and maintenance of landscaping within the triangular right of way area of the 100 block of Harden Street adjacent to 110 Harden Street, Richland County TMS #11310-05-18.

PUBLIC HEARING

26. Improvement Plan for the Vista Improvement District - Ms. Meredith Atkinson, Executive Director of the Vista Guild - *A second public hearing is scheduled for January 16, 2018 at 6:00 p.m.*



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

Ms. Meredith Atkins, Executive Director of the Vista Guild introduced the Board of Directors for the Vista Guild. We are seeking a Business Improvement District to fund our Clean and Safe Program that is incredibly worthy and valuable in the Vista. We are in the process of having conversations with our property owners. We have opened this up for two public hearings where the State law requires one. We promised transparency throughout this whole process. We are here to answer any questions.

Mr. David Erbacher, President of the Vista Guild Board of Directors / Hyatt Place said we all know where the Vista was and where it is today and the rapid improvement of our district is requiring a lot of clean and safe features. With the way we are growing and trying to bring in revenue, it has been challenging to get funding from Council over the last few years for our Clean and Safe Program. We are looking to continue the improvements of our district and without the funding coming in, we sought a BID.

Ms. Meredith Atkins, Executive Director of the Vista Guild recalled that the Vista Guild tried this several years ago and it did not pass. The Vista was much smaller then. We have grown through a billion dollars in development over the last five years. The last time we tried this property values were \$72 million and now we are at approximately \$300 million. We want to have the conversation again and determine how to fund our Clean and Safe Program.

Mayor Benjamin said I appreciate the leadership the Vista Guild has shown on this issue. We don't have a great deal of history with Business Improvement Districts, except for the City Center Partnership. I was on the first board of the City Center Partnership and when I left the board in 2009, I was the vice chair and the longest seated member. I encourage you to continue to engage the property owners. In order for a BID to proceed and in order for it to get my vote, it needs strong support from property owners. This has to be something that the property owners want and want to invest in. This cannot be something that is imposed upon them. There are a number of other discussions about how you fund the Clean and Safe Program prospectively. We tried to bring you all together with the City Center Partnership, but that didn't work out. As we move forward, I want to make sure that the property owners are fully involved in discussions. Secondly, let's make sure the dialog is continuously colored by the fact that the Vista is successful and we are all benefiting because of it. The Vista is the Vista, because the entire City worked to make it the Vista through tax increment financing and hospitality tax funding to the Vista Guild. That success is now benefiting everyone. We will talk about hospitality tax funding prospectively. I want to make sure we are looking at this holistically. We want to make sure the Vista is clean and safe. The best way to do that is probably through a BID. The only way to get to a BID is to make sure you have strong support from Vista property owners. I want to encourage you to continue to facilitate that conversation.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

Ms. Meredith Atkins, Executive Director of the Vista Guild said the board sent letters to 559 property owners within the proposed area just to let everyone know why we were seeking out the BID and the dates of the two public hearings. We appreciate the City's attorneys leading and everyone else helping us, because there aren't a lot of templates to follow. We have very strict guidelines that we are following. This is step two of many.

Council opened the Public Hearing at 6:52 p.m.

Mr. Jim Papadea said I hadn't seen the letter. I had to call to get information about where to be and when to be here and that bothered me. The Vista has done extraordinarily well and I think Council needs to balance it out. I am a member of the Guild. You have to give them enough money to sustain themselves without putting it on the backs of some of us. I was around when we did the downtown BID. It really starts with letting people know what's going on. I suggest that the City set aside some portion of taxes that they can count on. Maybe the increased security should fall on the bars and restaurants. In terms of cleaning, the Vista looks good to me. We are opposed to this right now until we get more information.

Mr. Whitney Black, Owner of Whit-Ash Furniture said in working with the property owners I received an email Thursday afternoon. No one spoke to me about this. I own Whit-Ash Furniture and I started it in the Vista in 1973. You are getting enough hospitality taxes to do whatever you want to do. We have a bunch of hotels and restaurants. I am paying as much tax as I can stand while trying to keep up with all of the regulations of the world. In general, our police department is doing an excellent job. If you have a problem outside your business you may need to hire someone to clean it up. There were 63 property owners and I don't know how many were spoken to. Who's in charge of spending what? This is a blind side move on the Vista Guild's part and I don't appreciate it. The letter I received did not include the location or time of the meeting.

Mr. Brett Hrovat says he owns a couple of buildings in the Vista. I agree with Mayor Benjamin about getting the property owners to agree. I got the letter three days before and there's no information in the letter where you can make an intelligent business decision. At least lay out everything. He acknowledged that Meredith called him on yesterday and provided him with some information. As business owners, you should come to us first. The Clean and Safe Program has done a great job, but who is going to fund that. Is it coming out of hospitality tax funding? If the business owners fund it, we will never get that back.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

Mr. Hal Stevenson, Vista Guild Treasurer / Executive Committee Member and property owner apologized for not getting information to Mr. Black. The Clean and Safe Program has been good and the property owners we talked to so far all agree that it is very important to keep the Clean and Safe Program. Our challenge is figuring out the funding formula. You've heard that we want to look at the hospitality tax fund. There doesn't need to be a vote anytime soon. We have a lot of time to talk about this among ourselves and get that support of the property owners as we have these conversations with ourselves and with Council.

Mr. Bill Dukes said we had a very nice conversation this morning with Mr. McDowell and several property owners. I sent you a copy of the letter, which was the result of the conversation we had with property owners last week. There has been a lot of conversation, but not a lot of involvement of the property owners. I'm not here to say absolutely no to a BID, but I don't think it's appropriate at this time. It starts with the proper utilization of the hospitality tax, which I refer to as a prepared foods tax that I supported at its inception. It is my feeling that the most important thing that the City can fund for districts like the Vista, North Main, and Five Points is a program that ensures our guests and visitors have a feeling of safety and a clean environment. I've had conversations with Ms. Wilson and I understand that the City takes that responsibility upon itself. You want a clean and safe city. The letter states that we would love to be part of a conversation for finding a solution. I don't believe that the BID approach is the solution at this point.

Mr. Guy Jones said my family and I have been fortunate to be property owners in the Vista since 1966. We have come a long way in the Vista and the quality of the environment continues to improve. The Clean and Safe Program has been a tremendous help. I see them out there working every day. We need to find a stable and predictable method to fund our Clean and Safe Program in the Vista. The BID is going to prove itself as the best method to do that. There is a good conversation going on now to make sure we are on board with that. We need to begin a multi-step process toward implementing the BID.

Council closed the Public Hearing at 7:14 p.m.

Councilor Davis agreed that a BID must have buy-in from the folks directly impacted by it and in this case it's the property owners. If they don't have information they will not be supportive. Also, we need to decide if the BID is the most appropriate mechanism for the Clean and Safe Program versus everything under the umbrella of a traditional BID. I would encourage you to continue to talk and make that decision. There may be another avenue for that one project.



We Are Columbia

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

Councilor McDowell said there has not been a meeting of the minds. Some received letters and some didn't. It would seem to me that there needs to be intentional conversations with property owners. It has to be a collaborative effort with the property owners taking on their fair share and the Vista Guild taking on their fair share. I would certainly advocate for dialog. To rush into something causes havoc and we don't want that to happen. Let's talk about what we need to do.

Councilor Devine said this is a good start. It does seem like there might have been some disconnect. I heard Meredith say that this is the beginning and the Vista Guild is dedicated to making sure that everybody is part of the process. The end result may not be the original proposal. It is important to know who's going to manage the money and what the money is going towards. The BID can go towards other things and everybody would agree that the Main Street BID has been successful and it has grown. The City Center Partnership is funding and investing in things. It has been a boom for Main Street. It's not just about the hospitality tax. We still give money to the City Center Partnership to help support the Clean and Safe Team. The Vista has been very successful. As we continue to look forward at how the Vista can grow, this is one option. With the support of the City, we can figure out where the Vista needs to go. I think we would continue to invest in the Clean and Safe and Program. I hope we continue this discussion and pull our minds together to think about what would be best for the area.

Councilor Rickenmann said I am a little disappointed that some of the property owners haven't been contacted. The BID may not be the answer. There is a timeline that we need to consider. We shouldn't pressure people into making a decision without having time to think about the short-term and long-term effects. The City has made significant investments in the Vista. We are here today because we want to support the dialog. I have reservations, because this is the third time this has come before us and it hasn't gone forward. I encourage you to have open dialog and to find a solution that includes not only yourselves, but us in that discussion. The BID may not be the only avenue. The University needs to be at the table and so should Bill Ellen and the Convention Center. He asked staff how we should move forward.

Councilor Duvall said this is a long process and the process started on November 21, 2017 by this Council when we passed a notice of intent. The timing of the process is set in State law. It required us to have a public hearing within forty days of passing the resolution of intent. After tonight, we have 120-days before the next action is required by State law. That gives us plenty of time to discuss the pros and cons. We added an additional public hearing on Tuesday, January 16, 2018. We want everybody to be confident in the process. I think the BID is the way for the Vista to get their permanent source of funding rather than having to come to Council every year to continue a program that is vital to the success of the Vista. By one vote of Council we can stop it.



COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

Mayor Benjamin said statutorily this is the only required public hearing. I'd love to have a public hearing after there has been more dialogue between the interested parties.

Ms. Meredith Atkinson, Executive Director of the Vista Guild said we shared the two dates, because we realized when we sent the letters on December 11, 2017, that did not give folks a lot of notice to get here tonight. We sent the letter to everyone who owns property in the Vista. The letters went to wherever they get their tax bill. I think a lot of people were worried that a vote was happening tonight. We are just having a conversation.

Mayor Benjamin said between now and the holidays I want to make sure there is opportunity for real dialog and consensus building.

Councilor Devine asked the Vista Guild to send an email to the property owners with the location and time of the hearing.

Mayor Benjamin inquired about the budget request for the Clean and Safe Program.

Ms. Meredith Atkins, Executive Director of the Vista Guild said a fully funded Clean and Safe Program is \$175,000. Each property owner should multiply their fair market property value times .000594 to determine the amount they would potentially pay for the proposed BID. That would bring in \$220,000 based on last year's numbers.

Mayor Benjamin asked how that would apply to Bailey Bill properties.

Ms. Meredith Atkins, Executive Director of the Vista Guild said Bailey Bill properties pay their Bailey Bill value. We took all of that into consideration.

Mayor Benjamin asked if this would be a BID only for the Clean and Safe Program.

Ms. Meredith Atkins, Executive Director of the Vista Guild said we are trying not to impose too much, because we've heard from our property owners and we recognize that they pay enough taxes.

Mayor Benjamin noted that City property taxes have been the same for ten years. We have not raised taxes. We cut them then we added the two mils back for public safety. Those are not your City taxes going up. He clarified that a number of properties throughout the City and not just the Vista benefit significantly from the Bailey Bill as well.



We Are Columbia

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, DECEMBER 19, 2017

Ms. Meredith Atkins, Executive Director of the Vista Guild explained that they didn't request a higher multiplier, because we do receive significant hospitality tax funds. We need an extra pot of money to continue with the Clean and Safe Program.

Mayor Benjamin said let's continue to encourage significant dialog. When I served on the City Center Partnership I owned property, too. I was an owner's representative as well. In order for this to be successful prospectively, we will need to spend more time building consensus. We have to see a lot more work on the relationship building side. Get the information out and consider another time to continue the public discussion.

Ms. Meredith Atkins, Executive Director of the Vista Guild said tonight was an attempt to that. We weren't trying to blindside anyone. Many property owners we've had conversation with and we feel good that the conversation is headed in the right direction.

Mr. Bill Dukes suggested that a discussion with the owners be had on January 16, 2018 prior to the evening meeting.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS DISCUSSED DURING THE WORK SESSION

No matters were discussed at this time.

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS / REFERRALS

No reports or referrals were made at this time.

APPEARANCE OF THE PUBLIC

No one appeared at this time.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting at 7:34 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by:

Erika D. Moore, CMC
City Clerk